

OCR

Oxford Cambridge and RSA

25 April – 6 May 2017

A2 GCE HISTORY B

F986/01 Historical Controversies – Non-British History

Candidates answer on the Answer Booklet.

OCR supplied materials:

- 12 page Answer Booklet (OCR12)
(sent with general stationery)

Other materials required:

None

Duration: 3 hours



INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

- Write your name, centre number and candidate number in the spaces provided on the Answer Booklet. Please write clearly and in capital letters.
- Use black ink.
- Answer **both sub-questions** from **one** Study Topic.
- Read each question carefully. Make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
- Do **not** write in the barcodes.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

- The number of marks is given in brackets [] at the end of each question or part question.
- The total number of marks for this paper is **60**.
- This paper contains questions on the following four Study Topics:
 - Different Approaches to the Crusades 1095–1272 (page 2)
 - Different Interpretations of Witch-hunting in Early Modern Europe c.1560–c.1660 (page 3)
 - Different American Wests 1840–1900 (page 4)
 - Debates about the Holocaust (page 5)
- You should write in continuous prose and are reminded of the need for clear and accurate writing, including structure and argument, grammar, punctuation and spelling.
- The time permitted allows for reading the extract in the one Study Topic you have studied.
- In answering these questions, you are expected to use your knowledge of the topic to help you understand and interpret the extract as well as to inform your answers.
- **You may refer to your class notes and textbooks during the examination.**
- This document consists of **8** pages. Any blank pages are indicated.

1

Different approaches to the Crusades 1095–1272

Read the following extract about the Crusades and then answer the questions that follow.

Adapted from H C Krueger, 'The Crusade and European Expansion in The Crusades', pp59-62, DC Heath and Co, 1964. Item removed due to third party copyright restrictions.

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their work on the Crusades some historians have used a generalist approach. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of the Crusades. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

2 Different Interpretations of Witch-hunting in Early Modern Europe c.1560–c.1660

Read the following extract about witch-hunting and then answer the questions that follow.

It is frequently claimed that witch trials multiplied across much of central and western Europe because of the religious fanaticism engendered by both the Protestant and Catholic Reformations, which disastrously exacerbated the fears of an ignorant and suspicious peasantry. While it is difficult to deny some kind of connection between these movements and the concurrent wave of witch trials across much of western and central Europe, the exact relationship between these phenomena remains elusive. It is undeniable that both Protestant and Catholic governments sponsored witch-hunts. It is therefore tempting to conclude that Europe's great witch-hunt was simply one tragic consequence of its religious conflicts. However, any correlation between these two phenomena is far from direct. In the first place, the outbreak of warfare, whether or not religiously motivated, temporarily ended witch trials whenever or wherever it occurred. War disrupted all normal government activity. Subtler connections must be found.

Let us rethink the problem, starting from the fact that the two greatest leaders of the Protestant Reformation, Luther and Calvin, both explicitly approved the conduct of witch trials in their respective residencies of Wittenberg and Geneva in the early 1540s. Since Holy Scripture apparently threatened witches with death, there was no reason for any major sixteenth-century theologian to doubt the reality of witchcraft.

If we reconceptualise the religious history of western Europe after 1560, traditionally known as the age of religious warfare, under its newer general label as the age of confessionalism, we can sketch a different picture. Confessionalism meant well-trained clergy systematically indoctrinating precisely defined creeds. The Reformation transformed itself into well-organised and well-disciplined churches, most of which were under state control.

Regardless of whether or not their governments were officially at war, Europe's rival confessions competed constantly with each other in demonstrating religious zeal. The need to discipline members who failed to meet confessional norms created a climate in which overt oppression of religious deviance increased. Witchcraft now became a much-feared form of religious deviance, in addition to the social dangers which maleficent magic had always posed. Under such conditions, theologians of all confessions warned about an alarming increase in witchcraft; a few of them, for example the Calvinist Lambert Daneau or the Jesuit Martin De Rio, even composed demonologies, while a great many others preached sermons on the subject.

Although the role of confessionalism in encouraging witch-hunting remained indirect, mainstream Protestant and Catholic Churches exerted much energy across the 'confessional century' after 1560 by reinforcing in their membership an awareness of sin and diabolical temptations in both oneself and others. Parishioners' fears of immoral activities, among which witchcraft occupied a uniquely powerful place, increased: as we have seen in the Saarland and northern France, awareness of the witches' sabbats spread at the local level. Overt warfare between confessions, however, was extraneous to this process and actually interfered with it.

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. [30]
- (b) In their work on witch-hunting some historians have focused on regional studies. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of the witch-hunting. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? [30]

Different American Wests 1840–1900

Read the following extract about the American West and then answer the questions that follow.

In a single 40-mile stretch of the Nevada desert in 1850, one migrant counted two thousand abandoned wagons. The debris, the dust, the manure, all these things marked trails as an environment clearly shaped by human use. Old Western Historians looked past the garbage and saw 'nature'. For them, untouched nature was preeminent. They wanted to see wilderness because from it they derived the culture of the West. New Western Historians see the garbage first. They see the cultural. They have an affinity for trash as the evidence of human actions, the relics of culture.

Old Western Historians divided the West between nature and culture; they called the dividing line the frontier. On one side of the frontier, nature reigned. Humans on that side of the line were 'nature's children'. They were incapable of controlling their surroundings. Old Western Historians culturally coded this far side of the frontier as feminine and 'virgin'. On the other side of the frontier humans had mastered nature. The settlers on the long trails entering the West were virile, strong and brave.

