



Oxford Cambridge and RSA

GCE

Classical Civilisation

H408/34: Democracy and the Athenians

Advanced GCE

Mark Scheme for November 2020

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA) is a leading UK awarding body, providing a wide range of qualifications to meet the needs of candidates of all ages and abilities. OCR qualifications include AS/A Levels, Diplomas, GCSEs, Cambridge Nationals, Cambridge Technicals, Functional Skills, Key Skills, Entry Level qualifications, NVQs and vocational qualifications in areas such as IT, business, languages, teaching/training, administration and secretarial skills.

It is also responsible for developing new specifications to meet national requirements and the needs of students and teachers. OCR is a not-for-profit organisation; any surplus made is invested back into the establishment to help towards the development of qualifications and support, which keep pace with the changing needs of today's society.













This mark scheme is published as an aid to teachers and students, to indicate the requirements of the examination. It shows the basis on which marks were awarded by examiners. It does not indicate the details of the discussions which took place at an examiners' meeting before marking commenced.


All examiners are instructed that alternative correct answers and unexpected approaches in candidates' scripts must be given marks that fairly reflect the relevant knowledge and skills demonstrated.

Mark schemes should be read in conjunction with the published question papers and the report on the examination.

© OCR 2020

Annotations

Symbol	Description	Comment
	Tick	worthy of credit
	?	unclear
	S	error of spelling
	E	error of grammar, punctuation or expression
	F	error of fact
	^	omission
	H Line	to draw an attention to an error
	H Wavy Line	to draw attention to something
	Highlight	as directed by PE
	REL	irrelevant point
	REP	conspicuous repetition
	L	illegible word or phrase

	BP	Blank Page – this annotation must be used on all blank pages within an answer booklet and on each page of an additional object where there is no candidate response.
---	----	---

SUBJECT–SPECIFIC MARKING INSTRUCTIONS

Introduction

Your first task as an Examiner is to become thoroughly familiar with the material on which the examination depends. You should ensure that you have copies of these materials:

- the specification, especially the assessment objectives
- the question paper and its rubrics
- the mark scheme.

You should ensure also that you are familiar with the administrative procedures related to the marking process. These are set out in the OCR booklet **Instructions for Examiners**. If you are examining for the first time, please read carefully **Appendix 5 Introduction to Script Marking: Notes for New Examiners**. Please ask for help or guidance whenever you need it. Your first point of contact is your Team Leader.

Information and instructions for examiners

The co-ordination scripts provide you with *examples* of the standard of each band. The marks awarded for these scripts will have been agreed by the Team Leaders and will be discussed fully at the Examiners' Co-ordination Meeting.

The specific task-related indicative content for each question will help you to understand how the band descriptors may be applied. However, this indicative content **does not** constitute the mark scheme: it is material that candidates **might** use, grouped according to each assessment objective tested by the question. It is hoped that candidates will respond to questions in a variety of ways. Rigid demands for 'what must be a good answer' would lead to a distorted assessment. Candidates' answers must be relevant to the question. Beware of prepared answers that do not show the candidate's thought and which have not been adapted to the thrust of the question. Beware also of answers where candidates attempt to reproduce interpretations and concepts that they have been taught but have only partially understood.

Using the Mark Scheme

Please study this Mark Scheme carefully. The Mark Scheme is an integral part of the process that begins with the setting of the question paper and ends with the awarding of grades. Question papers and Mark Schemes are developed in association with each other so that issues of differentiation and positive achievement can be addressed from the very start.

This Mark Scheme is a working document; it is not exhaustive; it does not provide 'correct' answers. The Mark Scheme can only provide 'best guesses' about how the question will work out, and it is subject to revision after we have looked at a wide range of scripts.

The Examiners' Standardisation Meeting will ensure that the Mark Scheme covers the range of candidates' responses to the questions, and that all Examiners understand and apply the Mark Scheme in the same way. The Mark Scheme will be discussed and amended at the meeting, and administrative procedures will be confirmed. Co-ordination scripts will be issued at the meeting to exemplify aspects of candidates' responses and achievements; the co-ordination scripts then become part of this Mark Scheme.

Before the Standardisation Meeting, you should read and mark in pencil a number of scripts, in order to gain an impression of the range of responses and achievement that may be expected.

Please read carefully all the scripts in your allocation and make every effort to look positively for achievement throughout the ability range. Always be prepared to use the full range of marks.

Information and instructions for examiners

The co-ordination scripts provide you with *examples* of the standard of each band. The marks awarded for these scripts will have been agreed by the Team Leaders and will be discussed fully at the Examiners' Co-ordination Meeting.

The specific task-related indicative content for each question will help you to understand how the band descriptors may be applied. However, this indicative content **does not** constitute the mark scheme: it is material that candidates **might** use, grouped according to each assessment objective tested by the question. It is hoped that candidates will respond to questions in a variety of ways. Rigid demands for 'what must be a good answer' would lead to a distorted assessment. Candidates' answers must be relevant to the question. Beware of prepared answers that do not show the candidate's thought and which have not been adapted to the thrust of the question. Beware also of answers where candidates attempt to reproduce interpretations and concepts that they have been taught but have only partially understood.

