

GCSE

Ancient History

Unit **A032**: The Rise of Rome

General Certificate of Secondary Education

Mark Scheme for June 2018

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.

This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.

All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

© OCR 2018

MARK SCHEME FORMAT 1

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
1	<p>A01 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The taking of Geryon's cows as one of Hercules' twelve tasks: having killed Geryon, Hercules pastures them in a green field - the shepherd Cacus takes some of the bulls (drags them by their tails to a cave): these are missed by Hercules who kills Cacus - local ruler Evander wants to know what Hercules had done and why: the meeting between the two and the fulfilment of the prophecy that the Romans would worship Hercules (ie.altar/ sacrifice - the beginning of a cult dedicated to Hercules) - Reference to/ description of Evander's mother (Carmentia) - role of two important local families (Potitii and Pinarii) in the administration of this cult - the one foreign cult that Romulus adopted. 	5	<p>Two discrete points with detail from the myth of Evander and Hercules needed - some examples provided but other viable answers possible.</p> <p>For top mark, candidates are expected to make reference to Evander AND Hercules</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AOI = 5 Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p>
2	<p>A01 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Romulus is inspecting the army near the Caprean marsh • Storm blew up and covered the king with a thick cloud so that he became invisible 	4	<p>Answers here need to be drawn from the Livy passage: possible responses could be those provided – two explained details are needed. Candidates do not have to mention all to gain full marks.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AO2 = 4</p>

