

Level 2 Award

B901

Thinking and Reasoning Skills

Unit 1: Thinking and Reasoning Skills

Specimen Paper

Time: 1 hour

Candidates answer on the question paper.

Additional materials:

Candidate
Forename

Candidate
Surname

Centre
Number

--	--	--	--	--

Candidate
Number

--	--	--	--

INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name in capital letters, your Centre Number and Candidate Number in the boxes above.
- Use black ink. Pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
- Read each question carefully and make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Answer **all** the questions.
- Do not write in the bar codes.
- Do not write outside the box bordering each page.
- Write your answer to each question in the space provided.
- You will be assessed on the quality of your written communication in questions 9d and 10. The quality of your grammar, spelling and punctuation will affect the mark for these questions.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks for each question is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is 60.

FOR EXAMINER'S USE	
A	
B	
TOTAL	

This document consists of **15** printed pages and **1** blank page.

Section A

1. My neighbour has mice in her house. I tell her that she should put down mouse traps baited with cheese to kill them.

Suggest **three** assumptions which I must be making when I tell her this.

Assumption 1

.....

.....

Assumption 2

.....

.....

.....

Assumption 3

.....

.....

.....

..... [3]

2. Which of the following are facts and which are opinions? Circle the right answer:

(a) The weather forecast says that there's an 80% chance of it raining today.

Fact / Opinion [1]

(b) London is a good place to visit.

Fact / Opinion [1]

(c) The weather in Britain is awful.

Fact / Opinion [1]

(d) Clouds are necessary in order for it to rain.

Fact / Opinion

[1]

3. Anita, Ben, Carol and David all have a different taste in music: one listens to classical music, one listens to pop music, one listens to folk music and one listens to rock music, but not necessarily in that order.

Use the information provided below to complete the matrix and identify which student listens to which music.

1. The classical music fan has been asked by Anita to go with her to a birthday party for Carol.
2. Carol and Ben went on a camping holiday with the pop music fan.
3. Both David and the fan of classical music are in the same class as the student who listens to folk music.
4. Carol and Ben are not in the same class.

Complete the matrix by putting ticks in the box to match the music with the right student.

	Pop Music	Classical Music	Folk Music	Rock Music
Anita				
Ben				
Carol				
David				

[4]

4. Two young climbers, Andrew and Bella, intend to climb Everest.

- It is 15 miles from the base camp to the summit of Everest.
- They each need one canister of oxygen for every mile they walk.
- They can each carry up to 10 canisters of oxygen.

Their plan is for Andrew to go only part of the way up Everest and to hand over to Bella some spare canisters of oxygen while keeping enough for himself to enable him to walk safely back to base camp alone. They think this will enable Bella to carry on to the summit alone. Bella will not need to walk back to camp as she will be collected from the summit by helicopter.

However, they are not sure at what point Andrew should turn back and hand over some of his canisters of oxygen to Bella so that Bella can get as close to the summit as possible while allowing Andrew to return safely.

They ask their friends for advice.

(a) A first friend recommends both Andrew and Bella walk **4 miles** together towards the summit of Everest. Andrew then keeps enough oxygen to get back to base camp and hands what is left over to Bella.

How many miles short of the summit will Bella be when she runs out of oxygen if they follow this advice?

Circle the right answer:

1 mile 2 miles 3 miles 4 miles

[1]

(b)i) A second friend recommends both Andrew and Bella walk **1 mile** together towards the summit. Andrew then keeps enough oxygen to get back to base camp and hands what is left over to Bella.

How many miles short of the summit will Bella be when she runs out of oxygen if they follow this advice?

Circle the right answer:

1 mile 2 miles 3 miles 4 miles

[1]

ii) Explain the problem with this advice.

.....
.....

[1]

(c) One friend recommends both Andrew and Bella walk **5 miles** from base camp together and that Andrew then hands over 5 canisters of oxygen to Bella enabling Bella to climb for another 10 miles to the summit of Everest.

Explain one problem with this advice.

.....
.....

[1]

(d) What is the closest that Bella can get to the summit while allowing Andrew to walk back to base safely?

