

Friday 21 June 2013 – Afternoon

LEVEL 2 AWARD THINKING AND REASONING SKILLS

B902/01 Unit 2 Thinking and Reasoning Skills Case Study

Candidates answer on the Question Paper.

OCR supplied materials:

- Resource Booklet (B902/01/RB)

Other materials required:

None

Duration: 1 hour



Candidate forename		Candidate surname	
-----------------------	--	----------------------	--

Centre number						Candidate number				
---------------	--	--	--	--	--	------------------	--	--	--	--

INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name, centre number and candidate number in the boxes above. Please write clearly and in capital letters.
- Use black ink. HB pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
- Answer **all** the questions.
- Read each question carefully. Make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Write your answer to each question in the space provided. If additional space is required, you should use the lined pages at the end of this booklet. The question number(s) must be clearly shown.
- Do **not** write in the bar codes.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **60**.
- Quality of Written Communication will be assessed in questions 14 and 15.
- This document consists of **16** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

SECTION A – Thinking through the documents.

You are advised to spend no more than 40 minutes on this Section. It is worth 40 marks.

Answer ALL the questions in this Section.

In this section you will be required to use all your reasoning, evaluation, information processing and creative thinking skills on the documentary sources.

When it is necessary to refer to one specific source in order to answer the question, you will be directed to that source.

1 In Document 5b, David Willis provides the following argument:

When a spirit leaves its body it is more interested in the body it left behind than some ornament on top of a filing cabinet! The only thing this would prove, therefore, is that the patient's attention was on something else. So, we should ignore the ridiculous statement that "if no one sees the images, it shows these experiences are illusions or false memories".

Mark up David's argument in the box above to show the different argument components:

- (a) Put brackets around the reason. [1]
- (b) Circle **two** conclusion indicator words. [2]
- (c) Underline the intermediate conclusion. [1]

2 In Document 5b Harry Jones presents the following response to the scientific research proposals:

What a complete waste of time. What is wrong with these people? People who think they've seen a tunnel of light need their heads examining, if you ask me. Doctors are idiots.

Which **one** of the following best describes his response? Tick the correct response.

Argument	<input type="checkbox"/>
Explanation	<input type="checkbox"/>
List of information	<input type="checkbox"/>
Rant	<input type="checkbox"/>

[1]

3 In Document 5b, Joanne Gregory provides the following argument:

This is a complete waste of time, money and resources that could be used for something really useful, like finding a cure for cancer. These researchers just want to see people get sick and never find a cure. So, we should not support the funding of this research.

(a) Underline Joanne’s conclusion. [1]

(b) Joanne’s reasoning is an example of a common flaw.

(i) Which **one** of the following correctly names the flaw? Tick the correct response.

Ad hominem	
Slippery slope	
Straw man	
Tu quoque	

[1]

(ii) Explain your choice.

.....
..... [1]

4 In Document 6, Dr Blanke makes the following claims:

“This could be an explanation for out-of-body experiences,” he added. “I think this shows that there is a scientific reason for them, rather than something paranormal. But they are complex phenomena which have been little studied, so we need more research based on this finding.”

Using **one** credibility criterion, assess the credibility of Dr Blanke’s claims.

.....
.....
..... [2]

5 In Document 7, Georgina asks Francesca the following question:

Are you really the kind of idiot that can't see that NDEs are caused by brain activity?

Explain why this is an example of loaded language.

.....
.....
..... [2]

6 In Document 7, Adil provides the following argument:

So many of the people who have NDEs go on to change their lives for the better, so there must be some truth in what they claim to have seen.

Identify **two** assumptions that Adil is making in his argument.

(a) Assumption 1:

..... [1]

(b) Assumption 2:

..... [1]

7 In Document 5a, Dr Parnia's experiment proposes placing images on shelves which are only visible from the ceiling in order to test whether or not heart attack patients genuinely have out-of-body experiences when the body is technically dead.

Trent Smith (Document 5b) claims:

If the results of this experiment reveal that none of the patients reports seeing the images on the shelves, this will prove that NDEs are hallucinations.

Give **two** points that would challenge Trent Smith's claim.

(a) Point 1:

..... [1]

(b) Point 2:

..... [1]

8 In Document 5b, Yvonne Staples provides the following argument:

I don't think it is morally right to conduct scientific research on heart attack patients, because when a person has a brush with death, any experiences they might have are very traumatic and private. So, doctors should respect their need for care and privacy by not subjecting them to unnecessary tests and questions.

(a) Which of the following best describes the structure of her argument? Tick the correct response.

A	Two reasons and a conclusion	
B	One reason, an intermediate conclusion and a conclusion	
C	Three reasons and a conclusion	

[1]

(b) Circle **one** indicator word which signals a reason.

[1]

(c) A claim that could be used to challenge Yvonne's reasoning is given below. Give **two** developed reasons that could be used to support this claim.

Scientific research into near-death experiences is important.

(i) Reason 1

.....

..... [2]

(ii) Reason 2

.....

..... [2]

9 In Document 7, Adil refers to Pam Reynolds' accurate description of a surgical bone saw. The fact that her description was so accurate whilst apparently dead is used as evidence to argue that 'this proves there is more to a person than just a body'.

