

Project

Level 2 Higher Project

H855 – Exemplar Folder 4

Level 2 Project
Folder G Commentary
Guantanamo Bay

This investigation project has no PPR included in its submission. There are very few secondary sources used and little awareness of bias. A questionnaire has been devised with closed questions only; there is little explanation for this choice. Much of the work focuses on the public awareness and knowledge of Guantanamo Bay and does not relate to the question framed in the title. The question is answered in the conclusions with little evidence of how these were drawn.

AO1

This project arose from a personal interest and it may be that this has resulted in a lack of open-mindedness, particularly in the drawing of conclusions. There is no obvious rationale, nor any clear objectives other than the question title. The supervisor's comments suggest that this candidate may not have sought guidance at the appropriate stages.

AO2

Only two sources have been used, and the issue of bias/reliability has not been fully considered in the review of secondary sources.

AO3

There is a logical structure and the project achieves an outcome, but the supervisor's comments suggest that it was a difficult process for the candidate. The questionnaire uses only closed questions, and does not relate usefully to the question posed in the title. There is no explanation as to why this type of question was used exclusively, and although the analysis is fairly detailed, there is no linkage with the project title.

AO4

There is a conclusion and it answers the question posed at the start, although there is very little in the primary research that leads to this conclusion. It is almost as if the project is a vehicle for the candidate to express their views. The evaluation does reveal the candidate's deep interest in the topic, and it may be that his/her views have restricted how far s/he can conduct open-minded research.

This project was awarded 21 marks.



RECOGNISING ACHIEVEMENT

Level 2 Higher Project

Unit H855

Unit Recording Sheet

Please read the instructions on the reverse of this form. One of these cover sheets, suitably completed, should be attached to the assessed work of each candidate.

Unit Code	H855	Year	2009
Centre Name	[REDACTED]	Centre Number	[REDACTED]
Candidate Name	JOEY	Candidate Number	[REDACTED]

AO	Criteria			Teacher Comment	Mark
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Selection of the project or task, with limited individual input Planning of the project or task, with limited individual input Limited individual input during the process of the project Limited organisational skills used to complete the project Using one or two methods to work towards achieving agreed objectives Using few resources to work towards achieving agreed objectives 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Selection of the project or task, with some individual input Planning of the project or task, with some individual input Some individual input during the process of the project Some application of organisational skills to complete the project Using a range of methods to achieve agreed objectives Using a range of resources to achieve agreed objectives 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Individual selection of the project or task Individual planning of the project or task Individual input during the process of the project Application of organisational skills to complete the project Using a wide range of methods to achieve agreed objectives Using a wide range of resources to achieve agreed objectives 	<p>Overall Joe chose a project from interest - and he attempted to collect + manage the information himself.</p>	

<p>2</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Researching some information relevant to the topic • Selecting information from one or two sources • Some collation of information • Some application of the information obtained, when working towards achieving agreed objectives 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Researching a range of information relevant to the topic • Selecting information from a range of sources • Collating information from a range of sources • Applying the information obtained towards achieving agreed objectives 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Researching a wide range of information relevant to the topic • Selecting information from a wide range of sources • Collating information from a range of sources • Applying information in a relevant manner to achieve agreed objectives 	<p>Joe's overall work became overly reliant on narrative</p>
<p>3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Good knowledge exists of what had to be done to achieve the intended outcome • Appropriate tools and equipment (where relevant) were selected and used in a safe manner with guidance and supervision • Relevant skills and technologies were selected and used to achieve objectives; these may include PLTS and functional skills • When relevant, problem solving and working with others have been used 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Excellent knowledge exists of what had to be done to achieve the intended outcome • A range of appropriate tools and equipment (where relevant) were selected and used in a safe manner with some guidance and supervision • Relevant skills and technologies were efficiently selected and used to achieve objectives; these may include PLTS and functional skills. • When relevant, problem solving and working with others have been applied efficiently 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Excellent knowledge exists (some of which was acquired by the learner independently) of what had to be done to achieve the intended outcome • A well-selected range of appropriate tools and equipment (where relevant) was used in a safe manner with minimal guidance and supervision • A range of relevant skills and technologies, some of which were selected and used to achieve objectives; these may include PLTS and functional skills. • When relevant, problem solving and working with others have been applied efficiently and successfully 	<p>Joe's primary research was a more successful process for him and he engaged in worthwhile discussion of the material he generated</p> <p>Chair</p>