Circle the right answer:

- 1 mile 2 miles 3 miles 4 miles

[1]

5. 4 digit personal identification numbers (PINs) are used for withdrawing cash from cash machines.

It is often difficult to remember these numbers.

One very simple strategy is to use the date of your birth to generate your PIN. This can be done by using the day to give the first two numbers and the month to give the last two numbers. So someone born on the nineteenth of October would take their PIN 1910. If the date is a single number then it can be made into two digits by placing a 0 before the first number. So someone born on the fifth of June would take their PIN 0506.

However this strategy is too simple and can easily be guessed by thieves. So one strategy for making the PIN more difficult to guess, but still memorable, is to reverse the two digits. So someone born on the nineteenth of October would take as their PIN 9101 and someone born on the fifth of June would take as their PIN 5060.

(a) If my birthday is the last day in December which of the following is my PIN assuming I use the second more advanced strategy explained above:

Circle the right answer.

1231

1312

1321

3121

3112

[1]

(b) If you know that I am using the second more advanced strategy to generate my PIN but you do not know the date of my birthday which of the following could not be my PIN:

Circle the right answer.

1290

3080

5011

6460

8090

[1]

6. A teacher collects the following information about eight students in her class. This is presented in Table 1:

Table 1

	Personal details				
Name	Gender	Gained Grade A* in Maths GCSE in Yr10	Studied Thinking and Reasoning Skills in Year 11	Parent went to university	Likes designer clothes
Alan	Male	Yes	No	No	Yes
Brenda	Female	No	Yes	Yes	No
Charlotte	Female	No	Yes	No	No
Daniel	Male	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Elizabeth	Female	No	Yes	Yes	No
Fiona	Female	No	Yes	No	No
Gordon	Male	Yes	No	Yes	Yes
Harry	Male	Yes	No	No	Yes

(a) Using the information in Table 1, you can see that there are some patterns associating different personal details together.

Identify any three patterns in the data:

First Pattern

..... [1]

Second Pattern

..... [1]

Third Pattern

..... [1]

(b) The same patterns are true of **all** students in the teacher's class.

The teacher has added 2 more students in the class to the table as shown below.

However the teacher has not finished the table and has not identified the gender of the students nor said whether they like designer clothes.

Using what you already know about patterns in the class and the information which the teacher has provided, correctly complete the table by:

- Circling either male or female in the column marked "Gender" for each student

[2]

- Circling either yes or no in the column marked "Likes designer clothes" for each student

[2]

Table 2

Name	Gender	Gained Grade A* in Maths GCSE in Yr10	Studied Thinking and Reasoning Skills in Year 11	Parent went to university	Likes designer clothes
Student I	Male / female	Yes	No	No	Yes / No
Student J	Male / female	No	Yes	No	Yes / No

7. Write in the box which day might come next in sequence and explain your reasoning.

Friday , Monday , Saturday,

Reason:.....
.....
.....
..... [3]

8. At the end of a football match between Hull City and Aston Villa one Saturday, players from Hull City had scored two goals and players from Aston Villa had scored four goals. But Aston Villa did not beat Hull City.

Give **two** explanations for how this could this be.

1.....
.....
2.....
..... [2]

Section A Total [30]

Section B

Answer **both** questions

9. Here is a transcript of a conversation between a mother (M) and her 16-year-old daughter (D). D is just about to leave to go to school on the last day of the Christmas term. It's a "non-uniform" day, when students can choose not to wear school uniform if they give £1 to the school's chosen charity.

D Bye mum!

M You're not going out like that are you?

D What do you mean? It's non-uniform day! It's for charity!

M But it's December, and you're basically wearing underwear. You'll freeze, for a start!

D Mum! This is just normal stuff that girls wear. I won't be any different from any of the others. Anyway – you should see yourself when you go out sometimes!

M I'll overlook that last remark, but as for what the other girls wear I don't care about them – it's you I'm responsible for. Going out looking like that – what will people think of you? Next thing you'll be having piercings, and tattoos, and then what? You'll never get a job.

D Mum, you're being ridiculous.

M Don't talk to me like that: I'm your mother. You'll do what I say.

