

26 November 2012 – 8 December 2012

A2 GCE HISTORY B

F986/01 Historical Controversies – Non-British History

Candidates answer on the Answer Booklet.

OCR supplied materials:

- 16 page Answer Booklet
(sent with general stationery)

Other materials required:

None

Duration: 3 hours



INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name, centre number and candidate number in the spaces provided on the Answer Booklet. Please write clearly and in capital letters.
- Use black ink.
- Answer **both sub-questions** from **one** Study Topic.
- Read each question carefully. Make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Do **not** write in the bar codes.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **60**.
- This paper contains questions on the following 4 Study Topics:
 - Different Approaches to the Crusades, 1095–1272 (page 2)
 - Different Interpretations of Witch-hunting in Early Modern Europe c.1560–c.1660 (page 3)
 - Different American Wests 1840–1900 (page 4)
 - Debates about the Holocaust (page 5)
- You should write in continuous prose and are reminded of the need for clear and accurate writing, including structure and argument, grammar, punctuation and spelling.
- The time permitted allows for reading the Extract in the one Option you have studied.
- In answering these questions, you are expected to use your knowledge of the topic to help you understand and interpret the Extract as well as to inform your answers.
- **You may refer to your class notes and textbooks during the examination.**
- This document consists of **8** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

1 Different approaches to the Crusades 1095–1272

Read the following extract about the Crusades and then answer the questions that follow.

A crusade song composed in the late twelfth century commented bleakly on life's brevity that 'we have no tomorrow; nothing is more certain.' After death no sinner could escape the just punishment of God. In the case of the unrepentant this meant an eternity in Hell. For most believers the afterlife would entail suffering worse than anything that could be imagined in this world. It would be 'a cruel and endless death, each day worse than the one before'. Those dead who had repented of their sins could be released from their torment by the prayers and acts of charity of the living. But it was clearly preferable to endure the punishment due for one's sins while still alive through the operation of penance, one of Christ's seven sacraments.

A powerful factor lying behind crusading's initial success was disarray in the Church's teaching about penance in the eleventh century. The truly repentant sinner who'd confessed was given penance to perform, but nobody was prepared to declare authoritatively that a penance imposed by a cleric was equivalent to the punishment that a just God would reckon to be appropriate. Hence the massive popularity of pilgrimage in this period. Pilgrimage was a penitential exercise that displayed sorrow for sins before God and to society at large. The vow to set out on crusade was an offshoot of the pilgrim's vow, and the best way to define crusade is as an 'armed pilgrimage' or 'penitential war'. Albert of Aachen described the first crusaders as 'pilgrim soldiers'. John of Joinville, the great chronicler of Louis IX's first crusade, called crusading 'the pilgrimage of the cross'.

In a sense all Christians were 'crusaders'. But although baptism saved Christians from original sin, it couldn't save them from the consequences of their own sinfulness. Only another crusade could do that. It did it by forging an individual 'imitation of Christ' that simultaneously complemented and personalized the gift of forgiveness to all believers that was symbolized by baptism. So the crusader's pilgrimage outclassed all other pilgrimages, because Christ outclassed the saints. He was 'the saint of saints'. People who took the cross were 'reborn of a new baptism of repentance'.

Every crusade was accompanied by specific instructions relating to how it was to be preached. Men like James of Vitry and Gilbert of Tournai composed 'model sermons'. The authors of these model sermons knew that they had to maximize the appeal of their messages, and a key way to do this was by making full use of metaphors. For St Bernard the crusade was best viewed as a 'jubilee', a period of time when God allowed sinners unusually easy access to forgiveness. 'I call blessed the generation that can seize an opportunity of such rich indulgence as this, blessed to be alive in this year of jubilee, this year of God's choice.'

It helped powerfully that crusading was preached in terms of the Holy Land's significance and plight, as well as the individual listener's search for salvation. Devotion towards Jerusalem set up a whole range of emotional resonances and in the hands of skilled preachers these could be cleverly interwoven with their audience's personal anxieties. St Bernard set out an argument for the Second Crusade. 'That blessed land, that land of promise' was threatened by the Muslims, and if they were not driven back they would take Jerusalem itself, 'and defile the holy places which have been adorned by the blood of Jesus'. Of course God could save his land with a single word, but instead he was providing a chance for his people to prove their allegiance to him.

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their study of the Crusades some historians have taken a pluralist approach. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of the Crusades. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

2 Different Interpretations of Witch-hunting in Early Modern Europe c.1560–c.1660

Read the following extract about witch-hunting and then answer the questions that follow.

