

A LEVEL

Examiners' report

HISTORY A

H505

For first teaching in 2015

Y215/01 Summer 2022 series

Contents

Introduction	3
Paper Y215/01 series overview	4
Question 1 (a)	5
Question 1 (b)*	8
Question 2 (a)	9
Question 2 (b)*	12

Introduction

Our examiners' reports are produced to offer constructive feedback on candidates' performance in the examinations. They provide useful guidance for future candidates.

The reports will include a general commentary on candidates' performance, identify technical aspects examined in the questions and highlight good performance and where performance could be improved. A selection of candidate answers is also provided. The reports will also explain aspects which caused difficulty and why the difficulties arose, whether through a lack of knowledge, poor examination technique, or any other identifiable and explainable reason.

Where overall performance on a question/question part was considered good, with no particular areas to highlight, these questions have not been included in the report.

A full copy of the question paper and the mark scheme can be downloaded from OCR.

Advance Information for Summer 2022 assessments

To support student revision, advance information was published about the focus of exams for Summer 2022 assessments. Advance information was available for most GCSE, AS and A Level subjects, Core Maths, FSMQ, and Cambridge Nationals Information Technologies. You can find more information on our [website](#).

Would you prefer a Word version?

Did you know that you can save this PDF as a Word file using Acrobat Professional?

Simply click on **File > Export to** and select **Microsoft Word**

(If you have opened this PDF in your browser you will need to save it first. Simply right click anywhere on the page and select **Save as . . .** to save the PDF. Then open the PDF in Acrobat Professional.)

If you do not have access to Acrobat Professional there are a number of **free** applications available that will also convert PDF to Word (search for PDF to Word converter).

Paper Y215/01 series overview

Y215 is one of twenty four units for the revised A Level examination for GCE History. This unit tests an extended period of History of about one hundred years through a short-answer essay and a traditional essay. The paper contains two questions, each having two parts, a short-answer essay and a traditional essay and candidates have to answer both parts of one question.

To do well on the short essay question (a), candidates need to consider the significance or importance both issues, factors, individuals or events mentioned in relation to the question. Having analysed or explained both they must reach a supported judgement as to which is the most important or significant.

To do well on the traditional essay, candidates need to address the issue in the question, using detailed supporting knowledge. In order to reach the higher levels candidates will need to assess the issues they discuss and reach a supported judgement, at least in the conclusion.

Candidates who did well on this paper generally did the following:	Candidates who did less well on this paper generally did the following:
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • gave equal consideration to the two issues in the short-answer essay • reached a developed and supported judgement as to which issue was more significant or important • linked their knowledge of the issues to the focus of the question • in answering the essay question, discussed at least two issues in depth • gave supporting detail that was both accurate and relevant to the question set, not just the topic • reached a supported judgement about the issue in the question • made a series of interim judgements about the issues discussed in relation to the question. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • considered only one of the issues or discussed one in a superficial way • produced a judgement that was not supported and was therefore assertion or a judgement that did not follow logically from the response • were unable to use their knowledge to address the issue in the question. • showed a poor understanding of the major issues relevant to the essay • were unable to support their response with relevant or accurate material • did not focus on the precise wording of the question • made unsupported comments about issues which were no more than assertions.

Key point for candidates – take care with specialist terminology

Candidates need to be sure of basic specialist terminology used in this unit e.g. Mezzogiorno, Risorgimento, Trasformismo.

Question 1 (a)

- 1 (a) Which was more important in the establishment of the Kingdom of Italy during the period from 1850 to 1861?
- (i) Diplomacy
 - (ii) War

Explain your answer with reference to both (i) and (ii).

[10]

Responses to this question were surprisingly varied in that the question centred on an essential period, a focal point, of the topic. What distinguished better responses was their clear grasp of how to apply the two factors, using 'diplomacy' to evaluate Cavour's moves from 1854 to 1861, as well as Garibaldi's 'handshake' at Teano and exploring 'war' to comment on the Crimean War, the 1859 war and Garibaldi's campaign in 1860.

Very few responses managed to refer to all these instances and a notable amount omitted either the 1859 war or Garibaldi's campaign. In concluding, the importance of the fact that Austria was forced to pull out of most of Italy after the 1859 war was rarely appreciated. A notable number of responses were unclear about the meaning of 'diplomacy' and so were unconvincing.

Exemplar 1 copes well with the main instances of diplomacy and war in the 1858-60 period and comes to a substantiated judgement; not a comprehensive response, but well worthy of Level 5.

Key point for candidates – think flexibly about familiar material

Candidates should make sure details are learned and understood so that they can be flexibly applied, regardless of the question asked.