<p>4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some analysis of project outcomes Drawing some conclusions from the project outcomes Using appropriate methods to communicate project outcomes Presenting evidence in an appropriate format Knowledge and understanding of links with other areas of study and/or areas of interest Evaluation of the project, judging its relevance and value Evaluation of experiences and learning with examples of how this could improve future progress 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Analysis of project outcomes Drawing conclusions from the project outcomes Using appropriate methods to communicate project outcomes effectively Presenting evidence in an appropriate format Clear knowledge and understanding of links with other areas of study and/or areas of interest Competent evaluation of the project judging its relevance and value Competent evaluation of experiences and learning with examples of how this could improve future progress 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In-depth analysis of project outcomes Drawing a range of conclusions from the project outcomes Identifying and using appropriate methods to communicate project outcomes effectively Presenting evidence in an appropriate format Clear and detailed knowledge of links with other areas of study and/or areas of interest Understanding of links with other areas of study and/or areas of interest In-depth evaluation of the project; judging its relevance and value In-depth evaluation of experiences and learning with examples of how this could improve future progress 	<p>No PPR</p> <p><i>weak self awareness developed</i></p> <p><i>- no proper reflection</i></p> <p><i>- no PPR to aid planning + progress</i></p>	<p>Total/60</p>
--	--	---	--	-----------------

Guidance on Completion of this Form

- One sheet should be used for each candidate.
- Please ensure that the appropriate boxes at the top of the form are completed.
- Circle the mark awarded for each strand of the marking criteria in the appropriate box.
- Add the marks for the strands together to give a total out of 60. Enter this total in the relevant box.

own input
& choices

Good not any
further

A01	2	[REDACTED]
02	2	
03	1	
A04	1	

Qlen
25/4

No PPR

Joe found project management and reflection in the PPR format difficult to maintain.

He did not take advice to regularly maintain his records.

ARC PROJECT

“Why Was Guantanamo Bay Created?”

By: Joe [REDACTED]

Tutor: IKL

Candidate Number: [REDACTED]

Word Count: 3500

CONTENTS:

Page 1: Contents

Page 2: Rationale

Page 3: What Is Guantanamo Bay?

Page 4: Plan At Start Of The Project

Page 5: Project Checklist

Page 5-6: List of Secondary Sources

Page 7-8: Review of Secondary Sources

Page 8 : Primary Research Questionnaire

Page 9-12: Primary Research Evaluation

Page 12-13 : Conclusion

SHOULD GUANTANAMO BAY BE CLOSED?

What Is Guantanamo Bay?

Guantanamo bay is a bay located at the south-eastern end of Cuba; it is the largest bay on the south side of Cuba. The American government has assumed control over Guantanamo bay since 1903 as a result of the Cuba-American treaty which stated that the Republic of Cuba will perpetually lease America the territory of Guantanamo bay for naval stations. The current Cuban government believes America's ownership of the bay to be illegal but there is little they can do. In 2002, following the beginning of the War on Terror, a detainment camp was created on the bay to hold prisoners in the War on Terror. It consists of three camps known as camps Delta, Iguana and X-Ray.

Delta: Camp Delta is composed of detention camps 1, 2, 3 and 4. Each of these sections has different amenities and comforts based on how well each prisoner cooperates and what security risk they are deemed to be. When a prisoner arrives they are sent straight to maximum security camp 3. If the prisoner cooperates they are moved to camps 1 and 2 for their cooperation. When a prisoner is judged to have no security risk they are moved to camp 4 which is fairly luxurious. They are allowed to eat their meals together and stay in communal living quarters rather than solitary cells. Delta also includes the camp Echo which is used to detain prisoners in solitary confinement. The detainees are considered 'high value' to the U.S. Defence Department. The location of the camp allows prisoners to meet with lawyers, something other prisoners are denied. Prisoners are interrogated in camp Echo. It is under 24 hour guard by U.S. military police.

Iguana: Camp Iguana originally held three detainees who were under the age of 16. It was closed in 2004 when these three children were released. However it has been re-opened holding 38 prisoners that are deemed to be 'no longer enemy combatants'. This means the prisoners are not protected by the terms of the Geneva Convention.