ASSESSMENT OBJECTIVES

Candidates are expected to demonstrate the following in the context of the content described for the individual unit:

AO1 Demonstrate knowledge and understanding of:

- literature, visual/material culture and classical thought
- how sources and ideas reflect, and influence, their cultural contexts
- possible interpretations of sources, perspectives and ideas by different audiences and individuals.

AO2 Critically analyse, interpret and evaluate literature, visual/material culture, and classical thoughts, using evidence to make substantiated judgements and produce coherent and reasoned arguments.

Individual questions are designed to allow the distribution of marks between the Assessment Objectives. For some points based marking and the levels of response questions you are required to identify a candidate's performance under each assessment objective and award marks accordingly.

Marking Scripts

Answers must be marked using the level descriptors in the marking grids and a mark awarded for each Assessment Objective.

The points in the mark scheme are **indicative content only** and offer some question specific guidance. Credit should be given for other points and different views, if they seem possible and are well argued or supported by good evidence.

You must avoid negative marking - don't deduct marks for individual errors. All marks should be allocated by reference to the assessment grid.

Any queries on unexpected answers please consult your Principal Examiner.

Using annotations

- Take great care to place a tick (see below) against any valid points that lead you to think at all favourably of the answer.
- **Do not leave any page unmarked** (as a last resort tick the very bottom of a page to indicate that you have read it - otherwise Team Leaders/Principal Examiners cannot tell whether account has been taken of that page).
- Underline errors and place the appropriate symbol in the margin.
- Indicate that you have looked at every page of the answer booklet by placing the **BP** symbol at the top and bottom of any blank pages.

Ticks: these are the simplest, quickest and most efficient means for examiners to convey approval to Senior Examiners, and they should be inserted where they can be most effective. If the point you wish to highlight is in the middle of a paragraph, then put the tick in the middle of a line in the middle of a paragraph. Overuse of the tick tends to devalue its effectiveness.

Do use ticks to draw attention to anything worthy of credit [even single words].

Do not use ticks as a substitute for marking/assessment; marks for questions must be determined by reference to the assessment grid, **NOT** by mechanical addition of ticks.

Highlighting: use highlighting as directed by your Principal Examiner.

QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

- Reasonable but not excessive account should be taken of particularly poor spelling (**S**), punctuation, and other defects in English grammar and expression (**E**).

- Legibility: use the sign (L) in the margin to areas of a script which you cannot read.
- Extreme cases of illegibility should be referred to your Principal Examiner.

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance
Section A			
1	<p>Who is speaking in the passage in Source A?</p> <p>Answers may include: Socrates/attributed to Socrates by Plato</p>	1 (AO1)	<i>All legitimate answers should be credited.</i>
2	<p>'...a ship's owner...a bit hard of hearing and short-sighted' (lines 1 - 2). Which real group of people are being referred to in this analogy?</p> <p>Answers may include: The ordinary Athenian citizens/members of the Assembly/the citizen body/the Athenian <i>demos</i></p>	1 (AO1)	<i>All legitimate answers should be credited.</i>
3	<p>What does Plato call the type of leader whom he regards as best for an ideal society</p> <p>Answers may include: Philosopher ruler/philosopher-king (or explanation– see 'Guidance' column)</p>	1 (AO1)	<p><i>All legitimate answers should be credited</i></p> <p><i>NB the term 'philosopher ruler' appears in the Specification and the translation provided in the OCR downloadable sources, but 'philosopher-king' appears in many works on Plato's Republic and in many other readily available translations. Accept any legitimate response which shows an understanding of the concept of a sole ruler who is at the same time a philosopher.</i></p>
4	<p>Explain what impression Plato creates of the Athenian democratic system in Source A.</p> <p>Examples might include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> the <i>demos</i> are generally unable to make long-term decisions due to 	<p>5 (AO1)</p> <p>5</p>	<p><i>AO1 marks are awarded for the selection of material from the source.</i></p> <p><i>AO2 marks for the interpretation, analysis and evaluation of this outlined in the Levels of Response grid.</i></p>

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance
	<p>ignorance (AO2) <i>ship's owner....a bit hard of hearing and short sighted_ and his knowledge of navigation is about the same. (AO1)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public opinion is inconsistent and there is no general agreement about policy (AO2) <i>crew are completely at odds with each other about how to steer the ship (AO1)</i> • The <i>demos</i> demand different things from the <i>stratego</i>i(= generals)/ and <i>archons</i> but want full control (AO2) <i>They are always crowding around the ship's owner, begging and doing everything they can to get him to give them control of the rudder. (AO1)</i> • They arbitrarily get rid of competent leaders (AO2) <i>if they don't manage to persuade him whilst others are making a better attempt, they either kill the others or throw them overboard, and, after binding and subduing their noble leader by drugging him or getting him drunk or something else (AO1)</i> • The <i>demos</i> pick poor leaders (AO2) • Or promote people who respond to their unreasonable demands <i>they also praise to the skies the men who contribute towards subduing or persuading the helmsmen to give over his power (AO1)</i> 	(AO2)	<p><i>The indicative content is a description of possible content. All legitimate answers and approaches must be credited appropriately.</i></p> <p><i>Candidates are likely to conclude that Plato is portraying the system as ineffective and flawed to a greater or lesser extent. The nature of the flaws will be influenced by the examples they select. It is not necessary for them to give all the points listed. See guidance above re indicative content.</i></p>