Question		Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
2	b)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When the cloud lifted the throne was empty and Romulus had been lifted up to heaven - he had been deified. <p>A02 UNDERSTANDING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Divinity/ deification – ‘he deserved to be a God’/ ‘was a God born from a God’ (a figurehead and a god to worship) Founder of Rome – ‘they saluted Romulus as Father of the city of Rome’ (created a stable constitution) Good ruler – ‘saluted Romulus as King’/he was the one to ‘inspect the army’/ ‘Romulus would want to care for his descendants always’ (established an army to defend Rome). 	4	<p>Level 5 - 4 Level 4 - 3 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p> <p>Reward highly any discussion which demonstrates understanding of the importance of Romulus and how this links in with the early history of Rome: some suggestions are made – reward plausible discussion which uses relevant details and makes viable points.</p> <p>A02 = 4 Level 5 - 4 Level 4 - 3 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p>
2	c)	<p>A03 EVALUATION OF SOURCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relevant details from the passage When Livy was writing – late 1st century BC 	5	<p>General discussion of the value of Livy should be rewarded (some suggestions in the indicative content) however for the higher bands answers must focus on this passage and consider how Livy could have known the details contained in it.</p> <p>A03 = 5</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
3 a)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Context of his writing – the Augustan age where a renewed interest in the foundation myth was relevant and important • there may be reference to Livy's possible sources - Fabius Pictor, Piso, Macer - and archaeological evidence: reward highly if accurate and relevant. <p>AO1 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a family connection/ legitimacy - he was the grandson of Hostilius who 'had fought the Sabines in the famous battle for the citadel' • personal qualities – ' more warlike than Romulus'/ youth and strength' 'courage' • vision about the state of Rome – 'he thought that the state was getting weak because of inactivity'.. • and what to do about it – 'he looked around for a reason to start a war' 	4	<p>Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p> <p>Need for factual details about the description of Tullus Hostilius' accession taken from the Livy passage - a number of possible details are suggested but reward other relevant and justifiable details.</p> <p>AO1 = 4 Level 5 - 4 Level 4 - 3 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Diplomatic skills/ cunning – ‘ordered his men to carry out the demands as quickly as possible, because he knew the Albans would refuse’ • Factual details about the source: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - When Livy was writing – late 1st century BC (ie 6 centuries later) - Context of his writing – the Augustan age where a renewed interest in the foundation myth was relevant and important. <p>A02 UNDERSTANDING</p> <p>See the first part of each of the A01 points in the development of the factual details:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Family connection/ legitimacy • Military skill/ prowess • Personal qualities • Vision about the state of Rome and what to do about it. 	5	<p>Need for understanding of the context, meaning and significance of the details identified in AO1: possible answers that students could explore are suggested - do not need all for full marks.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">AO2 = 5 Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
3 b)	<p>A03 EVALUATION OF SOURCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevant details from the passage – Tullus is presented in a positive light: some discussion as to why Livy might do this • When Livy was writing – late 1st century BC (ie 6 centuries later) • Context of his writing – the Augustan age where a renewed interest in the foundation myth was relevant and important • there may be reference to Livy's possible sources - Fabius Pictor, Piso, Macer - and archaeological evidence: reward highly if accurate and relevant. <p>A01 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <p><u>Tullus</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • relevant details from the passage (Livy 1.22) – Tullus' background/ warlike nature/ Albans as an excuse for war • details from the rest of Livy 1.22 – 1.29: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - war against the Albans but also Tullus' diplomatic skills here/fights between Horatii and Curiatii (1.23-5) 	5	<p>Evaluation of Livy as a source - the passage, though short, has some relevant detail: expect some discussion as to how Livy would have known about these details and what sources Livy would have consulted or just accepted in writing his history.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">A03 = 5 Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p> <p>Expect significant reference to Livy that is the key ancient source here - this must be made relevant to the question asked: some useful areas to look for and reward are suggested.</p> <p>Also expect reference to Virgil - not much here but 'other sources' are stipulated in the question so highest levels of marks cannot be awarded unless some reference is made: key Aeneid extracts are suggested.