I prioritise trial records in this book. I say relatively little about demonology as I am of the opinion that the persecution of witches and discourses about witchcraft have distinct, if overlapping, histories. Feminist and literary scholars in particular sometimes too readily assume simple causal relationships between what was written by demonologists and how witches were treated by judicial elites.

The caution with which the councillors of Rothenburg and their legal advisers treated witches at law was not – as has been suggested – the result of ‘a progressive striving for justice’, but stemmed from a conviction on their part that witchcraft was so problematic a crime to prove that the ultimate punishment of suspected witches was best left to the all-seeing wisdom of God. This idea was partly rooted in a judicial appreciation of the difficulty of reaching definitive conclusions about guilt or innocence in the case of the secret crime of witchcraft. However, it also had important roots in elite religious belief. Successive generations of Rothenburg councillors reached decisions in witch-trials on the basis of a sense of humility which encouraged them to think that some problems were so testing that they were best left to God to solve. As the seventeenth century progressed they became less sure about how best to serve God through their handling of the trials.

One of the priorities was the councillors’ belief that Rothenburg’s right to freedom from external interference in the exercise of its judicial power was best maintained by quashing rather than fostering witch-trials. This idea was articulated most clearly during the trial of Hans Georg Hofmann in 1605, when the council was warned of the risk that Hofmann would complain to the Emperor if he were tortured without sufficient legal justification. The council took the warning to heart in their handling of the trial.

Of even greater influence on its cautious handling of witchcraft allegations was the council’s concern with maintaining social stability in Rothenburg and its hinterland villages. From the 1560s, successive generations of city councillors realised that the economic and military strength of the hinterland was likely to be damaged by the social tensions caused by large-scale trials and executions for witchcraft. This concern also shaped the council’s reaction to narratives of witchcraft told in an urban context. The council’s tendency to treat people who told stories of witchcraft publicly as more of a threat to good social order than the alleged witches themselves can be most clearly seen in its handling of the witchcraft cases involving the Brosams from Wetztingen in 1561 and the Kellner family from Finsterlohr in 1563.

The Rothenburg evidence thus suggests that those areas most likely to be characterised by a restrained pattern of witch-trials in early modern Germany were those in which a significant majority of the ruling elites came to realize that the social, economic and political stability of their territories was likely to be damaged rather than strengthened by severe and large-scale witch-hunts. This way of thinking was effective, however, only if the ruling elites were able to maintain control over the judicial processes. Protestant demonology which emphasised the idea that many aspects of witchcraft were delusions caused by the devil might help support such a moderate elite viewpoint.

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their study of witch-hunting some historians have focused on witchcraft as a form of social revolt. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of witch-hunting. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

Different American Wests 1840–1900

Read the following extract about the American West and then answer the questions that follow.

The traditional narrative of the winning of the West lionized vigorous male heroes – cowboys, fur trappers, explorers and army officers – who collectively tore across the plains with gun-toting, buckskin-clad assurance. According to the popular discourse, these all-American idols conquered the virgin land, first in the name of civilization and, second, in the name of masculinity. As the story of the West was told and retold over the twentieth century a pattern of gender conventions emerged. Women were either sidelined in the story of the frontier or cast in accustomed, primarily domestic roles. These included the pioneer mother too delicate for the Plains, who brought a sense of gentility and morality to the rough world of the West; the (often reluctant) homesteader, who toiled away for the good of the family; and the bad girl (saloon dancer) who had a heart of gold.

Only gradually has the integral role played by women in the process of westward movement come to light. Women assumed diverse and adaptive roles and were critical players in the drama of Western history. In some cases, the West provided a theatre for liberation. At the same time, however, gender conventions continued to impose limitations on many women. Overwhelmingly, though, the experience of Western women speaks of resourcefulness, resolution and agency.

In revisionist scholarship, more often than not, the Western woman found herself living a life of domestic drudgery in a remote shack, a reality far removed from the image of Western paradise many had entertained before they headed west. Looking at the life of Evelyn Cameron, the vision of the female homesteader appears rather more complicated. Significantly, Evelyn Cameron suggested the life of the Western woman to be a multi-layered one. One aspect in particular set Cameron apart from both traditional and revisionist narratives – she appeared resolutely at home in the West.

Evelyn Cameron's diary illuminated the pivotal role played by women in the homestead economy. She managed the day-to-day running of the ranch. She undertook tasks often perceived to be the domain of men such as branding cattle, hunting predators, collecting wood and breaking-in horses. She demonstrated vigour, resolve and independence – values commonly associated with the male heroes of the frontier rather than the cowering maidens of popular stereotype. The 25th of March 1895 saw her 'Out to catch a coyote but instead fought prairie fire.'