Guidance on applying the marking grids for the 10-mark stimulus question

Two Assessment Objectives are being assessed in this question: AO1 and AO2. The two Assessment Objectives are equally weighted. Examiners must use a best fit approach to the marking grid. Where there are both strengths and weaknesses in a particular response, particularly imbalanced responses in terms of the assessment objectives, examiners should carefully consider which level is the best fit for the performance overall. For example, you should not be able to achieve a mark of 8 made up of AO1 = 6 and AO2 = 2

When using this grid:

- **Determine the level:** start at the highest level and work down until you reach the level that matches the answer
- **Determine the mark within the level:** consider whether the response consistently meets the criteria for the level, and/or could be described as closer to the level above or the one below

Level	Marks	Characteristics of Performance
5	9 - 10	AO1: Shows very good knowledge and understanding of the provided source/ideas through a range of well selected, accurate and precise material from it AO2: Fully and consistently engages with the question, with perceptive, critical analysis and interpretation of the provided source leading to convincing points which are well-supported and developed
4	7 - 8	AO1: Shows good knowledge and understanding of the provided source/ideas through a range of well selected, mostly accurate, material from it AO2: Engages clearly and directly with the question, with critical analysis and interpretation of the provided source leading to sound points, which are supported and developed
3	5 - 6	AO1: Shows reasonable knowledge and understanding of the provided source/ideas through use of a range of mostly accurate material from it AO2: Engages with some of the fundamental issues of the question, with analysis and interpretation of the provided source leading to some tenable points, which have some support and development
2	3 - 4	AO1: Shows basic knowledge and understanding of the provided source/ideas through use of some material from it with some degree of accuracy AO2: Engages with the general topic of the question, with little analysis and interpretation of the provided source leading to weak points, which have occasional support and development
1	1 - 2	AO1: Shows limited knowledge and understanding of the provided source/ideas through little use of accurate material from it AO2: Limited and very simplistic attempt to engage with the topic of the question, with very little analysis and interpretation of the provided source leading to points of little relevance
0	0	No response or no response worthy of credit

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance
5	<p>Name two of the property classes created by Solon.</p> <p>Answers may include:</p> <p>Any two of:</p> <p>Pentakosiomedimnoi; Hippeis; Zeugitai; Thetes</p>	<p>2 (AO1)</p>	<p><i>All legitimate answers should be credited.</i></p> <p><i>1 mark per correct name, regardless of spelling errors.</i></p> <p><i>Accept either Greek or Latinate spelling conventions.</i></p>
6	<p>Explain how well you think Solon's reforms to the class system linked wealth to the rights and obligations of Athenian citizens.</p> <p>Examples might include:</p> <p>Rights</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ All four classes were assigned specific roles in the running of the state (AO2) <i>Archonships restricted to the Pentakosiomedimnoi and Hippeis, while Zeugitai could hold lesser offices and Thetes could hold no offices but, like all other classes, were entitled to vote in the Assembly and serve on juries (AO1)</i> ○ There was a clear statement of how someone's annual income was related to his property class (AO2) <i>Pentakosiomedimnoi = 500+ measures; Hippeis = 300 – 500 measures; Zeugitai = 200 – 300 measures; Thetes = fewer than 200 measures.(AO1)</i> ○ All classes had a right to know what the law was. <i>The laws were now published and engraved on kyrbeis (rotating panels placed in the Agora)</i> ○ He broke the monopoly over legal matters previously held by the Eupatridai 	<p>5 (AO1)</p> <p>5 (AO2)</p>	<p><i>AO1 marks are awarded for the selection of material from the source.</i></p> <p><i>AO2 marks for the interpretation, analysis and evaluation of this outlined in the Levels of Response grid.</i></p> <p><i>The indicative content is a description of possible content. All legitimate answers and approaches must be credited appropriately.</i></p>

	<p><i>All classes now had the right of appeal to a jury, though only the Archons and ex-Archons could make rulings. All citizens could serve on the jury.</i></p> <p>Obligations</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Ownership of property or possession of wealth was linked to potential to contribute to the national economy. (AO2) <i>Hippeis were theoretically able to afford to own a horse; Zeugitai were so-called because of their ability to afford oxen to plough fields, while Thetes were able to provide manual labour for others. (AO1)</i> ○ This could also be linked to a role in warfare/defence of the city based on what someone in each class might reasonably be expected to afford or own (AO2) <p><i>Each class had a specific military role, with the Pentakosiomedymnoi and Hippeis providing the commanders and cavalry and the Zeugitai (also regarded as Hoplitai) being able to afford basic infantry armour and weapons. (AO1)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ All property classes had an obligation to respect the laws (AO2) <i>It was now possible to bring public as well as private cases and to appoint an advocate; this was particularly beneficial to the poorer citizens. (AO1)</i> <p><i>The creation of the Heliiaia, in which all property classes could serve, emphasised this. (AO1)</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The members of the Areopagus and holders of senior magistracies had an obligation to use their legal powers fairly (AO2) <i>The laws were available in the agora for all to see. (AO1)</i> 		
--	---	--	--