When New Western Historians look at the West they see mountains, rivers, prairies, and fields. They see various peoples – Indians, Hispanics, blacks, Chinese, various groups of European descent. Each treats the land somewhat differently, but all are modifying their environment. There is no sharp line between culture and nature. Wilderness – that is, land unaffected by human use – is rarely to be found. There is no obvious frontier. How you see in large part determines what you see and the landscape New Western Historians recreate is different. Indians, for example, set prairie fires to get earlier growth of grasses in the spring. Lorenzo Sawyer saw the results in the Platte Valley in 1850: 'Those portions of the valley which have been burnt over are covered with fresh, though short, grass.' In the 1850s a farmer named Walter Crockett had written home that his main object was 'to get the land subdued and the wild nature out of it.' The historian realises, and poor Crockett doesn't, that the prairie Crockett is farming is an Indian creation, shaped by Indian burning and use. It is not 'wild nature.' The historian knows that Crockett is mistaking a complicated environmental process for a single-step process – nature to culture.

New Western Historians look initially at three things: first, the contesting groups; second, their perceptions of the land and their ambitions for it; third, the structures of power that shape the context. The competing groups can be economic or occupational groups: farmers, ranchers, miners. They can be ethnic or racial groups: Anglos, Indians, or Hispanics. In this area, changes in the landscape follow the ability of Anglos to wrench control of the land from Indians and Hispanics. The competition can be between local capital and capitalists from outside. It can be class conflict.

These relationships take us back to trails, to movement, to contact, to exchange. The West is the product of relationships but too narrow a focus on trails will deceive us because they seemed to flow only in one direction: into the West. We must concentrate on a more complex West, in which traffic out of the West – whether gold, silver, wheat, cattle, lumber, or people – mattered as much as traffic into it. The trails in this West seem more a maze than a simple line from one point to another. These trails lead to a land and people constantly in the midst of reinvention and reshaping.

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their work on the American West some historians have focused on popular representations of the West. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of the American West. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

Debates about the Holocaust

Read the following extract about the Holocaust and then answer the questions that follow.

Plans for deportation of Jews faced considerable difficulties through the standstill of military operations in the East and the extra burdening of the already overloaded transportation system. Hitler obviously had no intention of halting the plan for the massive evacuation of the Jews even when the military situation in the East proved more difficult than had been assumed in the summer of 1941. It was for this reason that the original plans for deportation were curtailed on the one hand, while on the other decisions were made aimed at eventually removing at least part of the evacuated Jews 'by other means', i.e. planned killing operations.

It thus seems that the liquidation of the Jews began not solely as the result of an ostensible will for extermination but also as a 'way out' of a blind alley into which the Nazis had manoeuvred themselves. The practice of liquidation, once initiated and established, gained predominance and evolved in the end into a comprehensive 'programme'.

The first massacre of the Jews deported from the Reich took place in November of 1941. The Jews of some transports that had been diverted to the Reichskommissariat Ostland, mainly to Riga, Minsk and Kovno, were not assigned to the local ghettos or camps, they were shot upon arrival together with the local Jews in the executions already started by the Security Police, as for instance in Riga on the so-called Bloody Sunday of 30 November 1941.

At about the same time (November 1941) in the Reichsgau of Wartheland the 'Lange Special Commando' arrived in Chelmno and proceeded to construct temporary extermination facilities for the killing of Jews, mostly from the ghetto of Litzmannstadt. The idea that was initiated the previous summer in Posen, according to which the situation in the ghettos could be relieved through the killing of Jews unable to work 'by means of a quick-acting medium', had apparently fallen on fertile ground. A document from the time shows that there existed no general order for the annihilation of Jews but rather sporadic liquidation measures prompted by an inability to carry out the programme of deportations as planned.

The Jews had to be 'exterminated somehow'. This fatal expression recurs again and again in documents at this stage (autumn 1941), revealing evidence of the 'improvisation' of extermination as the 'simplest' solution – one that with additional extermination camps in occupied Poland, finally generate the accumulated experience and the institutional potential for the mass murders.

It follows that the responsibility and the initiative for the killing were not Hitler's, or Himmler's or Heydrich's alone. This does not free Hitler of responsibility. The accumulation of Hitler's aggressive statements and destructive will regarding the Jewish question, as well as the allusions inherent therein to concrete measures for the Jews' expulsion and decimation, are sufficiently conclusive when interpreted in their historical context. They clearly reveal Hitler's fixation concerning the Jewish question and show his passionate interest in it. These facts preclude any possibility of his indifference to the continuing progress of the solution of the Jewish question.

- (a) What can you learn from this extract about the interpretation, approaches and methods of the historian? Refer to the extract and your knowledge to explain your answer. **[30]**
- (b) In their work on the Holocaust some historians have focused on a synthesist approach. Explain how this approach has contributed to our understanding of the Holocaust. Has this approach any disadvantages or shortcomings? **[30]**

END OF QUESTION PAPER

**Copyright Information**

OCR is committed to seeking permission to reproduce all third-party content that it uses in its assessment materials. OCR has attempted to identify and contact all copyright holders whose work is used in this paper. To avoid the issue of disclosure of answer-related information to candidates, all copyright acknowledgements are reproduced in the OCR Copyright Acknowledgements Booklet. This is produced for each series of examinations and is freely available to download from our public website (www.ocr.org.uk) after the live examination series.

If OCR has unwittingly failed to correctly acknowledge or clear any third-party content in this assessment material, OCR will be happy to correct its mistake at the earliest possible opportunity.

For queries or further information please contact the Copyright Team, First Floor, 9 Hills Road, Cambridge CB2 1GE.

OCR is part of the Cambridge Assessment Group; Cambridge Assessment is the brand name of University of Cambridge Local Examinations Syndicate (UCLES), which is itself a department of the University of Cambridge.