X-Ray: This camp held up to 18 child prisoners from 2002 to 2006. As a result of great controversy, this camp was closed. However, since 2007, this camp has been re-opened to detain high-security prisoners.

()

()

THE ARC PROJECT CHECKLIST

Project title:	Why Was Guantanamo Bay Created?
Project aim:	I am trying to discover the legal grounds on which the American army detains the inmates; I am also looking to investigate the torture and inhumane methods that the U.S. authorities employ on the suspects.
Project Outcome:	I hope to have argued a valid case for Guantanamo Bay closing down and exposing the shocking human rights violation currently in practice.

The Project title, including its aim and outcome, must be reviewed until Yes can be ticked for the questions in the checklist below.

Verification of Title Checklist	Yes	No	Comments
1) Is the title a question, a task or a brief?	Yes		If the answer is No you must review the title to ensure that the title is one of these three options.
2) Is there an aim and outcome of the project?	Yes		If the answer is No you must ensure that the title is accompanied by a clear aim and outcome.
3) If this is a completely new area of study/activity for the learner, does it allow development appropriate to the level?	Yes		If the answer is No you must amend the title to ensure that it does.
4) If this is an extension of an area of experience/study or part of an existing course, does it allow the learner to extend their skills beyond those already developed?	Yes		If the answer is No you must amend the title to ensure that it does.

List of Secondary Sources

I have chosen two sources, secondary sources that will aid me in my project of research from Guantanamo Bay.

Wikipedia-

Set-up: Guantanamo Bay detention camp is located in Cuba, built in 2002. Its purpose is to hold enemy combatants in the War on Terror. Four camps- Delta, X-Ray (closed down), Iguana and Echo. Reportedly there is a high-security secret camp, Camp 7, the location of which is classified. The administration of President George W. Bush created the camp. On January 21, 2009 President Barack Obama signed an order which suspended the proceedings of GB for 120 days, with a view to closing it permanently. Only three men have been fully tried in Guantanamo Bay with 420 being released without charge. As of today there are 228 inmates being held in Gitmo.

Operation procedures: The prisoners of GB are held in four separate camps. These camps have different conditions, depending on the security status of its detainees. If detainees are not considered dangerous then they can live in communal living quarters in moderate comfort. If deemed high-risk they are held in isolation and subjected to interrogation.

Legality: The U.S. government has claimed that the al-Qaeda militants they hold in GB are not uniformed soldiers so do not qualify for protection under the Geneva Convention. This allows American forces to commit torture on the inmates e.g. waterboarding. In 2006, a legal ruling, *Hamdan V Rumsfeld*, stated that GB inmates shouldn't be granted POW status. This means they have virtually no legal or civil rights and can be subjected to any methods the Americans deem prudent. There have been many criticisms of the American running of GB, but the counterarguments have been the aforementioned POW status. It is also difficult to ascertain what is truly transpiring in Gitmo.

Treatment: There have been four recorded suicides in Gitmo and hundreds of suicide attempts. This can be traced to the evidence of appalling decisions in the camp. Released prisoners have alleged that they were tortured with means such as religious persecution, sexual degradation, physical abuse and psychological abuse. Former inmate Omar Deghayes has said he was blinded with pepper spray during interrogation.

ALTERNATIVES TO GUANTANAMO BAY:

GUARDIAN WEBSITE:

Bagram Theatre Internment facility- Bagram is an area in Afghanistan, in Parwan province, in which the American army has an air base. During the War On Terror, the Americans created a detention facility in this air base, one similar to Guantanamo Bay. Its purpose was to hold enemy prisoners in the War On Terror. This facility has lasted longer than Guantanamo and has accumulated more prisoners. Bagram is known by campaigners as, 'the other Guantanamo'. It has more prisoners and an even murkier legal status.