Exemplar 1

	1	<p>a) Diplomacy clearly had a great impact on the establishment of the Kingdom of Italy so far as it both played a direct role of unification and helped initiate war. Perhaps the most important piece of diplomacy for the unification of Italy was the 1858 Plombière meeting in which Cavour was able to establish the support of Napoleon III for the invasion of Austria and the provocation of war. Without this it is likely that the battles of Magenta and Solferino would have gone much the same way as those of Novara and Custozza in 1849 and thus the commitment of Napoleon III to provide 200,000 troops should be seen as crucial to that war's success. However, this merely demonstrates that diplomacy aided in the importance of war rather than that it was important in its own right. Indeed, much the same could be said of the "Grande di Debra" speech given by Victor Emmanuel II in 1848, whilst this may have furthered the cause of invoking war with Russia, it had little influence in</p>
--	---	---

its own right. It is true that the meeting at Teano in October 1860 was crucial to the final unification of Italy, as was Cavour's inciting of Plebiscites in the Central Duchies that voted for unity with Piedmont. However, even these examples of diplomacy would not have been successful without the coinciding war. Thus war and not diplomacy should be seen as more important in the establishment of a Kingdom of Italy.

War played a role in unifying both the North and the South. The success at Magenta and Solferino already discussed clearly forced Austria into the Peace of Villa Franca and led to the annexation of Lombardy by Piedmont. Moreover, the war weakened Austria and led to a rise in nationalism in the Central Duchies leading to their unity with Piedmont. It could be argued that the impact of the 1859 war was limited by Napoleon III's unwillingness to continue battle after the brutality of the battle of Magenta where France lost 12,000 men. However, this argument seems largely erroneous given the large concessions that were achieved at Zurich and that given Austria had

		<p>retreated to the quadrangle further gains were likely impossible. Garibaldi's guerrilla war in the South was also clearly pivotal. His success against the 20,000 strong Austrian garrison at Palermo with just 3000 men coupled with his successful campaign in Naples allowed the governing Neapolitan government to be ousted. Thus, war and not diplomacy was of more solid importance.</p> <p>Overall, war was the more important cause of the establishment of the Kingdom of Italy since it had a very real impact in both the North and the South. Diplomacy whilst important was reliant on war for its success and thus cannot be seen as the more important.</p>
--	--	--

Question 1 (b)*

- (b)* 'In the years from 1815 to 1847, the Vienna Settlement laid the foundations for the eventual creation of the Kingdom of Italy.' How far do you agree? [20]

This question was usually tackled by comparing the impact of the Vienna Settlement with other events or factors in the 1815-47 period that were relevant to the eventual creation of the Kingdom of Italy. Popular choices in this regard were the revolutions of 1820-1 and 1831-2, as well as the spread of nationalist ideas. The Vienna Settlement was often seen as so inimical to the creation of a united Italy that it directly inspired nationalist attitudes through the actions of its conservative, Austrian-backed governments. The ideas of Mazzini, Gioberti and the Carbonari were often used to good effect in this regard. Less effective responses were confused about the settlement and struggled to form a coherent line of reasoning.

Key point for candidates – understanding the question's key terms

Candidates should make sure they understand key terms of a question before choosing it: in this case, the Vienna Settlement.

Question 2 (a)

2 (a) Which posed the greater problem for Italy during the years from 1861 to 1896?

- (i) The Mezzogiorno
- (ii) Relations with the Church

Explain your answer with reference to both (i) and (ii).

[10]

Many candidates answered this well, tracing the changing fortunes of the Mezzogiorno and the church over the 35 year period. The more successful responses appreciated the change in church-state relations following the accession of Leo XIII in 1878 and the belated attempts by Rome to do more for the South in the 1880s and 1890s.

Weaker responses only covered the earlier part of the period, not getting beyond the Brigands' War for (i) or were even uncertain of the meaning of the term 'Mezzogiorno'.

Exemplar 2 is a very effective response with enough material through the period on both factors to reach a developed judgement and Level 6.

Key point for candidates – pay attention to question dates

Candidates should always take note of the dates in the question.