</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 'peace with the Albans did not last/ Fidenae/ eventual victory and execution of Mettius (1.27-1.29) • Detail from Virgil (Aeneid 8.644/ 6.812) <p><u>Romulus</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevant details from the passage (Livy 1.22) – Romulus' warlike nature • Romulus' success in starting and successfully finishing other wars - details from other parts of Livy: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - War with the Sabines and other tribes (1.9 – 1.13) - War with the Fidenates and Veii (1.14-15) • Detail from Virgil (Aeneid 6.777-783) • Factual details about the sources: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - When Livy and Virgil were writing – late 1st century BC (6 centuries later) / poetry and prose - Context of this writing – the Augustan age where a renewed interest in the foundation myth was relevant and important. <p>A02 UNDERSTANDING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Developing the details from A01 and with focus 		<p>Reference to <u>both</u> kings need to be made for award of highest marks.</p> <p>A01 = 5 Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p> <p>Responses need to focus on 'military leadership' and make the distinction between Romulus and Tullus to</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>on the understanding of 'military leadership' and explanation as to how each of the kings did/ did not meet success here</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Romulus and Tullus were very much good military leaders and saw this as a key strategy in strengthening Rome - Candidates may explore the different nature/ context of this 'military leadership' (ie. Romulus as a founder/ Tullus as 'expander') <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explanation as to how the different sources present the kings and why this could be significant – ie. all described fully by Livy but is omitted by Virgil. <p>A03 EVALUATION OF SOURCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • understanding of when Livy and Virgil were writing (seven centuries later) and how this may have affected what they wrote ---- recent Roman history of the Civil Wars in which powerful individuals had emerged and upset the balance of power - context of the Augustan age and trying to present the early kings as strong, noble figures 	5	<p>access highest marks.</p> <p>Reward any reference to Numa if made in a relevant way</p> <p style="text-align: right;">A02 = 5 Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p> <p>Detailed evaluation of Livy and Virgil and the conditions in which they were writing: there is considerable amount of detail here which is useful and helps build a considerable picture.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">A03 = 8 Level 5 – 7-8 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5 Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • reward discussion of Livy’s Preface in an attempt to understand his motives in writing and presenting Roman history in this way. <p>AO1 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>the story of Aeneas</u> - key aspects of this according to Livy (Livy, 1.3) and the link to Rome: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Aeneas, son of Anchises (and Aeneas’ son Ascanius) and Venus left Troy and after many travels (Carthage etc.) arrived in Laurentum - Aeneas married Lavinia daughter of King Latinus and founded city of Lavinium - war against Turnus (Rutulians) and the Etruscans: ‘Latins’ won but Aeneas killed - Developments after Aeneas’ death: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Differing accounts about Ascanius/lulus, founder of Alba Longa - the kings of Alba (Silvius to Amulius) and the rape of Rhea Silva leading to the birth of ‘the twins’ and 	8	<p>Key aspects/ events of Aeneas’ life according to Livy (and Virgil) with relevant details: <u>answers need to focus on the role of Aeneas and its presentation in the narratives.</u></p> <p>Some of the key themes/ details are suggested and students would be expected to cover most - but not all - of these themes for highest marks.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">AO1 = 10 Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5 Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p style="text-align: center;">eventual foundation of Rome</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <u>the story of Aeneas</u> - key aspects of the story according to Virgil (Virgil 1.1-11) and also (6.752-772): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 'Savage Juno' forces Aeneas' exile from Troy with his father Anchises and son Ascanius (wife/mother Creusa died) - Founded his city in, and brought his gods, to Latium - links to Alba and then through to Rome's foundation • some definition of <u>myth</u>: ie.the story of Aeneas and the link to Rome: the heroic/ mythical qualities ascribed to Aeneas by both sources • Knowledge of when and the context within which Livy and Virgil were both writing/ possible reliance upon earlier writing of Fabius Pictor but also for Livy some reference to the Preface: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ...' <i>passed down in a way more suitable for the stories of poets than an authentic historical record of what happened and I don't intend to prove it right or wrong</i> - '<i>...be allowed to mix human events with supernatural ones since it makes the origins</i> 		

