



Friday 20 June 2014 – Afternoon

LEVEL 2 AWARD THINKING AND REASONING SKILLS

B902/01 Unit 2 Thinking and Reasoning Skills Case Study

Candidates answer on the Question Paper.

OCR supplied materials:

- Resource Booklet (B902/01/RB)

Other materials required:

None

Duration: 1 hour



Candidate forename		Candidate surname	
--------------------	--	-------------------	--

Centre number						Candidate number				
---------------	--	--	--	--	--	------------------	--	--	--	--

INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name, centre number and candidate number in the boxes above. Please write clearly and in capital letters.
- Use black ink. HB pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
- Answer **all** the questions.
- Read each question carefully. Make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Write your answer to each question in the space provided. If additional space is required, you should use the lined pages at the end of this booklet. The question number(s) must be clearly shown.
- Do **not** write in the bar codes.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **60**.
- Quality of written communication will be assessed in questions 16 and 17.
- This document consists of **16** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

SECTION A – Thinking through the documents

You are advised to spend no more than 40 minutes on this section. It is worth 40 marks.

Answer ALL the questions in this section.

- 1 In Document 6, Albert Pierrepoint states the following:

In some ways the wait in the Wandsworth death cell had been better for Bentley than for many murderers who went before him. Until the very last moment, a reprieve seemed possible.

Which of the following best describes this? Tick the correct response.

- Argument
- Explanation
- List of information
- Rant

[1]

- 2 In Document 8, Abigail Douglas provides the following argument:

You must reconsider hanging Derek Bentley. Everyone, even including two hundred politicians, thinks he is innocent so it would be wrong to go through with the death penalty in this case.

- (a) Mark up Abigail's argument in the box above to show the different argument components:

- (i) Underline the intermediate conclusion. [1]
- (ii) Put brackets around the reason. [1]

- (b) Which of the following best describes the weakness in Abigail's reasoning?
Tick the correct response.

- Irrelevant appeal
- Slippery slope
- Straw man
- Tu quoque

[1]

3 In Document 8, Abigail Douglas also provides the following argument:

Derek Bentley has a mental age of 11, so he should not be punished for his crimes.

Identify **one** assumption that Abigail is making in her argument.

.....
..... [1]

4 In Document 7, Team A presents the following argument in favour of reinstating the death penalty as a punishment for murder:

Capital punishment should be brought back as a penalty for murder. When a person takes the life of another human being, they give up their right to life. Also, prison would not be a severe enough punishment for taking a life. Therefore, capital punishment is the only way of ensuring that justice is done.

(a) Which of the following best describes the sentence? Circle the correct response.

'Also, prison would not be a severe enough punishment for taking a life.'

conclusion **explanation** **intermediate conclusion** **reason** [1]

(b) Which of the following best describes the way in which the word 'justice' is being used in the final sentence? Tick the correct response.

- Deterring others from committing the same crime
- Getting revenge for crimes committed
- Making sure that all crimes are punished equally
- Punishing people in proportion to their crime

[1]

- 5 In Document 4, Lord Goddard’s summing-up at the original trial asks the jury to consider the statements of the three police officers present at the crime:

Are you going to say they are liars doing their best to swear away the life of that boy by falsely saying that he called out, “Let him have it, Chris!”, or are you going to say that it is true and a deadly piece of evidence against him?

- (a) Name the flaw in this reasoning:

..... [1]

- (b) Explain your answer:

.....
..... [1]

- 6 In paragraph 3 of Document 4, Lord Goddard makes use of an analogy, comparing the Bentley case with two people going out housebreaking.

- (a) State **one** relevant similarity between the two situations being compared which strengthens the analogy.

..... [1]

- (b) Explain **one** relevant difference between the two situations being compared which weakens the analogy.

.....
.....
..... [2]

7 Document 1 explains that in 1998 a pardon was finally issued on the basis that:

The judge had been biased against the defendants and that he had misdirected the jury.

(a) Explain **one** way in which Lord Goddard’s summing-up in paragraph 5 of Document 4 is evidence to support this claim.

.....
.....
.....
..... [2]

(b) Suggest and explain **one** factor that is likely to have caused Lord Goddard to be biased in his summing-up.

.....
.....
.....
..... [2]

8 Document 3 reports the evidence of the three police officers who were present when PC Miles was killed and the two boys arrested.

(a) Identify **two** significant points of agreement in the evidence given by Fairfax and Harrison.

1.....
.....
2.....
..... [2]

(b) (i) Identify **one** significant point of disagreement between McDonald’s evidence and that of the other two officers.

