

29 April – 12 May 2013

A2 GCE HISTORY B

F986/01 Historical Controversies – Non-British History

Candidates answer on the Answer Booklet.

OCR supplied materials:

- 16 page Answer Booklet
(sent with general stationery)

Other materials required:

None

Duration: 3 hours



INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name, centre number and candidate number in the spaces provided on the Answer Booklet. Please write clearly and in capital letters.
- Use black ink.
- Answer **both sub-questions** from **one** Study Topic.
- Read each question carefully. Make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Do **not** write in the bar codes.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **60**.
- This paper contains questions on the following 4 Study Topics:
 - Different Approaches to the Crusades, 1095–1272 (page 2)
 - Different Interpretations of Witch-hunting in Early Modern Europe c.1560–c.1660 (page 3)
 - Different American Wests 1840–1900 (page 4)
 - Debates about the Holocaust (page 5)
- You should write in continuous prose and are reminded of the need for clear and accurate writing, including structure and argument, grammar, punctuation and spelling.
- The time permitted allows for reading the Extract in the one Option you have studied.
- In answering these questions, you are expected to use your knowledge of the topic to help you understand and interpret the Extract as well as to inform your answers.
- **You may refer to your class notes and textbooks during the examination.**
- This document consists of **8** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

1 Different approaches to the Crusades 1095–1272

Read the following extract about the Crusades and then answer the questions that follow.

Gender is one of the primary ideas around which medieval society was both structured and imagined. This structuring of society according to gender is not a simple question of male and female, of biologically determined natures, but rather a complex system of ideas, values and meanings. The crusade narratives were written within a literary tradition which tended deliberately to masculinize the historical world. We need as readers to be aware that when medieval writers referred to gender, or included references to women, they were making a conscious choice to do so, born out of a desire to reflect the structures of their society.

I have tried to demonstrate that the representation of women in crusade chronicles can be read as more than simply representations of the events. It was through narratives such as these that the idea of the crusade was created. My first example is from an Anglo-Norman account of the response to preaching for the Third Crusade: 'A great many men sent each other wool and devices to spin it, hinting that if anyone failed to join this military undertaking, they were fit only for women's work.' The men are described using the symbol of the spinning device to reinforce social organization and to ensure appropriate action. The men present non-crusaders with spinning devices to imply accusations of inappropriate womanly conduct, and to represent the crusade as a specifically masculine activity.

In narratives of the Baltic crusades, this concept of womanly weakness, and its extraordinary reversal, was used in quite a different way. For example in the chronicle of Peter von Duisburg, circa 1326: 'The women, laying aside feminine adornment, put on a male frame of mind, girded swords upon the right, and ascended the battlements, comporting themselves so manfully, that nowhere was the weakness of their sex apparent.' Women appeared repeatedly in these chronicles fighting against the pagans, and winning, to demonstrate that God had apparently turned their physical weakness to strength through their faith. Death for the pagan at the hands of a supposedly weak woman was all the more shameful for him. This is clearly an ideal image for crusade narratives, which could use femininity as a symbol for weakness, rather than necessarily recording actual female activities.

In Guibert of Nogent's account of the First Crusade he tells of Christian women supporting 'their' troops in battle by bringing food and water. Later when the crusaders were besieged in the city of Antioch, exotic 'Saracen' or Turkish women were seen in the enemy's camp 'dressed like temples'. They were carrying bags of arrows, but Guibert said they had come 'not to fight but to reproduce'. These two short episodes use women to symbolize the right and wrong ordering of society. Good (Christian) society has humble and helpful wives. Bad (Muslim) society has overdressed nymphets.

William of Tyre made frequent references to ordinary women on the crusades. He describes how some of these women were pregnant but these pregnancies were not criticized, despite the crusaders' supposed status as penitents and pilgrims, and therefore supposedly chaste. Although his dependence on Fulcher of Chartres and the 'Gesta Francorum' is well established, he used the same stories as his sources to radically different effect. He recognized different symbolic possibilities in using the mass of women in the crusade army to elicit an appreciation of the particularly traumatic nature of the First Crusade. The drama of events he described was emphasized by the repeated subversion of the normal order.

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their study of the Crusades some historians have focused on the concept of 'a just war'. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of the Crusades. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

2 Different Interpretations of Witch-hunting in Early Modern Europe c.1560–c.1660

Read the following extract about witch-hunting and then answer the questions that follow.