D Give me one good reason!

M You mean another good reason!

D No – you haven't given me a good reason yet.

M Look, you're only 16. What do you know about what people will think of you?

D Is that what this is about? What people will think? Is that all you care about?

M Well, if everyone thinks you're a, well, just a...

D Go on mum, say it – what am I? What terrible thing am I?

(a) In using “you’ll freeze, for a start” as a reason to support the conclusion that her daughter shouldn’t go out “like that”, identify **two possible** assumptions the mother may be making.

- 1.....
- 2..... [2]

(b) Identify and briefly explain the type of fallacy the mother is committing when:

(i) she talks about piercings and tattoos.

-
- [2]

(ii) she says, “I’m your mother. You’ll do what I say.”

-
- [2]

(iii) she says, “You’re only 16. What do you know?”

-
- [2]

(c) Identify and briefly explain the type of fallacy the daughter is committing:

(i) by referring to what her mother wears.

-
- [2]

(ii) by referring to what other girls wear.

-
- [2]

10. In a film there is an argument about tipping in a diner. After their meal all the people in the group put in their tips except “Mr Pink”. Below is a summary of what is said.

Mr Pink does not tip, he says, because:

1. He doesn't believe in it.
2. If the waitress isn't making enough money she can always quit.
3. He tips when someone deserves a tip, not just because society says he should.
4. She didn't do anything special.
5. She only re-filled his coffee cup three times.
6. She couldn't have been “too busy” to fill it more: the words “too busy” shouldn't be in her vocabulary.
7. Waitresses do receive the minimum wage.
8. We don't tip at the burger place, even though the staff there clean fryers.
9. They may well be taxed on the basis of getting tips, which is wrong, but that's nothing to do with him, or the argument.
10. They could do a better job if they had training – such as learning to type.

This is what the others say in support of their conclusion that he should tip:

1. The wages are low.
2. The girl was nice.
3. She really was too busy to re-fill his cup six times.
4. She's counting on tips to live.
5. She'll be taxed on the tips she's expected to get, even if she doesn't get them.
6. She works really hard.
7. They work harder here than at the burger place.
8. Waitressing is one job an unskilled woman can live on, because of the tips.

Source: “When Critical Thinking met English Literature”

BLANK PAGE

Copyright Acknowledgements:

This adaption from the screenplay of 'Reservoir Dogs' appears in 'When Critical Thinking met English Literature'

Belinda Hakes, How to Books, Oxford.

Permission to reproduce items where third-party owned material protected by copyright is included has been sought and cleared where possible. Every reasonable effort has been made by the publisher (OCR) to trace copyright holders, but if any items requiring clearance have unwittingly been included, the publisher will be pleased to make amends at the earliest opportunity.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group. Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.

© OCR 2008

Level 2

THINKING AND REASONING SKILLS

J930

Unit B901: Thinking and Reasoning Skills

Specimen Mark Scheme

The maximum mark for this paper is 60.

Section A		
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark
1	<p>My neighbour has mice in her house. I tell her that she should put down mouse traps baited with cheese to kill them.</p> <p>Suggest three assumptions which I must be making when I tell her this.</p> <p>Assumptions include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – My neighbour doesn't want to have mice in her house. – My neighbour's mice aren't family pets. – Mice like cheese. – Killing mice is acceptable. – It's not good to have mice in a house. – Killing what we don't like is acceptable. <p>Credit any other reasonable assumption.</p> <p>One mark for an assumption which is clearly stated. 0 marks no creditworthy material</p> <p>1 mark per assumption, total of 3 marks for 3 assumptions.</p>	[3]
2	<p>Which of the following are facts and which are opinions? Circle the right answer:</p> <p>(a) The weather forecast says that there's an 80% chance of it raining today. Fact</p> <p>(b) London is a good place to visit Opinion</p> <p>(c) The weather in Britain is awful. Opinion</p> <p>(d) Clouds are necessary in order for it to rain. Fact</p>	[1] [1] [1] [1]