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p style="text-align: center;"><i>of the city more impressive'</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Archaeological evidence – images of Aeneas on the Ara Pacis. <p>A02 UNDERSTANDING</p> <p>→ Arguments to suggest that Aeneas was a figure of myth:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Virgil's/ Livy's presentation as a heroic exile from Troy whose destiny was decided by the Gods ('savage Juno's' anger) • Focus on Aeneas' divinity (his mother Venus and his lineage including Romulus' divinity) • Livy's admission in the Preface that human events are mixed with supernatural ones/ what he is writing is not necessarily a strict historical record • Development/ explanation of context within which Virgil and Livy are writing – a desire to present the Augustan present within an heroic past/ foundation myth: a position which was encouraged/ manipulated by official/ imperial support (links with Romulus/ Remus and Mars that emerged later?) <p>→ Arguments to suggest that Aeneas was a real historical figure:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The 'Trojan link' may well connect with the early Greek expansion of the 8th century BC (based on Fabius Pictor?) 	10	<p>Answers must use the information from AO1 to present <u>an explanation and make a judgement</u> within the context of the question - ie. to link description/ details/ presentation of the Aeneas story as a mythical figure and/or a historical figure (some possible themes are suggested).</p> <p>This is a debate and highest marks can only be awarded if this is addressed.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">A02 = 10 Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5 Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • reference needed to Lucius Tarquinius Priscus, Lucius Tarquinius Superbus and Tarquinius Sextus • Positive contribution: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Priscus increased the size of the Senate, successful war against the Sabines and 'ancient Latins', construction projects (Livy 1.38 : drainage/planning - Circus Maximus/ fortification/ forum/ temple of Jupiter) - Superbus' success in foreign policy (Volscii/ Gabii /Aequii), attributed construction (cloaca maxima/ circus maximus/ the forum - Livy 1.56) • Negative contribution: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Priscus' 'trickery' of removing Ancus' sons, arrogance (Livy,1.36) - Superbus 'lawless and tyrannical' (Livy 1.52)/ 'leading citizens killed' (Livy 1.56) and Tarquinius Sextus' rape of Lucretia (Livy 1.58), 'robbery and violence' in Gabii (Livy 1.59) • Actions which resulted in the foundation of the Republic • relevant sections of Livy (as above but reward other accurate references) and details of when Livy (and Virgil if mentioned) was writing 	10	<p>The factual details need to refer to Tarquinius Priscus, Tarquinius Superbus and Sextus: these will be mostly found in Livy although there are small references in Virgil. Do not expect Virgil references but reward highly if seen.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AO1 = 10 Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5 Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> credit highly any responses that make reference to Virgil 6: 819-821 and the response of Rome's ruling class to Tarquin rule - 'the glorious name of liberty'. <p>A02 UNDERSTANDING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Using, and expanding upon, the details in A01 to develop an argument based on positive and negative aspects of the Tarquin rule. <p>A03 EVALUATION OF SOURCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> despite attempting a historical explanation of the events of early Rome, Livy's views would have been shaped by the events of his own times: linking with AO2, candidates will need to analyse the reliability and aims of Livy - reward fully any 	10	<p>In order to access the highest mark bands responses need to address the assumption in the question that a positive achievement was made by the Tarquins – this needs to be balanced by an assessment of the negative aspects and a judgement made.</p> <p>Look for quality of argument and judgement here and reward accordingly.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AO2 = 10 Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p> <p>Answers should discuss the aims of Livy in presenting the history of early Rome in this particular way and the accuracy and reliability as evidence here: reward any reference to other forms of evidence - most likely to be archaeological - but this is not necessary for students to reach highest mark levels.</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>development of reference to and discussion of Livy's Preface and its focus on moral issues (corruption of the Tarquins) as a reason for success or failure (and influence of the moral recovery attempted by Augustus)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • in evaluating Livy as evidence, credit highly responses that make some assessment of Livy's own sources and a judgement as to accuracy of what he was writing. Credit highly any illustration of argument with reference to archaeological evidence - links to AO1: the Temple of Jupiter, Cloaca Maxima - as Livy attempts to put these into an historical context • judgement in answer to the question: using information from AO1, candidates need to make the case how Livy's aims in the Preface are/ are not supported in the detail/ descriptions he gives from the stories chosen. 	10	<p>AO3 = 10 Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5 Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p>