Guidance on applying the marking grids for the 10-mark stimulus question

Two Assessment Objectives are being assessed in this question: AO1 and AO2. The two Assessment Objectives are equally weighted. Examiners must use a best fit approach to the marking grid. Where there are both strengths and weaknesses in a particular response, particularly imbalanced

responses in terms of the assessment objectives, examiners should carefully consider which level is the best fit for the performance overall. For example, you should not be able to achieve a mark of 8 made up of AO1 = 6 and AO2 = 2

When using this grid:

- **Determine the level:** start at the highest level and work down until you reach the level that matches the answer
- **Determine the mark within the level:** consider whether the response consistently meets the criteria for the level, and/or could be described as closer to the level above or the one below

Level	Marks	Characteristics of Performance
5	9 - 10	AO1: Shows very good knowledge and understanding of the provided source/ideas through a range of well selected, accurate and precise material from it AO2: Fully and consistently engages with the question, with perceptive, critical analysis and interpretation of the provided source leading to convincing points which are well-supported and developed
4	7 - 8	AO1: Shows good knowledge and understanding of the provided source/ideas through a range of well selected, mostly accurate, material from it AO2: Engages clearly and directly with the question, with critical analysis and interpretation of the provided source leading to sound points, which are supported and developed
3	5 - 6	AO1: Shows reasonable knowledge and understanding of the provided source/ideas through use of a range of mostly accurate material from it AO2: Engages with some of the fundamental issues of the question, with analysis and interpretation of the provided source leading to some tenable points, which have some support and development
2	3 - 4	AO1: Shows basic knowledge and understanding of the provided source/ideas through use of some material from it with some degree of accuracy AO2: Engages with the general topic of the question, with little analysis and interpretation of the provided source leading to weak points, which have occasional support and development
1	1 - 2	AO1: Shows limited knowledge and understanding of the provided source/ideas through little use of accurate material from it AO2: Limited and very simplistic attempt to engage with the topic of the question, with very little analysis and interpretation of the provided source leading to points of little relevance
0	0	No response or no response worthy of credit

Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance
7	<p>How far do you feel that Plato would have completely approved of Solon's appointment and reforms? Explain your opinion. You may use Source A as a starting point.</p> <p><u>AO1</u> Candidates might show knowledge and understanding of:</p> <p>Plato's views regarding the nature of effective rule, as indicated in Source A and elsewhere in the prescribed source material</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The nature of the philosopher-ruler <p>Solon's reputation prior to his appointment to the post of [Eponymous] Archon in 594 was known to the people of Athens [through his poetry].</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reasons for Solon's appointment <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ The potential threat of tyranny in Athens ○ The discontent of the new elite who had gained wealth through trade ○ Debt-slavery ○ The Eupatrids' monopoly of power ○ The flaws in the legislation of Draco ○ Evidence in Solon's poems of his aims and philosophical standpoint <p>Main outcomes of Solon's reforms:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Abolishing debt-slavery • Giving land back to those who had lost it • Giving everyone a chance to show that they could advance through hard work. • The change from nobility of birth to ability to make money as a criterion for office, as reflected in the property classes • The establishment of new opportunities in manufacturing and export by restricting the export of corn and instead focusing on olive products as the main permitted agricultural export • Publicising of laws 	<p>10 (AO1)</p> <p>10 (AO2)</p>	<p><i>The indicative content is a description of possible content only; all legitimate answers and approaches must be credited appropriately.</i></p> <p><i>Assess using the marking grids for the 20-mark extended response.</i></p> <p><i>Whilst candidates may use the provided source as a starting point, they should not be penalised if they offer a full and detailed response which does not do so.</i></p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clarifying the legal position <p><u>AO2</u> Candidates may demonstrate evaluation and analysis through the use of some of the following arguments:</p> <p>Plato might approve of Solon's reforms because:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plato does not advocate an unrestricted popular democracy, as is clear in both Source A and the analogy of the beast-trainer– he believes that only those qualified to lead or knowledgeable in a specific sphere should lead. Solon's new structure enabled those with ability to rise to the top, and thus become entitled to a greater role in running the state. (Modern analogy – transferable skills) • Conversely, it would be possible for those who had inherited wealth but proved incapable of efficiently increasing or maintaining it to drop to a lower property class and thus take a less important role in running the state. • Solon's reforms had quite a restricted scope – to avoid the usurpation of power of the kind which had led to the rise of Tyrants in other states (e.g. Corinth) • Solon did not advocate giving equal power to all • Solon made it clear that the ultimate 'guardians of the law' were the ex-Archons who formed the Council of the Areopagus – i.e. members of the top two property classes who had held office in the past • Solon's poems could be taken to demonstrate coherent philosophical views, and he therefore fits the mould of philosopher-ruler <p>Plato might disapprove of Solon's reforms because:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • He might feel that tyranny is not an undesirable form of government • He might feel that the setting up of a court of appeal (=Heliaia) went against the supremacy of lawgivers. • He might be suspicious of the system of advocacy permitted by 		
--	--	--	--