In fact, she revelled in the frontier condition. As she advised: 'For the woman with a love of the outdoors and a taste for roughing it there is no life more congenial than that of the saddle and rifle.' She adapted to the terrain and tested the boundaries of women's work by kicking the dust in the face of the stereotype of women as weak, inferior and reliant on men. She demonstrated the opportunities for women in the West and their willingness to take on new roles. At the same time, she, in common with many women, remained subject to subtle restrictions and social strictures. On one occasion, Evelyn faced arrest in Miles City for her divided skirt, while her hunting exploits caused local tongues to wag. Her life showed the frontier tensions experienced by many Western women – of domesticity versus liberation. For her, however, there appeared little contradiction in these roles. As one historian observed: 'A significant number of women kept going, finding ways to appear domestic while doing what they wanted to do.'

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their work on the American West some historians have focused on the role of the federal government. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of the American West. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

Debates about the Holocaust

Read the following extract about the Holocaust and then answer the questions that follow.

After the Great War the acquisition of a continental 'living space' became central to a German resurgence. The National Socialists would combine the projects of empire and genocide. The Nazi 'Greater German Reich' would, unlike the Bismarckian 'lesser Germany,' be invulnerable to foreign conquest and dismemberment. As a corrective to the failure of the Second Reich to realize its imperialist ambitions before and during the Great War, an expanded German lebensraum would provide the resources to compete with and triumph over the Nazi regime's imperialistic rivals. It would forge a harmonious and racially purified empire that by subordinating, expelling, or killing its enemies would ensure the domination of the German master race. Because Jews mythically personified Germany's foreign and domestic enemies, they embodied the fragile boundaries between the dream of expanding and maintaining an empire and losing it through military defeat and racial pollution. German military doctrine had long presupposed that victory in war required the complete destruction of the enemy. The Third Reich would distinguish itself by eliminating the enemy behind the enemy.

The National Socialists defined their imperialism against what they deemed as the absurdity of Wilhelmine imperialism, its prioritizing of commercial over racial ends. Genocide has often been the outcome of colonial conquest. The Nazi variant, the regime's solution to the 'incomplete' unification of 1871 and the defeat and collapse of 1918, was the most extreme example of a long-standing European problem, the tension between the maintenance of empire with all its diversity and the struggle for ethnic and ideological uniformity. Without the Nazis' obsession with the mythical power of the Jewish 'enemy' and the long history of anti-Semitism, of course, the Holocaust would not have happened. Yet the distinctive characteristics of the Holocaust transformed the unifying capacities of the European nation states into 'the attack on human diversity'. The Nazi 'living space', cleansed of 'undesirables' and 'subhumans', would ensure the triumph of an empire that was to last a millennium.

During the first two years of World War II in Europe, the Nazi regime's persecution of the Jews appeared to combine historical precedents, beginning with the medieval markers of segregation – the yellow armbands with the Star of David. The camps, expulsions, and massacres visited on the Jews by 1941 were derived from the European and German experience of overseas colonialism of the nineteenth century. If pushing westwards in North America at the expense of indigenous peoples had been necessary for European settlers, according to Hitler, it was therefore equally logical and necessary for Germans to make space for themselves at the expense of Slavs and Jews in order to construct their own earthly paradise.

The attack on the Soviet Union unleashed a cataclysm that would engulf Jews. By the summer of 1942 when the death camps were operating at full tilt, the 'final solution' would bring about the Third Reich's own horrific contribution to the history of European imperialism. Although Nazis liked to compare their 'civilizing mission' to the Indian wars of North America, Jews, unlike Native Americans, assumed an altogether different status. In the past, colonizers spoke of 'natives' or 'savages' as either 'declining' or 'dying' in order to make way for the superior races. Yet the perpetrators of Nazi genocide proved less reluctant to express their own responsibility for mass murder. As Goebbels asserted, the war allowed the gloves to come off. 'The Jews would destroy us if we didn't fend them off ourselves. This is a struggle of life and death between the Aryan race and the Jewish infection.'

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their work on the Holocaust some historians have focused on the issues surrounding Holocaust denial. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of the Holocaust. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

**Copyright Information**

OCR is committed to seeking permission to reproduce all third-party content that it uses in its assessment materials. OCR has attempted to identify and contact all copyright holders whose work is used in this paper. To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced in the OCR Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations and is freely available to download from our public website (www.ocr.org.uk) after the live examination series.

If OCR has unwittingly failed to correctly acknowledge or clear any third-party content in this assessment material, OCR will be happy to correct its mistake at the earliest possible opportunity.

For queries or further information please contact the Copyright Team, First Floor, 9 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1GE.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group; Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.