Exemplar 2

2	a)	<p>The Mezzogiorno posed problems of political unity for Italy as it threatened a united and threatened a united Italy. Italians were unhappy about Austrian influence post 1861 as they still controlled Venetia and the French garrison in Rome. The whilst Italy had been united after 1861, a north and south divide politically and economically caused resentment within the Mezzogiorno and threatened its power to control Italy. For example, the Brigands war highlighted discontent across the Mezzogiorno as Southern Italy was neglected and the Piedmontese leaders failed to rectify the heavy disparity. The war led to more deaths than all Risorgimento revolutions combined, this highlighted the lack of socio-cultural and political unity and led to growing opposition to the kingdom of Italy. There were economic developments in the 1860s such as crisis and legal reforms, but the deep rooted issues led to unrest and continued resentment around the Mezzogiorno.</p> <p>Relations with the Church was a key issue post 1861 and Pius IX became increasingly hostile to the Italian government. His temporal power was threatened which led to the Syllabus of Errors in 1864 where he condemned criticism, modernisation and the building of an Italian state. The</p>
---	----	--

		led to poor relations with the Church and state
		which worsened religious unity within the
		peninsula. This was made worse by the
		1870 Doctrine of Papal Infallibility, when
		the Pope excommunicated Victor Emmanuel
		Emmanuel II and the entire Italian
		government. After the Piedmont took control
		of Rome due to Franco-Prussian war, the
		Pope's temporal power was de threatened
		and he was isolated to the Vatican.
		He refused a petition and further excommunicated
		Italians who took part in politics. This
		led to unrest and religious division within the
		people who resented the government's inability
		to maintain strong relations with the Church. However,
		the hostility hostile relations improved after
		1878 with Pope Leo XIII who had better
		relations with Crispi, thus religious unity was
		improved which was less problematic for Italy.
		The impact of ^{poor} relations with the Church was
		division in unrest which exacerbated other
		forms of resentment towards the government.
		Overall, the Mezzogiorno caused greater problems for
		Italy during 1801 to 1848 as political
		instability remained throughout the period and
		a north-south divide hampered economic
		development and a sense of unity. Problems
		with the Church caused religious division

		but merely increased levels of distrust
		between in the government. Furthermore, relations
		with the church were eventually improved
		thus this was a less significant
		move. Italy was not directly affected
		The impact of the Mezzogiorno threatened
		stability and unity within the nation.

Question 2 (b)*

(b)* 'The Kingdom of Italy in 1861 was not a united state.' How far do you agree?

[20]

In most cases this question was well answered, with responses considering a range of factors such as the North/South divide, Piedmontisation, church-state relations, economic and cultural development and the fact that in 1861 Rome and Venetia were not part of Kingdom of Italy. Better responses appreciated that, for all its shortcomings, Italy was mostly united in 1861, that Garibaldi's contribution was highly significant and that the process seemed irreversible.

Less effective responses tended to list instances of disunity and to write more generally about the period 1861-96 rather than focusing more closely on 1861.

The best responses were focused on the question, well organised and showed good understanding and explanation of the main factors, with well supported interim and concluding judgements. Exemplar 3, although maintaining relevance, is rather one-sided, not really challenging the statement in the question. Evidence is thin in places and some of the evidence used is from much later than 1861 and so it was marked in Level 4.

Exemplar 3

2	b	<p>The establishment of the Kingdom of Italy in 1861 was most definitely not a united state. The dreams of figures such as Mazzini and Garibaldi were did not come true until many years later.</p>
		<p>Piedmontisation is one of the biggest if not the biggest factor for the the disunity causing during this time period. It emphasises the idea not instead of creating new foundations for the the Kingdom of Italy, it would instead mimic aspects from Piedmont. This was incredibly harmful as it meant that laws relevant to the industrial, prosperous north weren't necessarily One such example of this is the establishment of a constitution based entirely off of the Statute given to Piedmont by Charles Albert years decades earlier. This was incredibly harmful as laws relevant to the industrial, prosperous north weren't necessarily effective in the south - a more poor agricultural and poverty stricken area than the north than the north, merely suggesting disunity.</p>
		<p>The Mezzogiorno felt uneasy in regard to the Kingdom of Italy making it less united. The feeling of uneasiness came from</p>

a possible lack of representation in government as every Prime Minister that the state had employed, had come from Piedmont, or other northern peninsulas. This was the case of Ubaldo Crispi who was one of the longest serving PMs ~~that had served~~ who instead came from Sicily. To add to his feeling of unrest there was also an increase in industrialisation in the north. Through railways started by revenue and factories to increase trade to Central and Western Europe. Due to this large quantity of industrial change there was a need for higher taxation, ~~on~~ ~~the~~ which was fine for the majority in the north however not ~~so~~ fine for the majority in the south, especially seeing as they wouldn't see the evidence of their tax.

Individuals such as Garibaldi and Pius IX were both fairly outspoken against the Kingdom of Italy suggesting that it wasn't a fully unified state. Garibaldi was mainly critical of the fact that parts of Italy were owned and controlled by other states. For example Nice and Savoy were French and many parts of the Central Duchies were still governed by the Hapsburgs ~~family~~ - Austria's royal family.