	<p>Solon in view of his own experience of Sophists.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • He might have been influenced by the trial and execution of Socrates and the events leading up to that. • Solon didn't remain in power and refused a permanent role, so he wasn't a 'philosopher-ruler' of the type advocated by Plato. • Solon was therefore entrusting others with unproven track records with the maintenance and administration of his new system. • There was political upheaval for much of the rest of the 6th century BC, so his reforms didn't achieve the desired aim. 		
--	--	--	--

Guidance on applying the marking grids for the 20-mark extended response

Two Assessment Objectives are being assessed in this question: AO1 and AO2. The two Assessment Objectives are equally weighted. Examiners must use a best fit approach to the marking grid. Where there are both strengths and weaknesses in a particular response examiners should carefully consider which level is the best fit for the performance overall. Note that candidates can achieve different levels in each assessment objective, for example a Level 3 for AO1, and a Level 2 for AO2.

When using this grid:

- **Determine the level:** start at the highest level and work down until you reach the level that matches the answer
- **Determine the mark within the level:** consider whether the response consistently meets the criteria for the level, and/or could be described as closer to the level above or the one below

AO1			AO2		
Level	Marks	Characteristics of Performance	Level	Marks	Characteristics of Performance
5	9 – 10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • very detailed knowledge and a thorough understanding of the material studied • use of a range of well selected, accurate and precise material from classical sources and/or classical ideas; and appropriate, effective use of their cultural context and possible interpretation 	5	9 – 10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a very good response to the question containing a wide range of relevant points leading to convincing conclusions • points are very well supported by perceptive critical analysis, interpretation and evaluation of classical sources and/or classical ideas <p><i>The response is logically structured, with a well-developed, sustained and coherent line of reasoning</i></p>
4	7 – 8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • detailed knowledge and a sound understanding of the material studied • use of a range of well selected, mostly accurate, material from classical sources and/or classical ideas; and appropriate use of their cultural context and possible interpretation 	4	7 – 8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a good response to the question containing a range of relevant points leading to appropriate conclusions • points are consistently supported by critical analysis, interpretation and evaluation of classical sources and/or classical ideas <p><i>the response is logically structured, with a well-developed and clear line of reasoning</i></p>
3	5 – 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • reasonable knowledge and understanding of the material studied 	3	5 – 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a reasonable response to the question containing some relevant points leading to tenable conclusions

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> use of a range of mostly accurate material from classical sources and/or classical ideas; and some use of their cultural context and possible interpretation 			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> points are generally supported by analysis, interpretation and evaluation of classical sources and/or classical ideas <i>the response presents a line of reasoning which is mostly relevant and has some structure</i>
2	3 – 4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> basic knowledge and understanding of the material studied use of a limited range of material from classical sources and/or classical ideas; with some degree of accuracy, and limited use of their cultural context and possible interpretation 	2	3 – 4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a basic response to the question containing some points, which may be narrow in scope and limited in relevancy, leading to weak conclusions points are occasionally supported by analysis, interpretation and evaluation of classical sources and/or classical ideas <i>the response presents a line of reasoning but may lack structure</i>
1	1 – 2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> limited knowledge and understanding of the material studied use of little accurate material from classical sources and/or classical ideas; and little or no use of their cultural context and possible interpretation 	1	1 – 2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> little engagement with the question, any points or conclusions made are of little relevance isolated use of classical sources and/or classical ideas with little analysis, interpretation and evaluation <i>the information is communicated in an unstructured way</i>
0	0	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> no response or no response worthy of credit 	0	0	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> no response or no response worthy of credit

