Friday 25 May 2018 – Afternoon

AS GCE CRITICAL THINKING

F502/01 Assessing and Developing Argument
F502/02

Candidates answer Section A on the Answer Sheet and Sections B and C on the Question Paper.

OCR supplied materials:
• Answer Sheet for Section A Multiple Choice
• Resource Booklet (F502/01/02/RB)

Other materials required:
None

Duration: 1 hour 30 minutes

Candidate forename

Candidate surname

Centre number

Candidate number

INSTRUCTIONS TO CANDIDATES

• Write your name, centre number and candidate number in the boxes above. Please write clearly and in capital letters.
• Use black ink. HB pencil may be used for graphs and diagrams only.
• Answer all the questions.
• Read each question carefully. Make sure you know what you have to do before starting your answer.
• Answer Section A, Questions 1–15, on the Answer Sheet provided. You are advised to spend no more than 20 minutes on Section A.
• On completion of Section A move directly on to Sections B and C.
• Answer Sections B and C in the spaces provided on the Question Paper.
• Write your answer to each question in the space provided. If additional space is required, you should use the lined page(s) at the end of this booklet. The question number(s) must be clearly shown.
• Additional paper may also be used if necessary.
• Do not write in the barcodes.

INFORMATION FOR CANDIDATES

• The number of marks is given in brackets [ ] at the end of each question or part question.
• The total number of marks for this paper is 75. Section A comprises 20% of the available marks, Sections B and C comprise 80% of the available marks.
• Quality of written communication will be assessed in Section C.
• The information contained in the Resource Booklet was accurate when it went to press, but may subsequently have changed. Questions should be answered on the basis that the information is correct.
• This document consists of 20 pages. Any blank pages are indicated.
2

Section A: Multiple Choice

Answer all questions in this section using the separate answer sheet provided.

You are advised to spend no more than 20 minutes on this section of the paper.

Questions 1 and 2 refer to the following passage:

A report produced by a conference of head teachers argues that students and teachers should run a mile first thing in the morning. The benefits claimed are that it would increase everyone’s fitness and health and, more importantly, that concentration and discipline are improved after exercise. Having read the report, the Minister of Education commented that the run, with both teachers and students, would not be that easy to organise, but she did appreciate the importance of listening to the advice of head teachers on issues faced by them in schools.

1 What is the name given to the following argument element in the above passage?
   ‘The run, with both teachers and students, would not be that easy to organise.’

   (a) counter-argument
   (b) counter-assertion
   (c) counter-conclusion
   (d) counter-reason

[1]

2 Which of the following is an appeal made in the above passage?

   (a) appeal to authority
   (b) appeal to emotion
   (c) appeal to popularity
   (d) appeal to tradition

[1]
Questions 3, 4 and 5 refer to the following passage:

Drivers of London black taxicabs are not awarded their licence until they have passed “the knowledge”: an exam testing their “knowledge” of London’s streets and places of interest. There are many who claim that this requirement is now out-of-date because there is no need to try and memorise information about routes and streets. All you have to do is enter the postcode of your destination into a Sat Nav and it will guide you to take the best route. However, such claims are wrong; many of those who use taxis in London are foreign tourists who may not know the postcode of the place they want to go to, and licensed taxicab drivers know where they are going in London without the need for postcodes.

3 Which is the main conclusion of the above argument?

(a) However, such claims are wrong.
(b) There are many who claim that this requirement is now out-of-date.
(c) There is no need to memorise information about routes and streets.
(d) Tourists may not know the postcode of the place they want to go to.

[1]

4 What further piece of information would most weaken the above argument?

(a) Not all those who use London black taxicabs are foreign tourists.
(b) The college which used to teach the “knowledge” to drivers of London black taxicabs closed down in 2015.
(c) There are ways of programming Sat Navs that don’t require postcodes.
(d) Very few people pass the test to become a driver of London black taxicabs.

[1]

5 Which of the following is an assumption in the above argument?

(a) Drivers of London black taxicabs remember “the knowledge” after passing the test.
(b) Most people who use London black taxicabs are foreign tourists.
(c) Sat Nav systems are unreliable.
(d) You operate Sat Navs by entering the post code of your destination.