Section A																											
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark																									
3	<p>Anita, Ben, Carol and David all have a different taste in music: one listens to classical music, one listens to pop music, one listens to folk music and one listens to rock music, but not necessarily in that order.</p> <p>Use the information provided below to complete the matrix and identify which student listens to which music.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The classical music fan has been asked by Anita to go with her to a birthday party for Carol. Carol and Ben went on a camping holiday with the pop music fan. Both David and the fan of classical music are in the same class as the student who listens to folk music. Carol and Ben are not in the same class. <p>Complete the matrix by putting ticks in the box to match the music with the right student.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Pop Music</th> <th>Classical Music</th> <th>Folk Music</th> <th>Rock Music</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Anita</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Ben</td> <td></td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Carol</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>✓</td> </tr> <tr> <td>David</td> <td>✓</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>1 mark for each correct tick up to 4 marks</p>		Pop Music	Classical Music	Folk Music	Rock Music	Anita			✓		Ben		✓			Carol				✓	David	✓				
	Pop Music	Classical Music	Folk Music	Rock Music																							
Anita			✓																								
Ben		✓																									
Carol				✓																							
David	✓																										
		[4]																									

Section A		
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark
4	<p>Two young climbers, Andrew and Bella, intend to climb Everest.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • It is 15 miles from the base camp to the summit of Everest. • They each need one canister of oxygen for every mile they walk. • They can each carry up to 10 canisters of oxygen. <p>Their plan is for Andrew to go only part of the way up Everest and to hand over to Bella some spare canisters of oxygen while keeping enough for himself to enable him to walk safely back to base camp alone. They think this will enable Bella to carry on to the summit alone. Bella will not need to walk back to camp as she will be collected from the summit by a helicopter.</p> <p>However, they are not sure at what point Andrew should turn back and hand over some of his canisters of oxygen to Bella so that Bella can get as close to the summit as possible while allowing Andrew to return safely.</p> <p>They ask their friends for advice.</p> <p>a) A first friend recommends both Andrew and Bella walk 4 miles together towards the summit of Everest. Andrew then keeps enough oxygen to get back to base camp and hands what is left over to Bella.</p> <p>How many miles short of the summit will Bella be when she runs out of oxygen if they follow this advice?</p> <p>Circle the right answer.</p> <p>1 mile 2 miles 3 miles 4 miles</p> <p>b) A second friend recommends both Andrew and Bella walk 1 mile together towards the summit. Andrew then keeps enough oxygen to get back to base camp and hands what is left over to Bella.</p> <p>i) How many miles short of the summit will Bella be when she runs out of oxygen if they follow this advice?</p> <p>Circle the right answer.</p> <p>1 mile 2 miles 3 miles 4 miles</p> <p>ii) Explain the problem with this advice.</p> <p>c) One friend recommends both Andrew and Bella walk 5 miles from base camp together and that Andrew then hands over 5 canisters of oxygen to Bella enabling Bella to climb for another 10 miles to the summit of Everest.</p> <p>Explain one problem with this advice.</p> <p>d) What is the closest that Bella can get to the summit while allowing Andrew to walk back to base safely?</p> <p>Circle the right answer.</p> <p>1 mile 2 miles 3 miles 4 miles</p> <p>a) 1 mark for circling 3 miles b) i) 1 mark for circling 4 miles b) ii) 1 mark for explaining that Bella will not be able to carry more than one of the canisters given to her by Andrew c) 1 mark for explaining that Andrew has not left himself any oxygen with which to get to base camp d) 1 mark for circling 2 miles</p>	[5]

Section A		
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark
5	<p>4 digit personal identification numbers (PINs) are used for withdrawing cash from cash machines.</p> <p>It is often difficult to remember these numbers.</p> <p>One very simple strategy is to use the date of your birth to generate your PIN.</p> <p>This can be done by using the day to give the first two numbers and the month to give the last two numbers. So someone born on the nineteenth of October would take their PIN 1910. If the date is a single number then it can be made into two digits by placing a 0 before the first number. So someone born on the fifth of June would take their PIN 0506.</p> <p>However this strategy is too simple and can easily be guessed by thieves. So one strategy for making the PIN more difficult to guess, but still memorable, is to reverse the two digits. So someone born on the nineteenth of October would take as their PIN 9101 and someone born on the fifth of June would take as their PIN 5060.</p> <p>(a) If my birthday is the last day in December which of the following is my PIN assuming I use the second more advanced strategy explained above:</p> <p>Circle the right answer.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">1231 1312 1321 3121 3112</p> <p>(b) If you know that I am using the second more advanced strategy to generate my PIN but you do not know the date of my birthday which of the following could not be my PIN:</p> <p>Circle the right answer.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">1290 3080 5011 6460 8090</p> <p>a) 1 mark for circling 1321 b) 1 mark for circling 6460</p>	[2]