Section B			
Question	Indicative Content	Marks	Guidance
8	<p>‘The Athenian dramatists present very effective arguments in support of Athenian democracy’. Using the prescribed extracts from the works of Aeschylus, Euripides and at least two plays by Aristophanes as a starting point, discuss how far you agree with this statement.</p> <p><u>AO1</u></p> <p>Candidates might show knowledge and understanding of:</p> <p>Aeschylus:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In <i>Eumenides</i>, Athena herself is delivering instructions for the future • She makes it clear that all citizens must uphold the laws • ‘Accept neither anarchy nor tyranny’ is one of her instructions in the prescribed extract • Implies that fear of the laws and maintenance of justice are the strongest defence for Athens <p>Euripides:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The extract from <i>Suppliants</i> gives arguments for and against democracy • Theseus speaks in support of democracy. • The Theban Herald argues against it and in favour of having a single ruler. <p>Theseus’ arguments:</p> <p>Lines 403 – 408</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rule by the citizen body gives equal rights to rich & poor <p>Lines 426 – 456</p>	<p>10 (AO1)</p> <p>20 (AO2)</p>	<p><i>The indicative content is a description of possible content only; all legitimate answers and approaches must be credited appropriately.</i></p> <p><i>Assess using the marking grids for the 30-mark extended response.</i></p> <p><i>Learners are expected to make use of scholarly views, academic approaches and sources to support their argument; the approach to crediting this is outlined in the Levels of Response Grid.</i></p> <p>Candidates do not need to quote the plays verbatim; they simply need to show knowledge and understanding of the points made by the authors through the various characters.</p> <p>Credit relevant references to other plays and dramatists not in the</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A monarch is a burden to a city • The laws are supreme • ‘The essence of freedom is in these words: “He who has a good idea for the city let him bring it before its citizens.” ‘ • A sole ruler brings instability because a king is always afraid of being usurped. <p>The Theban Herald’s arguments:</p> <p>Lines 409 – 425</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Describes Athens as being ruled by a mob • Describes the citizen body as a ‘mindless herd’ • Says that the people can be tricked by eloquent speakers for their own gain • Says that corrupt leaders then lie to cover up the damage they have caused and thus escape justice • Suggests that e.g. farmers are too busy to take a full part in governing the city • Condemns a system which can lead to men of low birth becoming more influential than those of noble birth. <p>Aristophanes:</p> <p><i>Acharnians:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Assembly is in session but even the presiding magistrates arrive late • The people are fooled by their ambassadors to Persia • The views of ordinary people are being ignored <p><i>Assemblywomen:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Assembly has been making a mess of running the city • Women (who aren’t citizens) can do the job much more effectively than the men • The general rules of running the Assembly are clear • But decisions are being manipulated by those who are not competent to run the city <p><i>Knights:</i></p>	<p>prescription.</p> <p>Credit relevant comparisons with the views in other prescribed sources.</p> <p>The main scholarly views focus on</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Political standpoint of the authors • How influential drama was in the relevant years • Scholars’ views about the Athenian audience • Significance of the historical events at the time the plays were produced • How seriously we should take Aristophanes’ views – he was trying to win a comedy contest • Aristophanes’ dislike of Cleon was personal and his plays didn’t prevent Cleon being regularly re-elected as one of the 10 strategoi – so should his criticisms be regarded as effective? • In the case of <i>Assemblywomen</i>, whether we can regard this as a
--	--	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cleon has too much control • Athenian democratic institutions are being subverted by demagogues with no pedigree and personal motives • Only people of low birth are being listened to • (Lines 225 -230) 'the Knights, a thousand fine men, who hate [Cleon] and will come to your aid, and all who are honest and decent among the citizens, and every man of intelligence in the audience, and myself along with them; and the god will lend his assistance' • (Lines 255 – 265) Cleon's use of bribery ('order of the Three Obols') to influence the demos • Cleon's use of the jury-courts <p><i>Peace:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aristophanes has challenged Cleon • Aristophanes wants to restore the old democratic values <p><i>Wasps:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concentrates on showing in depth how the jury courts are being used by Cleon to undermine democratic values • (Lines 488 – 493) 'Dictatorship' (= 'tyranny') and 'conspirators' are the opposite of 'democracy' and are accusations used to smear anyone who proposes measures of which Cleon & his supporters disapprove. • (Lines 698 -701) 'when it would be possible for you and the whole people to be rich, you've been penned up somehow or other by these men who always say they're for the people. You rule over a vast number of cities, from the Black Sea to Sardinia, but you don't get the least bit of benefit,' • Athens is a prosperous state <p><i>Frogs:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hasty decisions in the Assembly (notably about the punishment of the generals after Arginusae) have caused problems • Citizenship is being extended to slaves who have rowed in the fleet 	<p>feminist work</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The extent to which the didactic role of dramatists in Athens was taken seriously
--	--	--

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • (Lines 687 – 692) ‘In the first place, accordingly, we think that all citizens should be made equal and their fears removed; and if someone went wrong at all through being tripped up by the wiles of Phrynichus, I say that those who slipped up at that time should be given the right to clear themselves of any charge and wipe out their previous errors’ • Democracy, like the currency, is being devalued. <p><u>AO2</u> Candidates may demonstrate evaluation and analysis through the use of some of the following arguments:</p> <p>In general, the context of the performance of each play, including the date of performance and (if known) whether it came first in the relevant contest, may inform what the playwright says. This could include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The significance of the date of the first performance of <i>Eumenides</i> in relation to the reforms of the Areopagus • The tendency of Euripides to include formal debate in his plays and the influence of sophistic techniques on his writing • The dates of Aristophanes’ plays – <i>Assemblywomen</i> is significantly later than the others – in relation to events of the period • <i>Frogs</i> was given an unprecedented second performance because of its Parabasis (from which the prescribed extract is taken) • The known political views of the authors • The perceived aims of the authors <p>In favour of the statement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Athena, as Aeschylus’ spokeswoman, shows very clearly the importance of the principles of democracy and the belief that the laws cannot be altered on a whim. • Theseus, in Euripides’ play, states the core values of democracy; there is some resemblance to the points made in the <i>Funeral Oration</i>. • Theseus had semi-divine status in Athens and was revered as a hero in his own right, so is speaking for Athens • Aristophanes’ criticisms of the demagogues highlights what he perceives as the 	<p>Candidates will need to state what it is about the plays which fits their definition of ‘effectiveness.’</p> <p>NB Arguments will depend very much on which two plays by Aristophanes are cited.</p> <p><i>Knights:</i> Candidates may know how the play ends – with Demos reverting to the values of the Marathon generation, thus symbolising the original virtues of the Athenian democracy. This knowledge may affect the conclusion reached.</p>
--	--	--