[1]
Questions 6, 7 and 8 refer to the following passage:

Every year, hundreds of people in Britain suffer because they live near a river which bursts its banks and floods their homes. Understandably, they complain that the authorities should do more by way of flood prevention. They may have been told that flooding should only happen every 100 years, so if their homes are flooded twice in 10 years, they feel they have been misled. However, we should not require authorities to erect flood barriers beside rivers. For one thing, people who live by rivers would not want their view of the river blocked by a high wall. Moreover, since it is impossible to predict which precise areas will get unusually high rainfall in the coming years, the authorities would have to spend a large amount building high walls beside all rivers.

6 Which of the following is an intermediate conclusion of the above argument?

(a) Every year, hundreds of people in Britain suffer.
(b) If their homes are flooded twice in 10 years, they feel they have been misled.
(c) The authorities would have to spend a large amount building high walls beside all rivers.
(d) We should not require authorities to erect flood barriers beside rivers.

7 What is the name of the following argument element in the above passage?

‘For one thing, people who live by rivers would not want their view of the river blocked by a high wall.’

(a) evidence
(b) explanation
(c) principle
(d) reason

8 Which of the following, if true, would strengthen the above argument?

(a) Erecting flood barriers along river banks increases the chances of flooding downstream.
(b) Every year, 10,000 homes are built on flood plains in Britain.
(c) People who live near rivers pay much higher home insurance.
(d) When people are evacuated from flooded homes, there is an increased risk of looting.
Questions 9, 10 and 11 refer to the following passage:

Our education and examination system, from primary school through to secondary school, spends far too much time and effort requiring students to memorise facts. Thanks to the internet and mobile phones, we are only a few clicks away from being able to find out almost any fact we might need, so there is no special merit in memorising facts. What education should be doing is concentrating on developing students’ skills. For example, it is very useful to be fluent in English and modern foreign languages, and to be able to understand scientific, mathematical and logical reasoning.

9 Which of the following is an assumption in the above argument?

(a) Modern foreign languages are useful.
(b) More time should be spent teaching modern foreign languages in primary schools.
(c) Most people can easily access the internet.
(d) People find memorising facts boring.

10 Which of the following is a further conclusion that could be drawn from the above passage?

(a) Calculators on mobile phones have made mathematic skills irrelevant.
(b) More time in schools should be devoted to improving students’ skills.
(c) Schools must be supplied with high speed broadband and mobile phone coverage for students.
(d) Teachers need to be retrained.

11 ‘It is not possible to do well at university without demonstrating a number of skills.’

How does this additional claim, if true, affect the above argument?

(a) It both strengthens and weakens the argument.
(b) It neither strengthens nor weakens the argument.
(c) It strengthens the argument.
(d) It weakens the argument.
Questions 12, 13, 14 and 15 refer to the following passage:

Whenever a new road is planned, the proposals meet with objection from people who will be directly affected. It is as though they are saying, “My own interests are more important than those of the country.” In the end, we must not let the vested interests of the few become what prevents Britain from developing the transport links we need. Britain is competing in a global economy, one which we originally started! In the 19th century it was the roads and canals that enabled Britain’s industries to thrive and to trade across the world. Britain’s roads and canals once established the global economy, and new roads will ensure we keep our place within the global economy. Narrow congested roads lead to increases in pollution, accidents, and costs.

12 What is the main conclusion of the above passage?

(a) Narrow congested roads lead to increases in pollution, accidents, and costs.

(b) New roads will ensure we keep our place within the global economy.

(c) We must not let the vested interests of the few become what prevents Britain from developing the transport links we need.

(d) Whenever a new road is planned, the proposals meet with objection from people who will be directly affected.

13 Which of the following is an appeal made in the above passage?

(a) appeal to emotion

(b) appeal to history

(c) appeal to popularity

(d) appeal to tradition

14 In the passage the author draws an analogy between building new roads in the present day and the roads and canals that were built in the 19th century. Which of the following is the best statement of the weakness in the analogy in the above argument?