Section A																																																														
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark																																																												
6	<p>A teacher collects the following information about eight students in her class. This is presented in Table 1:</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th colspan="5">Personal details</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Name</th> <th>Gender</th> <th>Gained Grade A* in Maths GCSE in Yr10</th> <th>Studied Thinking and Reasoning Skills in Year 11</th> <th>Parent went to university</th> <th>Likes designer clothes</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Alan</td> <td>Male</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Brenda</td> <td>Female</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>No</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Charlotte</td> <td>Female</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Daniel</td> <td>Male</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>Yes</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Elizabeth</td> <td>Female</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>No</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Fiona</td> <td>Female</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Gordon</td> <td>Male</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>Yes</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Harry</td> <td>Male</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>(a) Using the information in Table 1, you can see that there are some patterns associating different personal details together.</p> <p>Identify any three patterns in the data.</p> <p>(b) The same patterns are true of all students in the teacher's class.</p> <p>The teacher has added 2 more students in the class to the table as shown below.</p> <p>However the teacher has not finished the table and has not identified the gender of the students nor said whether they like designer clothes or not.</p> <p>Using what you already know about patterns in the class and the information which the teacher has provided, correctly complete the table by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Circling either male or female in the column marked "Gender" for each student • Circling either yes or no in the column marked "Likes designer clothes" for each student 		Personal details					Name	Gender	Gained Grade A* in Maths GCSE in Yr10	Studied Thinking and Reasoning Skills in Year 11	Parent went to university	Likes designer clothes	Alan	Male	Yes	No	No	Yes	Brenda	Female	No	Yes	Yes	No	Charlotte	Female	No	Yes	No	No	Daniel	Male	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Elizabeth	Female	No	Yes	Yes	No	Fiona	Female	No	Yes	No	No	Gordon	Male	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Harry	Male	Yes	No	No	Yes	
	Personal details																																																													
Name	Gender	Gained Grade A* in Maths GCSE in Yr10	Studied Thinking and Reasoning Skills in Year 11	Parent went to university	Likes designer clothes																																																									
Alan	Male	Yes	No	No	Yes																																																									
Brenda	Female	No	Yes	Yes	No																																																									
Charlotte	Female	No	Yes	No	No																																																									
Daniel	Male	Yes	No	Yes	Yes																																																									
Elizabeth	Female	No	Yes	Yes	No																																																									
Fiona	Female	No	Yes	No	No																																																									
Gordon	Male	Yes	No	Yes	Yes																																																									
Harry	Male	Yes	No	No	Yes																																																									

Section A																				
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark																		
	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Name</th> <th>Gender</th> <th>Gained Grade A* in Maths GCSE in Yr10</th> <th>Studied Thinking and Reasoning Skills in Year 11</th> <th>Parent went to university</th> <th>Likes designer clothes</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Student I</td> <td>Male / female</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes / No</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Student J</td> <td>Male / female</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes / No</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>a) Credit 1 mark for any pattern associating personal details in the data up to 3 marks for three distinct claims.</p> <p>Examples</p> <p>No girls like designer clothes/only boys like designer clothes (1 mark)</p> <p>No boys did TRS in Yr11/only girls did TRS at Yr11 (1 mark)</p> <p>Only boys gained Grade A in Maths GCSE in Yr 10//no girls did (1 mark)</p> <p>b) 1 mark for circling Student I is male</p> <p>1 mark for circling Student I does likes designer clothes</p> <p>1 mark for circling Student J is female</p> <p>1 mark for circling Student J does not like designer clothes</p>	Name	Gender	Gained Grade A* in Maths GCSE in Yr10	Studied Thinking and Reasoning Skills in Year 11	Parent went to university	Likes designer clothes	Student I	Male / female	Yes	No	No	Yes / No	Student J	Male / female	No	Yes	No	Yes / No	
Name	Gender	Gained Grade A* in Maths GCSE in Yr10	Studied Thinking and Reasoning Skills in Year 11	Parent went to university	Likes designer clothes															
Student I	Male / female	Yes	No	No	Yes / No															
Student J	Male / female	No	Yes	No	Yes / No															
		[7]																		