OPTION 2 - SECTION B

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
6	<p>A01 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hannibal's hatred of the Romans inherited from his father • Carthage's desire for revenge after defeat in the first Punic War • Treaty of Ebro • Rivalry of Carthage and Rome over Sicily and the Western Mediterranean more generally • Rivalry over the city of Saguntum – initially allied with Rome and its independence agreed by treaty but its capture by Hannibal in 219 BC quickened the moves to war. 	5	<p>Two discrete reasons with development that explain the beginning of the war between Rome and Carthage in 218 BC - some examples provided but other viable answers possible.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AOI = 5 Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p>
7	<p>a) A01 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Long march/ short time upstream along the banks of the Rhone river • Unmolested – 'All the various tribal chiefs of the Allobroges had kept well clear of him' • Reputation – the Allobroges 'were terrified of his cavalry and their barbarian escort'. 	4	<p>Answers here need to be drawn from the Polybius passage: possible responses could be those provided – two explained details are needed. Candidates do not have to mention all to gain full marks.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AO2 = 4 Level 5 - 4 Level 4 - 3 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p>

Question		Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
7	b)	<p>A02 UNDERSTANDING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Loss of protection - the barbarian escort ' had departed for their homelands' • Geography changed – Hannibal's army 'had begun to move into much more difficult terrain' • A galvanised enemy – 'the Allobroges gathered a considerable force' • Enemy tactics – 'seized commanding positions ahead of the route'/ 'occupied key points ahead'/ 'guarding their positions in a thoroughly disciplined fashion'. 	4	<p>Reward any discussion which demonstrates understanding as to why the journey became more difficult : some suggestions are made – reward plausible discussion which uses relevant details and makes viable points.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">AO2 = 4 Level 5 - 4 Level 4 - 3 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p>
7	c)	<p>A03 EVALUATION OF SOURCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Relevant details from the passage • When Polybius was writing – early second century BC • Context of his writing – born after the end of the 2nd war: some suggestion that he may have talked to veterans and have travelled the 	5	<p>General discussion of the value of Polybius should be rewarded (some suggestions in the indicative content) however for the higher bands answers must focus on this passage and consider how he could have known the details contained in it.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">AO3 = 5 Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
8 a)	<p>routes that Hannibal took.</p> <p>AO1 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <p>→details taken from the Livy passage:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hannibal’s deception regarding the land belonging to Fabius – left ‘absolutely untouched by fire, sword and enemy devastation, while all the surrounding land was utterly destroyed’ • The agreement over the exchange of prisoners – delay in payment for the Roman captives which was blamed on Fabius • Factual details about Livy as a source: when he was writing/ motives for this. <p>AO2 UNDERSTANDING</p> <p>→need to develop the details in A01 with an explanation as to how this would make the Romans so critical of Fabius:</p>	<p>4</p> <p>5</p>	<p>Need for factual details about the description of the attitudes towards Fabius taken from the Livy passage - a number of possible details are suggested but reward other relevant and justifiable details.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AO1 = 4 Level 5 - 4 Level 4 - 3 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p> <p>It is important that the details taken from the Livy passage are set in context and an explanation is given as to how these events are likely to lead to a difficult relationship between consul and Senate/People.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AO2 = 5</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The comparison with Minicius becomes a useful contrast with the frustration some Romans felt at Fabius’ inaction/ disengagement • Hannibal’s policy of sparing Fabius’ land was designed to promote distrust/ resentment at Fabius’ possible motives/ relationship with the Carthaginians • The difficulties associated with the prisoner exchange reveals the nature of the tension between Fabius and the Senate. <p>A03 EVALUATION OF SOURCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Evaluation of Livy as a source – ie. what he actually tells us and how reliable these are likely to be. • the passage is quite detailed: building on details in A01, some discussion is needed as to how would Livy have known about these details. What sources – eg. Polybius, Pictor, state records - would Livy have consulted or just accepted in writing his history. 	5	<p>Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p> <p>Reward highly responses that make some assessment of the accuracy and reliability of Livy as a source here: - are these details likely to be accurate? - what aims does Livy have in writing history? - useful discussion on page 130/131 of text book which some students may make reference to: reward highly any indications here.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">AO3 = 5 Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