Originally, the Soviet Union built Bagram Air Base, when they invaded Afghanistan, but it fell into disrepair when they were ousted. When the Americans invaded Afghanistan, they commandeered this Air Base. They didn't need the airspace so built a detention facility in the space. B

According to accounts, the conditions in Bagram detention facility are far worse than at Guantanamo. Detainees are not allowed to speak to each other or even look at each other. Apparently prisoners have to share a bucket as a toilet and are not allowed access to running water. Akin to Guantanamo, the prisoners are not protected by the Geneva Convention, as they are 'unlawful enemy combatants', which means they can be subjected to torture. Bagram is very shady, with little factual evidence released by the U.S. forces. One detainee accused the 'dark prison' of creating future insurgents who would attack America. The detainees cannot see lawyers, have no trials and are never shown any evidence against them. Many have been there for years with no knowledge of their offences. Now the Americans plan to expand the facility to hold 1,110 prisoners-it currently holds 600.

A Human Rights Lawyer, Lal Gul, has stated "If they close Guantanamo and expand Bagram, it's the same-there will be no difference. If Barack Obama wants to close Guantanamo he should also set out to close Bagram and other detention centres."

There have been numerous abuses reported by the U.S. guards to the detainees in Bagram TIF.

REVIEW OF SECONDARY SOURCES

Name of source: Wikipedia

Author: Unknown

Publisher: Wikipedia.org

Date of Publication: 24th February 2003

Bullet points of key information:

- Guantanamo Bay created in 2002 to detain suspected combatants-part of the overall War on Terror.
- Differing states of prison depending on the security status of the inmates.
- America claims the inmates held are not POW's therefore don't fall under protection of Geneva Convention
- Heavy criticism aimed at the camp for its alleged torture and overall bad treatment of inmates
- Only 60 inmates ever fully convicted in the camp-over 600 suspected terrorists have passed through the camp in 6 years of its operational procedures.
- 66% of former Guantanamo Bay detainees have gone back to terror, according to White House State Department-proof that the camp has more harmful effects than positive effects
- On 21 January, President Barack Obama stated his intention to close the camp down permanently 'within the year'

Quotes (Including page reference and name of person quoted)

- "By 2008, there had been at least four suicides and hundreds of suicide attempts in Guantanamo that are public knowledge"- Harry Harris CIA, Page 5 of Wikipedia article
- "There are still innocent people there"- Chief of Staff Colin Powell Page 1.

Connect

- This source seems to collude with other sources I have viewed on the subject of Guantanamo Bay. Although there may be some dispersions cast on the reliability of Wikipedia, this source has been verified by the creators of the site.
- Generally, the site agrees with the majority of additional information I have seen about Guantanamo Bay. The article is unbiased and its facts appear to be correct

Extend

- Prior to reading this article, I had very little knowledge of the interior plan of the camp. This article has given me extended knowledge of the accommodation offered to the prisoners, and the awful state that some prisoners live in.
- In addition to this, I feel that this article has advanced my knowledge over the legal battle concerning Gitmo which gives the camp its complicated nature. The events of 9/11 have subsequently added much backing to the existence of Guantanamo Bay.

Challenge

- This article generally is in agreement with other articles I have read. As it is purely stating the facts, it has no viewpoint so cannot be queried. However, I have read articles written by American neo-conservatives who have strenuously argued for the existence of this camp.
- I have gained a much more detailed understanding of Guantanamo Bay and the entangled web of argument that surrounds it. It has also helped me to get a sense of American fears about terrorism-the reason they created this camp in the first place.

GUANTANAMO BAY ARC QUESTIONNAIRE

1. When was Guantanamo Bay created?
2. Do you know the purpose of Guantanamo Bay?
3. Are you aware of the legal justification of GB?
4. Do you feel that GB was a good idea?
5. Do you think GB was a rushed decision after 9/11? ()
6. Do you think GB has helped to cut down on terrorism
7. Does 9/11 give the U.S. the right to torture?
8. What colour were the jumpsuits? ()

PRIMARY RESEARCH EVALUATION

I received 9 answers to my questionnaire on 'Why was Guantanamo Bay Created?'

1. When was Guantanamo Bay created?

- By and large, the majority of people who answered my questionnaire were aware of the fact that GB was created soon after the terrorist attacks of 9/11 in 2001. However, all of them didn't know that the territory of Guantanamo has been under U.S. control since 1912, or the fact that it has served as a U.S. naval base since 1952. Most people seem to know that the camp is linked to the War On Terror.