Section A		
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark
7	<p>What might come next after Friday, Monday, Saturday? Why?</p> <p>There is more than one possible answer for this question. In order to receive full credit, the chosen day must be consistent with the reason provided.</p> <p>Answer: Sunday - the names are written in alphabetical order and the day of the week next in alphabetical order would be Sunday.</p> <p>Answer: Monday - answer based on sequencing – there are two full days between Friday and Monday, four between Monday and Saturday and so on. This would mean that there should be eight days between Saturday and the following day – i.e. Monday.</p> <p>Answer: Saturday– answer based on sequencing– 3 days need to be added to Friday to get to Monday, 5 days to get to Saturday, 7 days to get to Saturday again.</p> <p>Three marks: a day of the week is named which is fully consistent with the reason provided. The reason is clearly explained.</p> <p>Two marks: a day of the week is named which is fully consistent with the reason provided. The reason lacks clarity/is slightly muddled.</p> <p>One mark: a day of the week is named which is correct as above (Sunday, Monday or Saturday). The reason provided is incoherent, very muddled or absent.</p> <p>Days other than those listed are only creditworthy if a cogent explanation is supplied which fully justifies the choice.</p> <p>Zero marks: no creditworthy material.</p>	[3]
8	<p>At the end of a football match between Hull City and Aston Villa one Saturday, players from Hull City had scored two goals and players from Aston Villa had scored four goals. But Aston Villa did not beat Hull City</p> <p>Give two explanations for how this could be.</p> <p>One possible explanation: the referee disallowed some of the goals scored by the Aston Villa players</p> <p>Another possible explanation: two of Aston Villa's goals were own goals i.e. scored by Aston Villa players but in their own net. This would mean that the result was a draw.</p> <p>Two marks – for both explanations.</p> <p>One mark – for one explanation.</p> <p>Zero marks – no creditworthy material.</p>	[2]
Section A Total		[30]

Section B		
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark
9	<p>Here is a transcript of a conversation between a mother (M) and her 16-year-old daughter (D). D is just about to leave to go to school on the last day of the Christmas term. It's a "non-uniform" day, when students can choose not to wear school uniform if they give £1.00 to the school's chosen charity.</p>	
(a)	<p>In using "you'll freeze, for a start" as a reason to support the conclusion that her daughter shouldn't go out "like that", identify two possible assumptions the mother may be making.</p> <p>She is assuming that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • her daughter won't wear a coat / jacket / jumper to keep warm • the weather isn't about to improve • she isn't getting picked up by car at the door/her journey will involve considerable outdoor travel. 	[2]
(b)	<p>Identify and briefly explain the type of fallacy the mother is committing when:</p>	
(i)	<p>she talks about piercings and tattoos.</p> <p>This is a slippery slope fallacy; the term is used when a claim is made, without any substance, that one action will inevitably lead to others. [1 mark for naming it, 1 mark for explaining it]</p>	[2]
(ii)	<p>she says, "I'm your mother. You'll do what I say."</p> <p>This is an irrelevant appeal to authority. Although the mother does/may have authority over her daughter, she has substituted this for reasoning. [1 mark for naming it, 1 mark for explaining it]</p>	[2]
(iii)	<p>she says, "You're only 16. What do you know?"</p> <p>This is an ad hominem fallacy. The age of the girl may or may not have an effect on her reasoning skills, but the mother is clearly using it to attack her argument. [1 mark for naming it, 1 mark for explaining it]</p>	[2]
(c)	<p>Identify and briefly explain the type of fallacy the daughter is committing:</p>	
(i)	<p>by referring to what her mother wears.</p> <p>This is a tu quoque fallacy. Here the girl is trying to justify her own actions by pointing out that her mother does something similar. Ad hominem (naming and explaining combined) could be awarded one mark, as the daughter is certainly attacking her mother – but that is in the process of committing the tu quoque fallacy. [1 mark for naming it, 1 mark for explaining it]</p>	[2]