8 b)	<p>AO1 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Details taken from the Livy passage: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - He was not successful: division within SPQR/ destruction of the countryside - Hannibal's saw him as a threat and so used then 'treacherous deception' - Exchange of prisoners • Details from elsewhere in Livy (23.1)(23.2) – leadership/success of Fabius • Cannae as a turning point in attitude to Fabian strategy/tactics (some definition of these): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Plutarch 5.1- 5.6 gives a range of explanation as to the range and efficacy of Fabius' tactics and strategy (particularly 5.3) - Polybius 3, 87.6 – 89.9 also gives greater depth to the success of the Fabian strategy • Factual details about the sources: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ When Polybius, Livy, Plutarch and were writing – 2nd century BC/late 1st century BC/ 2nd century AD respectively ○ Context of this writing – each had different motives for writing. 	5	<p>There is some information from Livy (the passage and just before the selected text): Polybius and Plutarch provide a much wider range of information – key references are suggested. Highest marks can only be awarded if wider sources are used.</p> <p style="text-align: right;"> AO1 = 5 Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1 </p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>A02 UNDERSTANDING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development of the details identified in A01- and reaching the conclusion that Fabian tactics were successful in defending Italy against Hannibal. • Short-term setbacks/ longer-term gains post Cannae <p>A03 EVALUATION OF SOURCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • evaluation of Polybius, Livy and Plutarch needed here: need to build on A01 - when were they writing and what purposes did they have for writing 	5	<p>The question requires some judgement on Fabius' success here: straightforward responses will make a judgement purely based on what the sources tell us about Fabius – responses can access the highest mark levels if this is done well.</p> <p>More sophisticated answers may well look at:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the inconsistent role Fabius played (ie. replaced by Varro just before Cannae) but then reappointed - also the mistakes of Hannibal (not taking Rome etc.): reward as appropriate. <p style="text-align: right;">AO2 = 5 Level 5 - 5 Level 4 - 3/4 Level 3 - 2 Level 1/2 - 0/1</p> <p>Candidates should be discussing Livy and at least one other for top band</p> <p>Evaluation of the sources necessary with links to</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
9	<p>– ‘Polybius/ Livy the historians versus Plutarch the biographer’: contrasts/ comparisons that are revealed between the two</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Plutarch : when writing and the context of this (later 1st century AD) possible motives/ aims in writing – admiration for ‘the idea of Rome’; a biographer rather than a historian with emphasis on a dramatised, moralistic view of his subject ○ Polybius when writing (early second century BC) and context of this – born after the end of the 2nd war: some suggestion that he may have talked to veterans and have travelled the routes that Hannibal took ○ Livy when writing (late 1st century BC) and context of this – the Augustan age. 	8	<p>relevant details in the passage or to the discussion. Some guidelines suggested.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">AO3 = 8 Level 5 - 8 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5 Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p>
	<p>AO1 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cannae <p>- Carthaginian success re choice of position and terrain (sun and wind both adversely affected Romans - Livy 22, 46-7 but this <u>not</u> described in Polybius)</p> <p>- the composition, armour and placement of the respective armies eg. Hannibal anticipating</p>	10	<p>Factual details that need to focus on the two battles and Hannibal’s role in these – some suggestions from both Polybius and Livy provided.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">AO1 = 10 Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>Roman tactics and Africans equipped with 'Roman armour and weapons... captured in previous battles' (Livy 22, 45-6)</p> <p>- initial Roman infantry success against Carthaginian centre of Gauls/ Spanish developed into encirclement by Africans (Livy 22, 47) and then Roman cavalry outwitted by Numidian 'treachery' (Livy 22, 48)</p> <p>- 'the rout became universal' with Romans seeking unsatisfactory refuge in the two camps and the village of Cannae which 'lacked fortifications' caused increased casualties (Livy 22, 49.13)</p> <p>- Levels of casualties (Polybius says 70,000 Livy says about 50,000)</p> <p>• TRASIMENE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Hannibal' understanding of Flaminius' 'defect of character' (Livy 22.3) ○ The preparation of the trap – narrow path, troop concentrations to block the Romans between the lake and the mountains but dispersal/ hiding of the rest (Livy 22.4/ Polybius 3.83) ○ Use of the mist (Livy 22.5/ Polybius 3.84) ○ Levels of casualties – both Polybius and 		<p>Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>Livy suggest 15,000 Romans killed.</p> <p>AO2 UNDERSTANDING</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • military success at Trasimene and Cannae as a means of comparing/ contrasting Hannibal’s skill as a military commander emphasis here should not be on the details of each individual battle but <u>an understanding as to how the details address the question</u>: examples from individual battles to be used to support these points: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Hannibal's grasp of strategy and skills of generalship: use of terrain/ conditions/ forces to best Carthaginian advantage ○ flexibility, diversity and quality of Carthaginian army ○ Hannibal’s judge of character and understanding of the psychological/ personal weaknesses of his military opponents ○ failures of Roman strategies and generalship – eg. tension/ contrast in character between consuls on key occasions - as an additional factor not reliant on Hannibal’s own qualities?. <p>AO3 EVALUATION OF SOURCE</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the sources provide considerable detail on the 	10	<p>The emphasis should be here on addressing the question not merely describing the battles: there is no straightforward answer – reward highly responses that look for common themes and make viable judgements.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AO2 = 10 Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5 Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p> <p>Need to evaluate Livy and Polybius as sources here - the evidence that these sources may have had access to, the</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