.....
.....
..... [1]

(ii) Explain why this point of disagreement would have been important at the trial.

.....
.....
..... [1]

- 9 In Document 8 George Trotter’s letter suggests a reason why Bentley did not use the weapons that were found in his pocket.

If Derek Bentley had intended to hurt anyone then he had every opportunity to do so because he had a knuckleduster and a knife in his pocket when he was grabbed by a policeman. The fact that he didn’t do anything shows that he is a good person.

Give **two** alternative explanations for why Derek Bentley might not have used the weapons in his pocket against the police officers.

Explanation 1

.....

.....

Explanation 2

.....

..... [2]

- 10 Consider Derek Bentley’s statement in Document 2. Identify **two** claims made by Bentley that are relevant in showing that he is innocent of the murder of PC Miles. For each claim identified, explain why it would be relevant.

Claim 1

.....

.....

Explanation of relevance

.....

.....

Claim 2

.....

.....

Explanation of relevance

.....

..... [4]

11 Identify **three** claims from Derek Bentley’s statement in Document 2 which would support the view that he was knowingly committing a crime.

Claim 1

.....

Claim 2

.....

Claim 3

..... [3]

12 In Document 5, Hugh Maw, the educational psychologist at Bentley’s school, says:

“Derek was never violent, he was bullied and easily led,”

Name and explain **one** criterion which strengthens the credibility of this claim.

.....

.....

.....

..... [2]

13 In Document 7, Team B uses statistics taken from Amnesty International’s website to support its argument:

Since 1973, over 130 people have been released from death row throughout the United States due to evidence of their wrongful convictions. In 2003 alone, 10 wrongfully convicted defendants were released from death row.

(a) Which of the conclusions stated below can be reliably drawn from this information?

Circle ‘yes’ or ‘no’.

	Can be drawn from the information
10 wrongful convictions took place in 2003	YES NO
Over 130 wrongfully convicted people would have been executed since 1973 if it weren’t for DNA evidence	YES NO
The legal system does not always get it right	YES NO
Over 130 wrongfully convicted people would have been executed since 1973 if executions took place immediately following the trial.	YES NO

[4]

(b) Team B argues, on the basis of these statistics, that the death penalty should never be reinstated in the UK. Explain the problem with this reasoning.

.....

.....

..... [2]

14 The teacher of the sixth form law class in Document 7 tells Team A that its third point needs to be turned into an argument.

Write a short argument, containing **one** developed reason, to support the idea that ‘capital punishment should be mandatory for the murder of police officers’.

.....

.....

.....

.....

..... [3]

SECTION B – Thinking to a conclusion based on reasons and evidence

Allow approximately 20 minutes for this section. It is worth 20 marks.

Answer ALL the questions in this section.

15 Abigail’s letter in Document 8 includes a counter-argument:

Although I understand the need to send out a message to young people about carrying dangerous weapons and going around acting like movie gangsters.

Develop Abigail’s counter-argument by giving **two** reasons that would support it.

1

.....

.....

2

.....

..... [2]

ADDITIONAL ANSWER SPACE

If additional answer space is required, you should use the following lined page(s). The question number(s) must be clearly shown in the margins.

This section of the page is a large, empty area of lined paper. It features a vertical solid line on the left side, creating a margin. The rest of the page is filled with horizontal dotted lines, providing space for students to write their answers. The lines are evenly spaced and extend across the width of the page.

A vertical solid line is positioned on the left side of the page. From this line, 25 horizontal dotted lines extend across the page, creating a series of rows for writing.

A vertical solid line is positioned on the left side of the page. From this line, 25 horizontal dotted lines extend across the page, creating a series of rows for writing.

A vertical solid line is positioned on the left side of the page. From this line, 25 horizontal dotted lines extend across the page, creating a series of rows for writing.

A large area of the page is reserved for writing, featuring a vertical solid line on the left side and horizontal dotted lines extending across the page.



Copyright Information

OCR is committed to seeking permission to reproduce all third-party content that it uses in its assessment materials. OCR has attempted to identify and contact all copyright holders whose work is used in this paper. To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced in the OCR Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations and is freely available to download from our public website (www.ocr.org.uk) after the live examination series.

If OCR has unwittingly failed to correctly acknowledge or clear any third-party content in this assessment material, OCR will be happy to correct its mistake at the earliest possible opportunity.

For queries or further information please contact the Copyright Team, First Floor, 9 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1GE.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group; Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.