2. Do you know the purpose of Guantanamo Bay?

- Every person who responded knew that the purpose of Guantanamo Bay was to detain potential terror suspects. This shows that the purpose of GB is obvious and has received enough attention in the media for people to realize its purpose. Perhaps the fact that Britain is closely linked with the U.S. played a part in the peoples knowledge of Guantanamo Bay's function

3. Are you aware of the legal justification of GB?

- Only one person was able to correctly answer this question. This shows an alarming truth that people don't know the reason suspects are being held indefinitely without trial or charge and are being tortured. This fact hasn't permeated the news, perhaps, due to the difficult legal entanglement that has arisen over GB. Also, the information on GB is extremely secretive and is difficult to ascertain.

4. Do you feel that GB was a good idea?

- With the exception of one, every person felt that Guantanamo Bay has been a distinctly bad idea. This is likely down to the surge of negative feeling that has recently arisen over GB. President Barack Obama has brought the camp to light and his

popularity has changed people's minds over the camp. The subject who felt it was a good idea has admitted she holds conservative views and feels that terrorism needs to be dealt with toughly.

5. Do you think GB was a rushed decision after 9/11?

- 7/9 answered yes to this question, with one stating no and the other stating they didn't have enough information to know. People generally felt it was a knee-jerk reaction from the U.S. government and more time should have been taken to sensibly judge the best methods to tackle terrorism. Perhaps the best answer I received here was, "9/11 was a very shocking event, so a rushed decision is understandable if not condonable".

6. Do you think GB has helped to cut down on terrorism?

- Only one person didn't answer yes to this question, 8 replied they didn't feel it had. They claimed that treating potential terrorists in this manner was foolish as it gives a propaganda victory to groups such as al-Qaeda. Also, rough treatment may radicalize young Muslims they said. The person who felt it had cut down on terrorism admitted she hadn't done the appropriate legwork to be fully sure of her answer.

7. Does 9/11 give the U.S. right to torture?

- This question was by the far the most difficult to answer and got the most ambivalent responses. 4 claimed that it didn't, 3 claimed they didn't know and 2 said that they think it does. Some thought that, whilst 9/11 was truly horrific, torturing terrorist suspects was counter-productive. To avoid future 9/11's more diplomatic methods were necessary, they argued. The people who answered yes felt that 9/11 was so indefensible that it was crucial that vital information be obtained by any means possible to prevent further terrorist attacks.

PROJECT CONCLUSION

My project, "Why was Guantanamo Bay created", has been incredibly interesting and has been tremendously fun to canvass. This project is a burning passion of mine as I have been interested in the activities of the camp since 2005. I have discovered much information on the camp and have also gained an insight into the tricky debate over it. It is important to consider the views of people who have been scarred by 9/11, but then it must be remembered that rates of terrorism are increasing by the minute.

Generally, I have discovered that Guantanamo Bay was a radical method employed by the Bush Administration. Understandably, they felt it was necessary they take any steps whatsoever to prevent further harm coming to their people. The murky legal status of the prisoners, 'enemy combatants', allows the U.S. to torture but they have strenuously denied they practice torture, despite the frequent claims made by former inmates.

Interestingly enough, during the middle of my project President Barack Obama signed an executive order that prohibited the actions of the camp for 120 days. He also stated that the camp would be closed permanently 'within the year'. "It is a sad chapter in U.S. history" he said grimly during his election campaign. Deflated at first, I realized I had to alter the title and perhaps direction of my project. Originally my title was "Should Guantanamo Bay be closed?" which became "Why was Guantanamo Bay created?" At first I was viewing my project as a crusade against GB but it had to become an evaluation, an overview of the most controversial prison in the world.

What have I gained from this project?

I feel I have gained vital skills from this Academic Research Course. I have learned how to view sources selectively and the connect, extend, challenge method has shown me a new way to analyze text.

What is my final thought?

The reason that Guantanamo Bay was created is blatantly obvious to me now- it was taken by a scared administration that has just experienced a terrible and alarming terrorist attack. They were desperate to stop terrorism at any costs and acted quickly and decisively.

Although the camp will go down as a failure, it is essential that we view the situation from the perspective of the people in charge. Despite the fact

they admitted that their methods were brutal, they felt they were definitely cutting down on terrorism, and that anything should be done to prevent further loss of innocent life. They argued that radical terrorists weren't interested in negotiation and that affirmative military action was the only way to quash terrorism once and for all.