	<p>values and merits of democracy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> in general his tone is one of desire to overthrow the demagogues; he deplures the dependence of the citizens on them and wishes to restore Periclean or post-Marathon democratic values <p>Against the statement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In the person of the Herald, Euripides is presenting many of the same arguments against democracy as those presented by Plato The fact that the arguments in favour of democracy are being put forward by Theseus, who is a king, may lead to some scepticism as to his sincerity Euripides was regularly criticised for his inclusion of sophistic arguments in his plays And Sophists were distrusted Philocleon's assessment of the benefits of the jury system in <i>Wasps</i> are selfish and cast a poor light on the moral values of the 'Marathon generation' whom he represents; this may undermine Aristophanes' argument Aristophanes concentrates on showing the flaws in democracy – in particular, the ease with which the Assembly could be misled Some of his points could be seen as similar to the criticisms made by the Old Oligarch and Plato. <i>Assemblywomen</i> is a fantasy and cannot be taken seriously 		
9	<p>“Athenian citizens give equal care to the affairs of the state andhave a fair understanding of politics.’ (Thucydides). To what extent do you think Cleisthenes was entirely responsible for enabling all Athenian citizens to develop this ‘fair understanding of politics’? Justify your opinion.’</p> <p><u>AO1</u> Candidates might show knowledge and understanding of:</p> <p>Ways in which Cleisthenes increased participation in the running of the state – notably</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> use of sortition in appointment to the <i>Deme</i> councils mixture of nomination, election and sortition for appointment of members of the <i>Boule</i> the <i>prytanis</i> system 	<p>10 (AO1)</p> <p>20 (AO2)</p>	<p><i>The indicative content is a description of possible content only; all legitimate answers and approaches must be credited appropriately.</i></p> <p><i>Assess using the marking grids for the 30-mark extended response.</i></p> <p><i>Learners are expected to make use of scholarly views, academic</i></p>

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • free board & lodging are provided for serving <i>Bouleutai</i> • Maximum 2 [non-consecutive] terms on the <i>Boule</i> means that many citizens have the opportunity to participate • And because these had to be non-consecutive there was less chance of cliques forming • Appointment on the basis of the new Tribes means that the influence of the old nobility is lessened • Though it should be noted that Cleisthenes had manipulated the tribal system so that it favoured the Alcmaeonidae disproportionately <p>Post-Cleisthenes</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minimum 6000 quorum for major decisions – e.g. ostracism. • 501 – Appointment of Tribal <i>stratego</i>i by election is a natural consequence of Cleisthenes' reforms. <p>Later developments</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development of the fleet, with increased reliance on the willingness of the Thetes to act as rowers • Reforms of Ephialtes & Pericles • Payment for all offices below that of Strategos • Jury pay <p>Role of Solon in breaking down the Eupatrids' monopoly of power.</p> <p><u>AO2</u> Candidates may demonstrate evaluation and analysis through the use of some of the following arguments:</p> <p>In support of Cleisthenes as the main creator of this situation:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sortition gave every citizen a chance to experience involvement in local affairs at deme level • with subsequent opportunity, for those who prove themselves, of nomination to the <i>Boule</i> regardless of wealth 	<p><i>approaches and sources to support their argument; the approach to crediting this is outlined in the Levels of Response Grid.</i></p> <p>Candidates should be aware that although Cleisthenes is credited in the Aristotelian Ath Pol with introducing ostracism it is doubtful whether this was in fact one of his reforms.</p>
--	---

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • no member of the <i>Boule</i> need be away from his farm or business for more than 30 days in any given year • poverty was not a barrier to participation • Assembly meetings held in the open air mean that there is no limit to the number of people who can be accommodated on the Pnyx <p>All the above provide the foundations for the main elements of the developed democracy.</p> <p>But, against this interpretation:</p> <p>Solon arguably:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Created the mechanism through which the <i>Thetes</i> later became key to Athens' naval superiority and therefore gained increased entitlement to involvement in public affairs • Developed the foundations on which Cleisthenes could build, especially in creating the <i>Heliaia</i> and (possibly) establishing the principle of a <i>Boule</i> • Paved the way for the creation of the factions which led to major reorganization under the Peisistratids and afterwards. <p>Other factors:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The role of the navy in defeating the Persians and maintaining Athens' control over the Delian League/empire/Allied and Subject states was created by Themistocles and reinforced in the aftermath of the defeat of Persia • Pericles and Ephialtes created the system whereby all magistrates became accountable to the Assembly • Payment for all offices except that of <i>Strategos</i> meant that everyone had the chance to rise to the post of Archon • All decisions about domestic and foreign policy were made by the Assembly after 462 • The comments of The Old Oligarch and Aristophanes' criticisms of the demagogues suggest that decisions were not always made with understanding. • The rise of demagogues showed that the Assembly/<i>Ekklesia</i> could be easily swayed by eloquent individuals with their own agenda • And this was also true of the <i>Stratego</i>, who were the only officials who could be re-elected for an unlimited number of times • as shown in the career of Pericles, you didn't have to be a 'demagogue' of the 	<p>Note that knowledge of the Peisistratid tyranny is not required; credit may be given to relevant evidence from this period gained from scholars and wider reading.</p> <p>The most likely conclusion is that while Cleisthenes was undoubtedly responsible for enabling all citizens to acquire a 'fair' understanding of politics, the word 'entirely' is open to discussion.</p>
--	--	---