10	<p>reasons for Carthaginian victory in the two battles and give some focus on Hannibal's qualities as a military commander</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • with sources that are used for the first part of the essay, higher marks should be awarded for those that discuss accuracy and reliability <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Polybius lived just after these events: travelled extensively and was able to talk to participants ○ Livy writing much later relied fairly heavily on Polybius and other earlier sources: considerable overlap/ similarity between the two ○ analysis of the purposes/aims that the different writers had for presenting the events/ personalities/ explanations in particular ways to be rewarded. <p>AO1 FACTUAL DETAILS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 'limitless supplies and inexhaustible manpower' <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Carthage focused resources on the army in Spain after Cannae which limited resources reaching Hannibal in Italian peninsula - defeat of Hasdrubal at Ibera in 215 (Livy 	10	<p>reasons for and context within which these authors are writing.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AO3 = 10 Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5 Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p> <p>Factual details that need to be relevant to the question – some details provided but reward any other relevant, accurate factual information here.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AO1 = 10 Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>23.28-9 and 24.48)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Rome regained military strength through rapidly rebuilding her manpower (stringent measures here – Livy 22.11 after Trasimene/ 23.14 after Cannae/ Polybius 3.118) and maintaining naval superiority <p>• Other factors</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - returned to Fabius' delaying tactics after Cannae which undermined Carthaginian military strengths and neutralised Hannibal's effectiveness in Italy (Plutarch, Fabius 5.1-5.4) - role of Scipio Africanus: personal and military qualities/ alliance with Numidians (Masinissa)/ strategic confidence in crossing from Sicily and taking the war to Carthage/ his generalship at Zama which turned the tables on Hannibal (Polybius 10.2-3/ 14.1-11/15.1-18) - the growing failure of Hannibal's campaign in Italy after Cannae as he failed to take Rome, failed to break apart the 'Italian confederation' and despite some isolated successes became bogged down in a war of attrition and was eventually forced on the defensive - inability of Carthage to reinforce the army in Italy after the loss of Spain /death of Hasdrubal in 207/ Mago in 205 - failure of Carthaginian attempts to widen the war to bring greater pressure to bear on Rome - 		<p>Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>interventions in Sardinia/ Macedon/ Sicily failed</p> <p>- role of Hannibal; despite some acknowledged brilliance (in the sources) at Zama, ultimately he was outthought and outfought by Scipio (Livy 22.30-35 and Polybius 9.24-6/ 11.19)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • knowledge of the relevant sources - most likely Livy 22.51 and 30-35 (exceptionally some might make reference to Polybius). <p>A02 UNDERSTANDING</p> <p>This is a very wide-ranging question which is attempting to seek candidates' understanding of the reasons as to why the war ended as it did – with a Roman victory. Although a number of approaches are possible the stated factors must be addressed if responses are to reach the higher mark levels.</p> <p>The best answers will take a longer term view looking at a range of factors (as suggested in AO1) and then make a judgement as to relative importance</p> <p>Candidates may well take a shorter term view and reward these responses as appropriate.</p> <p>A03 EVALUATION OF SOURCES</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • there needs to be some discussion and evaluation of how accurate and reliable the sources are: 	10	<p>The question needs to be addressed and then judgement made as to whether the stated factors in the question were more or less important than other factors in the final victory.</p> <p>AO2 = 10 Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5 Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p> <p>Expect the majority of responses to focus primarily on Livy – if done well this should not preclude candidates reaching the higher mark bands.</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	<p>→ LIVY</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - lived well after the events that he is describing here AND the context in which he was writing (ie. Augustan period and wish to present events in a particular way) - unlike Polybius, he did not travel to places he was writing about - relied on earlier sources such as Polybius: certainly Polybius books 14 and 15 would support much of Livy's views and the importance of Scipio in the final Roman victory but Livy may well just be reiterating Polybius' conclusions here <p>• POLYBIUS</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - reference to aspects of Polybius' life and method of writing - although born after these events, these were within living memory - he travelled widely and was able to interview persons who could have been present at or have memory of these events (ie. use of Philinus and Fabius Pictor); - intentions in writing: to present to a Greek audience the inevitability of Roman success / also may over-emphasise the role and success of Scipio <p>• PLUTARCH</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - some coverage is needed of when Plutarch is writing and the context of this (late 1st /early 2nd century AD) - possible motives/ aims in writing – admiration for 'the 	10	<p>There is also very good material in Polybius and Plutarch.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">AO3 = 10</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Level 5 - 8-10 Level 4 - 6-7 Level 3 - 4-5 Level 2 - 2-3 Level 1 - 0-1</p>

Question	Answer/Indicative content	Mark	Guidance
	idea of Rome' - a biographer rather than a historian with emphasis on a dramatised, moralistic view of his subject.		

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
The Triangle Building
Shaftesbury Road
Cambridge
CB2 8EA

OCR Customer Contact Centre

Education and Learning

Telephone: 01223 553998

Facsimile: 01223 552627

Email: general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk

www.ocr.org.uk

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored

Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations
is a Company Limited by Guarantee
Registered in England
Registered Office; The Triangle Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8EA
Registered Company Number: 3484466
OCR is an exempt Charity

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
Head office
Telephone: 01223 552552
Facsimile: 01223 552553

© OCR 2018