Section B		
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark
9(c)(ii)	<p>by referring to what other girls wear.</p> <p>This is an irrelevant appeal to popularity / the democratic fallacy. Perhaps lots of people do this, but that isn't a reason for taking it to be the right thing to do.</p> <p>[1 mark for naming it, 1 mark for explaining it]</p>	[2]
(d)	<p>Write a valid and sound argument either for the mother or for the daughter with no flaws and fallacies. The mother's conclusion is that the daughter shouldn't go out wearing what she's wearing. The daughter's conclusion is that she should. Give at least two reasons to support the conclusion, and add any other argument features which would strengthen the case.</p> <p>A good example of the mother's argument might be:</p> <p>The weather is very cold and so going out dressed in so little could make you vulnerable to illness. Also, even though it's wrong, other people might form a negative opinion of you based on what you look like. I know that lots of your friends dress like that, but maybe you'd like to stand out? Think about some of the celebrities you admire: aren't they known for their individuality? This is, after all, a non-uniform day, so why would you want to look like everyone else?</p> <p>So, you shouldn't go out dressed like that.</p> <p>And of the daughter's:</p> <p>The whole point of a non-uniform day is that I can choose, just for once, what I wear to school. This is the one day in the year when I can do that, and it seems wrong that a dress code imposed on me by school would simply be replaced by a dress code imposed by you, even though I know you've got my well-being at heart. Also, you've brought me up to take responsibility for my actions, and I need to be able to make my own decisions some times. Anyway, I'm going to wear a coat while I'm out, and it's always warm in the building, so there's really no reason why I shouldn't go to school wearing this.</p> <p>Performance descriptors for 7 – 9 marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The conclusion is precisely stated. • At least 2 reasons are provided for the conclusion and are persuasive, cogent and fully developed. • The structure of the reasoning is clear and explicit and places minimal reliance on assumptions. • Other argument features (such as evidence, examples, counterargument), are appropriate and clearly strengthen the reasoning. • Grammar, spelling and punctuation are good. 	

Section B		
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark
	<p>Performance descriptors for 4 – 6 marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The conclusion is clearly stated. • At least 2 reasons are provided for the conclusion, which are plausible and relevant, or 1 reason which is persuasive, cogent and fully developed. • The structure of the reasoning is not fully explicit and does rely on some assumptions. • Other argument features (such as evidence, examples, counterargument), are relevant but are open to challenge. • Grammar, spelling and punctuation are mostly adequate. <p>Performance descriptors for 1 – 3 marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The conclusion is imprecise and unclear. • One or more reasons are underdeveloped and only provide weak support for the conclusion. • Structure is either absent or minimal or unclear. • Other argument features (such as evidence, examples, counterargument), are poorly developed or explained and are open to obvious counter examples and objections. • Grammar, spelling and punctuation may be inadequate. <p>0 marks – no creditworthy material</p>	[9]