Suggest **two** alternative explanations for why Pam was able to provide such an accurate description of the surgical bone saw.

(a) Alternative Explanation 1:

.....
..... [1]

(b) Alternative Explanation 2:

.....
..... [1]

10 In Document 7, Francesca argues:

I read about a poll carried out by an American TV station which invited heart attack victims to phone in and talk about their experiences. 20% of the callers claimed to have had NDEs. Clearly, there's more to out-of-body experiences than chemicals in the brain.

Identify **three** weaknesses in the evidence supporting Francesca's conclusion.

(a) Weakness 1:

.....
..... [1]

(b) Weakness 2:

.....
..... [1]

(c) Weakness 3:

.....
..... [1]

BLANK PAGE

PLEASE DO NOT WRITE ON THIS PAGE

Question 11 is based on the information in Table 1.

In Document 2 and Document 3a and b we are given information about six people who claim to have had a NDE. Students from the Religious Studies class in Document 7 analyse these data and produce a table of data.

11 Using the information in Table 1, you can see that there are some patterns associating different people and their accounts together. For example:

No male experienced a feeling of peace.

Identify **three** other patterns in the data:

- (a) [1]
- (b) [1]
- (c) [1]

A student from the Religious Studies class suggests that only Tom, Jeanette and Pam's experience can actually be classed as a NDE because they are the only ones to have reported having an out-of-body experience.

- (d) Does this student think that an out-of-body experience is a **necessary** or a **sufficient** condition of a NDE? Explain your choice.
 - (i) Necessary Sufficient (Circle one) [1]
 - (ii) Explanation [1]
- (e) Another student claims that a religious/heavenly element is a necessary condition of a NDE. Which of the following people does this student think had a NDE?
 - Paul Tom (Circle one) [1]
- (f) Referring to Document 2, identify a feature **not** given in Table 1 that the reports of Paul Eicke and Jeanette Atkinson have in common.
 - [1]

Table 1

Features of the NDE								
Name	Gender	Feeling of peace	Seeing a tunnel	Seeing a bright light	Seeing deceased relative/s	Out-of-body experience	Religious / heavenly element	Change in life and/or physical condition afterwards
Paul Eicke	Male	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No
Tom Rayner	Male	No	No	No	No	Yes	No	Yes
Mike Richards	Male	No	No	No	Yes	No	No	Yes
Christine Barratt	Female	Yes	No	No	No	No	No	Yes
Jeanette Atkinson	Female	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	No	No
Pam Reynolds	Female	No	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	No

12 Using the views expressed by Adil, Francesca and Georgina in Document 7, identify and explain which of the three students would be most likely to agree with each comment below. Choose a different comment for each person.

Comment	
A	One day there will be a scientific explanation for currently unexplained NDEs.
B	If people believe they've had a paranormal experience then they probably have.
C	Science is not open to the possibility of anything paranormal.

(a) Adil is most likely to have agreed with comment

because

.....

..... [2]

(b) Francesca is most likely to have agreed with comment

because

.....

..... [2]

(c) Georgina is most likely to have agreed with comment

because

.....

..... [2]

SECTION B – Thinking to a conclusion based on reasons and evidence

Allow approximately 20 minutes for this Section. It is worth 20 marks.

Answer ALL the questions in this Section.

In this section you will be required to use all your reasoning, evaluation, information processing and creative thinking skills to come to a reasoned decision or conclusion.

You may use any of the documents for evidence and information to support your argument.

13 In Document 5b, George Brown provides the following argument:

It could be argued that we will only know the truth by doing research. However, if science succeeds in proving NDEs are just an illusion, then this will have a negative effect on people who have had one. People have a right to believe whatever they like – sometimes it is better not to know the truth.

If science were to succeed in proving NDEs are an illusion, George Brown suggests this will have a ‘negative effect on people who have had one’.

(a) Suggest **two** possible ‘negative effects’ that people could experience:

(i)
..... [1]

(ii)
..... [1]

(b) Suggest **one** developed reason to support the claim that scientific explanations for NDEs will have a positive effect on the people who have experienced a NDE.

.....
.....
..... [2]

ADDITIONAL ANSWER SPACE

If additional space is required, you should use the following lined page(s). The question number(s) must be clearly shown in the margins.

A large area of lined paper for writing. It consists of a vertical solid line on the left side and horizontal dotted lines extending across the page. The lines are spaced evenly, providing a guide for writing.

ADDITIONAL ANSWER SPACE

A large rectangular area for writing, bounded by a solid vertical line on the left and horizontal dotted lines on the top, bottom, and right. The dotted lines are spaced evenly down the page, providing a guide for handwriting.

PLEASE DO NOT WRITE ON THIS PAGE



Copyright Information

OCR is committed to seeking permission to reproduce all third-party content that it uses in its assessment materials. OCR has attempted to identify and contact all copyright holders whose work is used in this paper. To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced in the OCR Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations and is freely available to download from our public website (www.ocr.org.uk) after the live examination series.

If OCR has unwittingly failed to correctly acknowledge or clear any third-party content in this assessment material, OCR will be happy to correct its mistake at the earliest possible opportunity.

For queries or further information please contact the Copyright Team, First Floor, 9 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1GE.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group; Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.