Garibaldi was not a fan of this and neither were his followers. Pope Pius IX, the longest ~~standing~~ serving pope in history, was also ~~not~~ against the kingdom of Italy. He claimed papal infallibility and said that anyone who supported his charge would go ~~strong~~ to hell. This created a wave of bad feelings towards the kingdom of Italy not just within its borders but across Europe as well. These bad feelings were detrimental as it meant many people were unsupportive of a unification cause meaning it was not ~~not~~ united.

In conclusion the kingdom of Italy established in 1861 was most certainly not a ~~united~~ united state ~~to a degree~~ with ~~the statement completely~~ ~~is~~ there is compelling evidence that shows us that many people in Italy were unsupportive of the supposed changes that were supposed to come from unification, ~~which therefore~~ suggests ~~that it~~ and that many of the changes ~~was~~ weren't ~~as~~ new anyway. ~~Fair to say~~ ~~that~~ I therefore agree with the statement that ~~it~~ it was not a united state.

Supporting you

Post-results services

If any of your students' results are not as expected, you may wish to consider one of our post-results services. For full information about the options available visit the [OCR website](#).

Keep up-to-date

We send a weekly roundup to tell you about important updates. You can also sign up for your subject specific updates. If you haven't already, [sign up here](#).

OCR Professional Development

Attend one of our popular CPD courses to hear directly from a senior assessor or drop in to a Q&A session. Most of our courses are delivered live via an online platform, so you can attend from any location.

Please find details for all our courses on the relevant subject page on our [website](#) or visit [OCR professional development](#).

Signed up for ExamBuilder?

ExamBuilder is the question builder platform for a range of our GCSE, A Level, Cambridge Nationals and Cambridge Technicals qualifications. [Find out more](#).

ExamBuilder is **free for all OCR centres** with an Interchange account and gives you unlimited users per centre. We need an [Interchange](#) username to validate the identity of your centre's first user account for ExamBuilder.

If you do not have an Interchange account please contact your centre administrator (usually the Exams Officer) to request a username, or nominate an existing Interchange user in your department.

Active Results

Review students' exam performance with our free online results analysis tool. It is available for all GCSEs, AS and A Levels and Cambridge Nationals.

It allows you to:

- review and run analysis reports on exam performance
- analyse results at question and/or topic level
- compare your centre with OCR national averages
- identify trends across the centre
- facilitate effective planning and delivery of courses
- identify areas of the curriculum where students excel or struggle
- help pinpoint strengths and weaknesses of students and teaching departments.

[Find out more](#).

Need to get in touch?

If you ever have any questions about OCR qualifications or services (including administration, logistics and teaching) please feel free to get in touch with our customer support centre.

Call us on
01223 553998

Alternatively, you can email us on
support@ocr.org.uk

For more information visit

 **ocr.org.uk/qualifications/resource-finder**

 **ocr.org.uk**

 **/ocrexams**

 **/ocrexams**

 **/company/ocr**

 **/ocrexams**

We really value your feedback

Click to send us an autogenerated email about this resource. Add comments if you want to. Let us know how we can improve this resource or what else you need. Your email address will not be used or shared for any marketing purposes.



I like this



I dislike this

Please note – web links are correct at date of publication but other websites may change over time. If you have any problems with a link you may want to navigate to that organisation's website for a direct search.



OCR is part of Cambridge University Press & Assessment, a department of the University of Cambridge.

For staff training purposes and as part of our quality assurance programme your call may be recorded or monitored. © OCR 2022 Oxford Cambridge and RSA Examinations is a Company Limited by Guarantee. Registered in England. Registered office The Triangle Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge, CB2 8EA. Registered company number 3484466. OCR is an exempt charity.

OCR operates academic and vocational qualifications regulated by Ofqual, Qualifications Wales and CCEA as listed in their qualifications registers including A Levels, GCSEs, Cambridge Technicals and Cambridge Nationals.

OCR provides resources to help you deliver our qualifications. These resources do not represent any particular teaching method we expect you to use. We update our resources regularly and aim to make sure content is accurate but please check the OCR website so that you have the most up to date version. OCR cannot be held responsible for any errors or omissions in these resources.

Though we make every effort to check our resources, there may be contradictions between published support and the specification, so it is important that you always use information in the latest specification. We indicate any specification changes within the document itself, change the version number and provide a summary of the changes. If you do notice a discrepancy between the specification and a resource, please [contact us](#).

You can copy and distribute this resource freely if you keep the OCR logo and this small print intact and you acknowledge OCR as the originator of the resource.

OCR acknowledges the use of the following content: N/A

Whether you already offer OCR qualifications, are new to OCR or are thinking about switching, you can request more information using our [Expression of Interest form](#).

Please [get in touch](#) if you want to discuss the accessibility of resources we offer to support you in delivering our qualifications.