Section B		
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark
10	<p>In a film there is an argument about tipping in a diner. After their meal all the people in the group put in their tips except “Mr Pink”. Below is a summary of what is said.</p> <p>Mr Pink doesn’t tip, he says, because:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. He doesn’t believe in it. 2. If the waitress isn’t making enough money she can always quit. 3. He tips when someone deserves a tip, not just because society says he should. 4. She didn’t do anything special. 5. She only re-filled his coffee cup three times. 6. She couldn’t have been “too busy” to fill it more: the words “too busy” shouldn’t be in her vocabulary. 7. Waitresses do make the minimum wage. 8. We don’t tip at the burger place, even though the staff there clean fryers. 9. They may well be taxed on the basis of getting tips, which is wrong, but that’s nothing to do with him, or the argument. 10. They could do a better job if they trained – such as learning to type. <p>This is what the others say in support of their conclusion that he should tip:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The wages are low. 2. The girl was nice. 3. She really was too busy to re-fill his cup six times. 4. She’s counting on tips to live. 5. She’ll be taxed on the tips she’s expected to get, even if she doesn’t get them. 6. She works really hard. 7. They work harder here than at the burger place. 8. Waitressing is one job an unskilled woman can live on, because of the tips. <p>Which side has the stronger argument? Support your decision through analysis and evaluation of both.</p> <p>In order for candidates to answer the question, it is expected that they will demonstrate a range of skills. This includes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The differences between argument, opinion and explanation are clearly understood. • Any unstated reasons (assumptions) are identified. • Common flaws are recognised, such as irrelevance, fallacies and loaded language. • Factors which might influence an arguer are recognised in evaluating credibility and in distinguishing between fact and opinion. 	

Section B		
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Evidence is evaluated in terms of selectivity and significance. The different options are clearly identified. Relevant criteria for making decisions have been used. Answers show that candidates recognise the relevance of ethical values. There may be an awareness of the possible consequences of actions, through suppositional reasoning. <p>Possible points could include: the waitress should be tipped because none of Mr Pink's assertions are justified. For example, point two shows a scant regard for the situation in which the waitress might find herself. She did re-fill his cup three times; the minimum wage is hardly enough to support a reasonable lifestyle. To train for another profession would probably mean leaving this one (therefore losing income) and paying for further training. How can this be accomplished?</p> <p>Mr Pink "Doesn't believe in it (tipping)". But why? That said, Mr Pink's argument appears to have more reasons, but some of them are questionable. To say that they would do better if they had training makes the assumption that they have not already had training and yet still been unable to secure a better paid job. However, "the girl was nice" seems to be an irrelevant appeal to sympathy which shouldn't necessarily affect a rational decision. But then, if tipping is in acknowledgement of behaviour which is more pleasing than the norm, is this irrelevant?</p> <p>This question gives candidates the opportunity to think about a significant cultural issue and invites them to apply reasoning skills, argument analysis and ethical values to what might at first seem a relatively trivial issue. In terms of ethics, what is the responsibility of the well-paid to the poorly paid?</p> <p>Performance descriptors for 7 – 9 marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is clear evidence that the two cases have been fully understood and evaluated appropriately according to consistency, soundness of reasoning, relevance of points, consideration of evidence and examples and the identification of any flaws or fallacies. Candidates demonstrate a wide range of skills (as indicated above). Grammar, spelling and punctuation are good. <p>Performance descriptors for 4 – 6 marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The majority of the components of the two cases have been understood and evaluated mostly appropriately according to consistency, soundness of reasoning, relevance of points, consideration of evidence and examples and the identification of any flaws or fallacies. Candidates demonstrate an adequate range of skills (as indicated above). Grammar, spelling and punctuation are adequate. 	

Section B		
Question Number	Answer	Max Mark
	<p>Performance descriptors for 1 – 3 marks:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There is some evidence that components of the two cases have been understood and evaluated. • Candidates demonstrate only a limited range of skills. • Grammar, spelling and punctuation may be inadequate. <p>0 marks – no creditworthy material</p>	[9]
Section B Total		[30]
Paper Total		[60]

Assessment Objectives Grid (includes QWC)

Question	AO1	AO2	AO3	Total
1	3			3
2 (a)	1			1
2 (b)	1			1
2 (c)	1			1
2 (d)	1			1
3		4		4
4 (a)		1		1
4 (b)(i)		1		1
4 (b)(ii)		1		1
4 (c)		1		1
4 (d)		1		1
5 (a)		1		1
5 (b)		1		1
6 (a)		3		3
6 (b)		4		4
7		3		3
8		2		2
9 (a)	2			2
9 (b)(i)	2			2
9 (b)(ii)	2			2
9 (b)(iii)	2			2
9 (c)(i)	2			2
9 (c)(ii)	2			2
9 (d)			9	9
10			9	9
Totals	19	23	18	60