	<p>type vilified by Thucydides and Aristophanes</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Aristophanes shows that the people can be easily fooled, and their decisions are not always good (<i>Assemblywomen, Wasps, Frogs, Knights</i>) • Though we have to take into account his personal dislike of Cleon • Plato suggests that the people are not qualified to make good judgments • The Old Oligarch suggests that the main aim of the Athenians was to exploit the allies; is evidence is largely drawn from the period after Pericles' reforms • It could be argued that Thucydides is biased in his attitude to Pericles and his successors. • And ostracism had been discredited by 417 		
--	---	--	--

Guidance on applying the marking grids for the 30-mark extended response

Two Assessment Objectives are being assessed in this question: AO1 and AO2. The two Assessment Objectives are equally weighted. Examiners must use a best fit approach to the marking grid. Where there are both strengths and weaknesses in a particular response examiners should carefully consider which level is the best fit for the performance overall. Note that candidates can achieve different levels in each assessment objective, for example a Level 3 for AO1, and a Level 2 for AO2.

When using this grid:

- **Determine the level:** start at the highest level and work down until you reach the level that matches the answer
- **Determine the mark within the level:** consider whether the response consistently meets the criteria for the level, and/or could be described as closer to the level above or the one below

AO1			AO2		
Level	Marks	Characteristics of Performance	Level	Marks	Characteristics of Performance
5	9 – 10	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • very detailed knowledge and a thorough understanding of the material studied • use of a range of well selected, accurate and precise material from classical sources and/or classical ideas; and appropriate, effective use of their cultural context and possible interpretation 	5	17 – 20	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a very good response to the question containing a wide range of relevant points leading to convincing conclusions • points are very well supported by critical perceptive analysis, interpretation and evaluation of classical sources and/or classical ideas and secondary sources, scholars and/or academic works <i>the response is logically structured, with a well-developed, sustained and coherent line of reasoning</i>
4	7 – 8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • detailed knowledge and a sound understanding of the material studied • use of a range of well selected, mostly accurate, material from classical sources and/or classical ideas; and appropriate use of their cultural context and possible interpretation 	4	13 – 16	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • a good response to the question containing a range of relevant points leading to appropriate conclusions • points are consistently supported by critical analysis, interpretation and evaluation of classical sources and/or classical ideas and secondary sources, scholars and/or academic works

					<i>the response is logically structured, with a well-developed and clear line of reasoning</i>
3	5 – 6	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> reasonable knowledge and understanding of the material studied use of a range of mostly accurate material from classical sources and/or classical ideas; and some use of their cultural context and possible interpretation 	3	9 – 12	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a reasonable response to the question containing some relevant points leading to tenable conclusions points are generally supported by analysis, interpretation and evaluation of classical sources and/or classical ideas and there is some use of secondary sources scholars and/or academic works <i>the response presents a line of reasoning which is mostly relevant and has some structure</i>
2	3 – 4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> basic knowledge and understanding of the material studied use of a limited range of material from classical sources and/or classical ideas, with some degree of accuracy, and limited use of their cultural context and possible interpretation 	2	5 – 8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a basic response to the question containing some points, which may be narrow in scope and limited in relevancy, leading to weak conclusions points are occasionally supported by analysis, interpretation and evaluation of classical sources and/or classical ideas, and there is little or no use of secondary sources, scholars and/or academic works <i>the response presents a line of reasoning but may lack structure</i>
1	1 – 2	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> limited knowledge and understanding of the material studied use of little accurate material from classical sources and/or classical ideas, and little or no use of their cultural context and possible interpretation 	1	1 – 4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> little engagement with the question and any points or conclusions made are of little or no relevance isolated use of classical sources and/or classical ideas, with little analysis, interpretation and evaluation <i>the information is communicated in an unstructured way</i>
0	0	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> no response or no response worthy of credit 	0	0	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> no response or no response worthy of credit

OCR (Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations)
The Triangle Building
Shaftesbury Road
Cambridge
CB2 8EA

OCR Customer Contact Centre

Education and Learning

Telephone: 01223 553998

Facsimile: 01223 552627

Email: general.qualifications@ocr.org.uk

www.ocr.org.uk

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored