Tuesday 24 May 2016 – Afternoon

AS GCE CRITICAL THINKING

F502/01 Assessing and Developing Argument
F502/02

Candidates answer Section A on the Answer Sheet and Sections B and C on the Question Paper.

Duration: 1 hour 30 minutes

OCR supplied materials:
• Answer Sheet for Section A Multiple Choice
• Resource Booklet (F502/01/02/RB)

Other materials required:
None

INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES
• Write your name, centre number and candidate number in the boxes above. Please write clearly and in capital letters.
• Use black ink. HB pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
• Answer all the questions.
• Read each question carefully. Make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
• Answer Section A, questions 1–15, on the Answer Sheet provided. You are advised to spend no more than 20 minutes on Section A.
• On completion of Section A move directly on to Sections B and C.
• Answer Sections B and C in the spaces provided on the Question Paper.
• Write your answer to each question in the space provided. If additional space is required, you should use the lined page(s) at the end of this booklet. The question number(s) must be clearly shown.
• Additional paper may also be used if necessary.
• Do not write in the bar codes.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES
• The number of marks is given in brackets [ ] at the end of each question or part question.
• The total number of marks for this paper is 75. Section A comprises 20% of the available marks, Sections B and C comprise 80% of the available marks.
• Quality of Written Communication will be assessed in Section C.
• This document consists of 16 pages. Any blank pages are indicated.
SECTION A – Multiple Choice

Answer all questions in this section using the separate Answer Sheet provided.

You are advised to spend no more than 20 minutes on this section of the paper.

Questions 1, 2 and 3 refer to the following passage:

The charity Leaf, (Linking Environment and Farming), undertook an online survey of two thousand 16 to 23 year olds about food origins. The results were that 36% did not know bacon is pig meat and 40% failed to link milk with cows. Also, while 67% were able to link eggs to an image of a hen, 11% thought they came from wheat or maize. But it does not matter that children do not know where their food comes from. Agricultural processes are irrelevant in modern day life for the majority of people. Children do not have the opportunity to grow their own food because most of them live in an urban environment.

1 Which of the following is an underlying assumption of the following part of the argument?

‘Children do not have the opportunity to grow their own food because most of them live in an urban environment.’

(a) Food is readily available in urban environments.
(b) People in cities can grow food on allotments.
(c) Urban environments do not have space for farms.
(d) You cannot grow food in your home or garden.

2 Which of the following is the best statement of the weakness in the above argument?

(a) Agricultural processes are relevant for many people who live in the countryside.
(b) Children and teenagers are more likely than adults to be vegetarians.
(c) The use of evidence is weak as 11% is statistically insignificant.
(d) Understanding agricultural processes and knowing where food comes from are not the same thing.

3 Which of the following, if true, would most weaken the above argument?

(a) 64% of people in the survey did not know that new potatoes would be available from British farms in June.
(b) Farmers are increasingly concerned that children do not know where their food comes from.
(c) Knowing where food comes from helps you make informed decisions about nutrition and animal welfare.
(d) Three in ten adults born in the 1990s have not visited a farm in more than 10 years, if at all.
Questions 4, 5, 6 and 7 refer to the following passage:

The twenty best-paid footballers in Britain are each paid over £100 000 per week by their clubs. These extraordinarily high wages are causing serious problems. First, only a few teams can afford the best players and matches are less exciting when only a handful of teams dominate their league. Second, all teams are in danger of spending too much money on players. The 2012 bankruptcy of Glasgow Rangers football club dramatically illustrates this. The solution is to reduce player wages. Many sports in the USA, including basketball and American football, have introduced a salary cap with positive results. Therefore a salary cap should be introduced here too. Lowering wages significantly is likely to make footballers better people and more appropriate role models. Britain’s Olympians are not well-paid and yet they are far more dedicated and self-disciplined than our footballers.

4 Which of the following is an intermediate conclusion of the above argument?
   (a) A salary cap should be introduced here too.
   (b) Britain’s Olympians are far more dedicated and self-disciplined than our footballers.
   (c) Matches are less exciting when only a handful of teams dominate their league.
   (d) These extraordinarily high wages are causing serious problems.

5 What is the name of the following argument element in the above passage?
   ‘The 2012 bankruptcy of Glasgow Rangers football club dramatically illustrates this.’
   (a) evidence
   (b) example
   (c) explanation
   (d) reason

6 Which of the following is an appeal made in the above argument?
   (a) appeal to authority
   (b) appeal to emotion
   (c) appeal to history
   (d) appeal to tradition

7 Which of the following is a flaw in the above argument?
   (a) It is attacking the character of footballers, rather than giving reasons to pay them less.
   (b) Lower wages may not be the cause of the Olympians' greater dedication and self-discipline.
   (c) There is a generalisation from some teams to all teams.
   (d) There is a slippery slope from high wages to bankruptcy.
Questions 8 and 9 refer to the following passage:

A report by the Advertising Standards Authority (ASA) has found that hard-hitting and shocking adverts are upsetting and offensive to children aged between 11 and 16. The report said that adverts for international aid and animal charities were frequently cited as being offensive, often because they use portrayals of violence or mistreatment in their advertising. But charity and public service TV advertising campaigns are helping to educate young people. The fact that they cause distress shows that children are noticing them. The psychological damage will be no worse than the damage they inflict on themselves by watching horror films and playing violent computer games.

8 Which is the **main conclusion** of the above argument?

   (a) Adverts for international aid and animal charities were frequently cited as being offensive.

   (b) Charity and public service TV advertising campaigns are helping to educate young people.

   (c) Hard-hitting and shocking adverts are upsetting and offensive to children.

   (d) The psychological damage will be no worse than the damage they inflict on themselves.  

[1]

9 Which of the following is a **flaw** in the above argument?

   (a) ad hominem

   (b) confusing necessary and sufficient conditions

   (c) slippery slope

   (d) two wrongs don't make a right

[1]
Questions 10, 11 and 12 refer to the following passage:

Most people learn about changes in the world through watching or reading the news. But the news focuses on events from the previous 24 hours; long-term, gradual change is rarely reported. In 2010, for example, 33 Chilean miners were trapped underground by a rock-fall. Their dramatic rescue was headline news all over the world. In contrast, the Millennium Declaration agreed by world leaders in 2000 has gradually improved child healthcare in the developing world, and is now saving the lives of over 17,000 children per day. Relying on the news to learn about changes in the world is a problem because gradual changes are often more significant. People should know about significant changes in the world so that they can act responsibly. If everyone was aware of the amazing success of the Millennium Declaration, for example, then they would see the benefits of campaigning for similar initiatives.

10  Which of the following is the main conclusion of the above argument?

   (a) Long-term, gradual change is rarely reported.
   (b) Most people learn about changes in the world through watching or reading the news.
   (c) Relying on the news to learn about changes in the world is a problem.
   (d) The Millennium Declaration has gradually improved child healthcare in the developing world.

11  What is the name of the following argument element in the above passage?

   ‘People should know about significant changes in the world.’

   (a) counter-assertion
   (b) explanation
   (c) intermediate conclusion
   (d) principle

12  Which of the following, if true, would most weaken the above argument?

   (a) It is hard to maintain interest in something that is changing gradually.
   (b) Significant changes in the world are too complex for most people to understand.
   (c) The effects of the Millennium Declaration have featured prominently in the news.
   (d) The very dramatic rescue of the Chilean miners brought joy to many people.
Questions 13, 14 and 15 refer to the following passage:

There is something fundamentally wrong with our capitalist economy. Companies are not interested in the wellbeing of others. In a capitalist economy, the only purpose of a company is to maximise profit. If this can be achieved by selling a customer a harmful product, driving a rival to bankruptcy, or firing 30% of the workforce, a company will do this. Companies show remorse only when they are caught breaking the law. In addition, companies seek to manipulate and control the public through marketing and public relations. This is the behaviour of a psychopath, and it should not surprise us that the people who run and manage companies are four times more likely than other people to be psychopaths. Our economic system needs fundamental reform.

13 Which of the following is an intermediate conclusion of the above argument?

(a) In a capitalist economy, the only purpose of a company is to maximise profit.

(b) Our economic system needs fundamental reform.

(c) People who run and manage companies are four times more likely than other people to be psychopaths.

(d) There is something fundamentally wrong with our capitalist economy.

14 Which of the following is an assumption of the above argument?

(a) It is easy to persuade consumers to buy harmful products.

(b) Maximising profit is not in companies’ best interests.

(c) Psychopathic behaviour is usually harmful.

(d) The laws which govern company behaviour are inadequate.

15 Which of the following, if true, would most strengthen the above argument?

(a) Alternatives to capitalism have even more serious problems.

(b) Banks have knowingly put the economy at risk to increase their own profits.

(c) Many companies have environmentally friendly policies, despite additional costs.

(d) Psychopaths are much more likely than other people to commit violent crime.
Read the passage on the Resource Booklet.

For all parts of questions 16 and 17, you should use the exact words of the author.

16 State the **main conclusion** of the argument.

........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................... [1]

17 (a) State **two principles** used in the argument.

Principle 1

...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  
...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  
...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  

Principle 2

...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  
...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  
...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................... [4]

(b) State one **intermediate conclusion** used in paragraphs 5 to 6.

...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  
...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  
...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................... [2]

(c) State one **counter assertion** used in the argument.

...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  
...........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................  
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................... [2]
In paragraph 2, there is an analogy.

(a) Identify precisely the situations being compared.

The first comparison has been done for you.

Mobiles are being compared with coats/suits.

........................................................................... is/are being compared with ..............................................
........................................................................... is/are being compared with ..............................................
........................................................................... is/are being compared with ..............................................
........................................................................... is/are being compared with .............................................. [3]

(b) Explain one weakness in the analogy. You must explain clearly the impact of this weakness on the author's reasoning.

...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
.............................................................................................................................................. [3]
19 The example of washing machines is used in paragraph 3 to support the claim that:

‘Companies themselves are encouraging the throwaway society by manufacturing lower cost, less repairable products.’

Make one point of evaluation about the use of this example. You must explain how effectively it supports the claim. Your evaluation may be a strength or a weakness.

..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................. [3]

20 Explain one point of evaluation in the use of the evidence in paragraph 4. You must explain the impact of this on the author’s reasoning. Your evaluation may be a strength or a weakness.

..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................. [3]
Paragraph 6 states ‘the government gains money from the purchase of goods because customers pay value added tax (VAT) on them’.

(a) State whether this is an argument or an explanation.

........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................[1]

(b) Justify your answer with reference to the claim above.

........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................[2]

Identify and explain three weaknesses in the reasoning in paragraphs 5 and 6. In your answer you may consider the following: use of evidence, assumptions, flaws, appeals, hypothetical reasoning or other evaluative points. In each answer you should make reference to the text.

Weakness 1

........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................

Weakness 2

........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................

Weakness 3

........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
........................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................................
‘It is better to give your time to charities rather than money.’

Write your own argument to support or challenge this claim.

Marks will be given for a well-structured, sustained and developed argument. You should include:

- a **main** conclusion
- a counter-argument and response
- at least **two** reasons.

Your argument may also contain other argument elements. You may use information and ideas from the passage, but you must use them to form a new argument. No credit will be given for repeating the arguments in the passage.

..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................................... [12]
It is better to own something than to have to borrow it.

(a) (i) Give a reason of your own to support this claim. You must give only a reason and not add other argument elements.

............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................[2]

(ii) Give an example to illustrate your reason.

............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................[1]

(b) Give one hypothetical reason to challenge this claim.

............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................
............................................................................................................................................................[3]
‘Products should be made to last.’

Write your own argument to support this claim.

Marks will be given for a well-structured, sustained and developed argument. You should include:

- a **main** conclusion
- an **intermediate** conclusion
- at least **three** reasons.

Your argument may also contain other argument elements. You may use information and ideas from the passage, but you must use them to form a new argument. No credit will be given for repeating the arguments in the passage.

..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
................................................................................................................................................................[12]
If additional space is required, you should use the following lined page(s). The question number(s) must be clearly shown in the margin(s).