Peasant consciousness is expressed authentically in popular uprisings; but this consciousness also appears in a mythical way in the imaginary and fantastic revolt of witches' gatherings, an attempt at diabolical escape. At the end of the sixteenth century a wave of Devil worship flowed over entire regions of southern France. This was contemporary with the popular revolts of 1580 and 1595. Some witches were sons of peasant rebels; for instance the werewolf, Jean Grenier. As for the forces of order, tribunals and Parlements, they led the hunt for witches and the repression of the uprisings with equal energy. No fact reveals more about peasant mentality than witchcraft, an agrarian movement par excellence. For instance, the list of witches given by the witch-finder Henry Boguet, contains almost entirely the names of villagers, and among them a majority of women, girls, widows, shepherdesses – born conservers of rural myths.

After 1580 the power lines of demonic influence ran from the Pyrenees to the Jura. Local historians were recording witch-trials with 'spells on animals and loss of little children in the cradle'. In Rouergue witches were ruling over a crude and ignorant population who did not know the Bible since they lived in hamlets or lost corners very far from churches.

How can it be explained when at the same moment the Reformation seems to indicate an increase in enlightenment? A sociological analysis can bring forward useful suggestions. The sixteenth-century growth in population ended with a relative piling-up of human masses in the old parishes, in the city suburbs, and on the cleared slopes of mountains. Neither the local clergy or the civil authorities, understood, nor even noticed, this growth. Nothing was organized to cope with it. After 1560 the civil wars aggravated this condition of abandonment. Priests were massacred and others fled. The spiritual dereliction of the mountains, nests of guerrillas and terrorism, was especially bad. Far from their priests, the peasants found themselves alone, faced with their anguishes and terrors. They gave themselves to the Devil.

Does it not impoverish one's analysis to reduce the diabolical epidemic to a deficit in religious organization? We must restore to witchcraft its full and dense character by turning to rural traditions and beliefs. It then seems like a lively reaction of peasant consciousness. There are certain profound relationships between witches and men in revolt, particularly on the level of unconscious psychology. In both rebellion and witchcraft we find a fictional reversal of the real world. To turn the world upside down is to dent it and proclaim disagreement with it. Like the revolts, the witchcraft of 1600 carries the stamp of such a tendency. A young southern witch from Saint-Jean-de Luz described the Black Mass as he saw it celebrated by the priest, Jean Souhardibels in Labourd: 'At this Mass, he performed the elevation with his feet up and his head down before the Devil because the Devil makes all things seem reversed at the witches' gatherings.' Gabriel Naude described the Feast of Fools in a village near Bordeaux where cabbage-cutters and gardeners moved into the choir stalls in place of the priests. Books were read backwards with glasses whose lenses have been removed and replaced with orange peel. These themes of reversal are also found in the old-fashioned popular revolts. Their aim was an exchange of social ranks, of reality, and of rituals, 'the first shall be last.'

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their study of witch-hunting some historians have focused on gender. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of witch-hunting. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

Different American Wests 1840–1900

Read the following extract about the American West and then answer the questions that follow.

Frontier is an unsubtle concept. The idea played an enormous role in national behavior, but so did the ideas of savagery and civilization, concepts that are currently not well respected as analytical terms. My point is that the historian is obliged to understand how people saw their own times, but not obliged to adopt their terminology and point of view. That one may study how Westerners depended on the Colt repeating revolver is not an argument for using a gun in professional debate.

If we give up a preoccupation with the frontier and look instead at the continuous sweep of Western American history, new organizing ideas await our attention, but no simple, unitary model. Turner's frontier rested on a single point of view; it required that the observer stand in the East and look to the West. Turner's frontier was a process, not a place. When 'civilization' had conquered 'savagery' at one location, the process moved on. In rethinking Western history, we gain the freedom to think of the West as a place – as many complicated environments occupied by natives who considered their homelands to be the center, not the edge.

Reorganized, the history of the West is a study of a place undergoing conquest and never fully escaping from its consequences. De-emphasize the frontier and its supposed end, think of the West as a place, and Western American history has a new look. First, the American West was an important meeting ground, the point where Indian America, Latin America, Anglo-America, Afro-America, and Asia-America intersected.

Second, the working of conquest tied these diverse groups into the same story. Happily, or not, minorities and majorities occupied a common ground. Conquest basically involved the drawing of lines on a map, the definition and allocation of ownership (personal, tribal, corporate, state, federal and international), and the evolution of land from matter to property. Western history has been an ongoing competition for the right to claim for oneself and for one's group the status of legitimate beneficiary of Western resources. This intersection of ethnic diversity with property allocation unifies Western history.

The contest for property and profit has been accompanied by a contest for cultural dominance. Conquest also involved a struggle over languages, cultures, and religions. In the unsettled questions of Indian assimilation and immigration in the semi-Hispanic Southwest, this contest for cultural dominance remains a primary unresolved issue of conquest. Reconceived as a running story, a fragmented and discontinuous past becomes whole again.

With its continuity restored, Western American history carries considerable significance for American history as a whole. Conquest forms the historical bedrock of the whole nation, and the American West is a pre-eminent case study in conquest and its consequences. The encounter between innocence and complexity is a recurrent theme in American culture, and Western history may well be the most dramatic case of high expectations and naivety meeting a frustrating reality. A belief in progress has been a driving force in the modern world; as a storehouse of enormous hopes for progress, the American West may well be the best place in which to observe the complex outcome of that faith.

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their work on the American West some historians have focused on the Native Americans. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of the American West. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

Debates about the Holocaust

Read the following extract about the Holocaust and then answer the questions that follow.

Between 26 and 28 August 1941 Higher SS and Police Leader Friedrich Jeckeln and what he grandiosely called his own Command Staff murdered most of the Jews in Kamenetz-Podolsk in West Ukraine. He developed a new technique of packing down layers of victims to make the best use of the excavated space. By the final day they had murdered 23,600 people. In this manner 2.9 million Jews were killed by men standing a few feet away from them, for there was nothing ‘factory-like’ or ‘industrial’ about how these people were killed. Nor were the killers exclusively German. Many others were involved, notably Estonians, Lithuanians, Rumanians and Ukrainians. There is not a single recorded instance of any German being punished in any formal sense for refusing to participate in what were voluntary activities. Witnesses in post-war German trials who testified that SS men or policemen were executed or sent to concentration camps for refusing to obey orders were all subsequently shown to have committed perjury.

SS men and policemen who faced post-war prosecution usually invoked the defence of ‘putative emergency’. This meant that they had imagined something might happen to them if they refused orders. But nobody gave any orders at any time to rob and rape victims, nor did they tell anyone to brain an infant against a tree rather than shooting it. Men did that because they felt like it. The problem of dissent hardly ever arose, because, as a member of the 8th SS Infantry Regiment testified ‘there were always enough volunteers’. When a company leader from a related unit asked for men to shoot Jews, all but one took a step forward. Why? Both deep-seated eliminatory anti-Semitism in German society and group psychological dynamics have been used to explain what happened. There is perhaps another way of looking at it.

While there were notorious haters of Jews who often set the tone in these units, the role of anti-Semitism was not as straightforward as it sometimes seems to Jews. The crimes often involved individuals spotting opportunities to ‘go shopping with a pistol’ as one policeman put it, perhaps for a fur coat for a girlfriend at home. Anti-Semitism does not explain the equally matter-of-fact way in which these men killed non-Jews like the elderly Polish Catholics shot by Reserve Battalion 101. It is important to understand what these men thought they were doing. Murdering Jews was a historic mission. This is why one SS-Scharfuhrer claimed that the high body count he had achieved justified the award of the *Kriegsverdienstkreuz*, one of Germany’s highest military medals. A drunk member of the Gestapo had a beer mat attached to his tunic, on which he had scrawled ‘1,000’ in red ink. He announced in a drunken slur, ‘Man, I’m celebrating the thousandth shot in the neck.’

The killing of the Jews utterly depended on the perpetrators retaining a sense of morality, however perverse that might seem. This morality was based on a pseudo-scientific belief in the absolute inequality of the human races, which gave the higher race (the Germans) the absolute right to rule lesser races. Killing the Jews was a mission with which this generation was burdened. It had to be kept secret because the general population were not at a sufficiently advanced stage of consciousness to understand its necessity. It was as if the killers found themselves participating in something detached from reality. The fact that these men laughed when the German press denounced the Soviet secret police’s crimes suggests they were living in a world apart. After participating in shooting two hundred Jews including Germans whom he knew, one perpetrator remarked, ‘Man alive, damn it, a generation has to go through this, so that things will be better for our children.’ This morality helped the individual killer deal with any weaknesses in character, weakness derived from the traditional morality that Nazism had transcended. There was also an emphasis on the retention of decency. ‘I was deeply shocked by this order,’ Himmler confided in 1943. From top to bottom the perpetrators saw themselves as victims.

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their work on the Holocaust some historians have focused on its connections with 19th century colonial practices. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of the Holocaust. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

BLANK PAGE

**Copyright Information**

OCR is committed to seeking permission to reproduce all third-party content that it uses in its assessment materials. OCR has attempted to identify and contact all copyright holders whose work is used in this paper. To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced in the OCR Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations and is freely available to download from our public website (www.ocr.org.uk) after the live examination series.

If OCR has unwittingly failed to correctly acknowledge or clear any third-party content in this assessment material, OCR will be happy to correct its mistake at the earliest possible opportunity.

For queries or further information please contact the Copyright Team, First Floor, 9 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1GE.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group; Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.