(a) Building 19th century roads and canals was cheaper, and caused less pollution, than building new roads now.

(b) Many of the companies that built new transport links in the 19th century ended up going bankrupt.

(c) New roads, like 19th century roads and canals, may be necessary for trade but they cannot guarantee it.

(d) The important contribution of railways to 19th century trade is ignored.
15 Which of the following flaws is present in the above passage?

(a) Hasty generalisation

(b) Slippery slope

(c) Straw man

(d) Tu quoque

[1]
SECTION B – Analysing and evaluating argument

Answer all questions.

Read the passage on the Resource Booklet.

For all parts of questions 16 and 17, you should use the exact words of the author.

16 State the main conclusion of the argument.

..........................................................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................................................... [2]

17 (a) State one principle used.

..........................................................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................................................... [2]

(b) State one intermediate conclusion used in Paragraphs 1–4.

..........................................................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................................................... [2]

(c) State one counter-assertion used.

..........................................................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................................................... [2]

18 Re-read Paragraph 3.

(a) State whether Paragraph 3 is an argument, or a counter argument or an explanation.

............................................................................................................................................................ [1]

(b) Justify your answer with reference to the text. You may do this by justifying why it is not either of the other two options.

..........................................................................................................................................................
..................................................................................................................................................... [3]
19 Paragraph 5 contains a flaw.

(a) Name the flaw.

..............................................................................................................................................[1]

(b) Explain why the author’s reasoning is flawed. You should refer to the text and clearly show why there is a problem with the author’s reasoning.

...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................[2]

20 Paragraph 2 claims:

‘Currently 7.5 million cars in Britain are regularly parked on the street outside their owners’ homes. If councils were to charge their owners £100 per year to do this, it would raise £750 million per year.’

(a) Identify the underlying assumption of this calculation.

...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................[1]

(b) Explain how it weakens the author’s reasoning.

...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................[2]
In paragraph 4, there is an analogy.

(a) Identify precisely the situations being compared in the analogy. You must make at least three points of comparison.

• ................................................................................................................... corresponds to ............................................................................................................................................... 

• ................................................................................................................... corresponds to ............................................................................................................................................... 

• ................................................................................................................... corresponds to ...................................................................................................................................... [3]

(b) Explain one weakness in the analogy. You must explain clearly the impact on the author’s reasoning.

...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
.............................................................................................................................................. [3]
22 In paragraph 6, there is an appeal.

(a) Name the appeal.
..............................................................................................................................................[1]

(b) Explain whether using the appeal supports the author’s argument. You should refer to the text.
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
...................................................................................................................................................
..............................................................................................................................................[2]

23 Explain to what extent there is an inconsistency between the reasoning in Paragraphs 1 and 2, on the one hand, and Paragraphs 5 and 6 on the other.
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
..........................................................................................................................................................
.....................................................................................................................................................[3]
SECTION C – Developing Your Own Arguments

Answer all questions.

24 ‘The government should increase the tax on petrol and diesel.’

Write your own argument to support or challenge this claim.

Marks will be given for a well-structured, sustained and developed argument. You should include:

• a main conclusion
• an intermediate conclusion
• at least three reasons

Your argument may contain other argument elements. You may use information and ideas from the passage but you must use them to form a new argument. No credit will be given for repeating the arguments in the passage. [12]
25 ‘Sat Navs should warn drivers when they are about to approach speed cameras.’

(a) Give two reasons of your own to support this claim.
You must give only a reason and not add other argument elements.

Reason 1
.............................................................................................................................................. [2]

Reason 2
.............................................................................................................................................. [2]

(b) Give one reason of your own to challenge this claim.
You must only give a reason and not add other argument elements.
.............................................................................................................................................. [2]
‘Anyone who breaks the speed limit should receive a very large fine.’

Write your own argument to support or challenge this claim.

Marks will be given for a well-structured, sustained and developed argument. You should include:

- a main conclusion
- a counter-argument and response
- at least two reasons

Your argument may contain other argument elements. You may use information and ideas from the passage but you must use them to form a new argument. No credit will be given for repeating the arguments in the passage.